In the Name of God

Falsafe va Kalam-e Eslami
(Philosophy and Kalam)

Semi-Annual Academic Journal

Faculty of Theology and Islamic Studies
University of Tehran
New Period, Vol. 49, No. 1, Spring and Summer 2016

Publisher: Faculty of Theology & Islamic Studies, University of Tehran
Managing Director: Majid Maarif
Editor-in-Chief: Abd al-Rasul Kashfi
English Editor: Abd al-Rasul Kashfi
Persian Editor: Mahdi Azimi

Editorial Board:

Gholam Reza Awani	Professor, Iranian Institute of hilosophy (Iran)
Ahmad Beheshti	Professor, University of Tehran (Iran)
Vincent Brummer	Professor, Utrecht University (Netherlands)
Qorban Elmi	Associate Professor, University o fTehran (Iran)
AmirAbbas Alizamani	Associate Professor, University of Tehran (Iran)
Ahad Faramarz Qaramaleki	Professor, University of Tehran (Iran)
Najafqoli Habibi	Associate Professor, University of Tehran (Iran)
Mohsen Jawadi	Associate Professor, Qom University (Iran)
Abd al-Rasul Kashfi	Associate Professor, University of Tehran (Iran)
Muhammad Legenhausen	Professor, Research Institute of Imam Khomaini (Iran)
Hossein Hooshangi	Associate Professor, Imam Sadiq University
Seyyed Yahya Yathrebi	Professor, Allameh Tabatabyi University (Iran)

● **Design and Typesetting:** A. Mazaheri
● **Layout:** Z. Mirazizi
● **Print:** Tehran University Press
● **Address**: Faculty of Theology & Islamic Studies, Motahhari St., Tehran, Iran
● **P.O.B:** 15766 – 4411
● **Website**: jitp.ut.ac.ir
● **Email:** jitp@ut.ac.ir
●**Phone:** 098-021-42762151
● **Fax:** 42762951

"Philosophy and Kalam" has been licensed as a scientific research semi-annual academic journal since October the 11th, 2010 by the Commission for Evaluation of Iranian Scientific Journals, The Ministry of Science, Research and Technology through the letter numbered 3/11/2795

"Philosophy and Kalam" has been indexed in international website of "Philosopher's Index" since June the 13th, 2012. All the articles of this journal and their abstracts can be accessed through this website. The website address is: http://philindex.org

Philosophy and Kalam can be accessed through the following domestic websites:
www.isc.gov.ir
www.SID.ir
www.noormags.com
www.magiran.com

Submission Guidelines:

1. **All essays submitted for publication should be based on scholarly research representing new ideas in the fields of philosophy and Kalam. Review articles on new topics in philosophy and Kalam and book reviews are also recommended. Book reviews must include title, publisher, city of publication, and year of publication of the book.**
2. **The essays should not already be published in another journal.**
3. **The Editorial Board reserves the right to accept or reject the assays, to make all editorial changes as deemed necessary, and to rearrange the articles in the order which it finds appropriate.**
4. **Submissions should not exceed 6000 words and must include title, introduction, literature review, essay body, conclusion, references, two abstracts (preferably less than 150 words each, in Farsi and English), and two lists of keywords (in Farsi and English).**
5. **The accepted file format is Microsoft Word 2010, with single line spacing and font size of 12. All submissions are made online at the journal website: http://jitp.ut.ac.ir.**
6. **The list of references at the end of article should appear in alphabetical order and follow the Modern Language Association (MLA) style as follows:**
    a. **To quote: give the author's surname, date of publication and page number in parenthesis, right after the quotation. In case the author you are quoting from has more than one publication in the year you are referring to, distinguish them by writing a, b, c, etc. after the date.**
    b. **In case of books: author's surname, first name, title in italics, translator's name, place of publication, publisher name, date of publication.**
    c. **In case of articles: author's surname, first name, title, journal name in italics, date of publication, issue no., vol. no., page no.**
    d. **In case of Internet sources: author's surname, first name, date of article, article title, journal title, vol.(issue), pages, date information retrieved, from URL.**

Abstracts

In

English

Contents

A Reflection on the Identity of the Mode of Delimitation and Mediator of Occurrence 1
Mohammad Hadi Tavakkoli

The Existence as Light Metaphor in Mulla Sadra's Philosophy 3
Vahid Khademzadeh

A Critical Analysis of Al-Isharat commentaries' views on Divine Unity 5
Sardar Dekami, Mohammad Saeedi Mehr

The Representation of Reality and Epistemic Value in Non-Certain Knowledge Based on AllamehTabataie's Theory of Conventionality 7
Mahdi Ashoori, Abd-al-Hosein Khosropanah

The Critical Analysis of Davies' Interpretation of Putnam's Externalist Argument against Skepticism 9
Hamid Alaeinejad, Seyyed Mohammad Ali Hodjati

A Critical Analysis of the Khajeh Nasir's Viewpoint on How Equivocal Types Refer to Their Tokens 11
Sayyed Ali Alamolhoda

A Reflection upon the Status of Reason from Salafis and Akhbaris' Viewpoints 13
Bahador Mehraki, Alimohammad Sajedi

The Typology of the Multiplicity of the Human Soul in Three Stages of before, during and after Belonging to the Body in Mulla Sadra's Perspective 15
Mohammad Hossein Vafaeian

A Reflection on the Identity of the Mode of Delimitation and Mediator of Occurrence

Mohammad Hadi Tavakkoli[1]

(Received: 8 August 2015- Accepted: 9 December 2015)

Abstract

In Mulla Sadra's and Mir Damad's works, modes- with the criterion of being part of subject or out of subject- are restricted in two meanings: mode of delimitation and mode of causation, mode of delimitation for the mode which is part of subject (both real part in real composite and imaginary part in imaginary composite) and mode of causation for the mode which is out of subject. Regardless of criterion of division that clears mode of delimitation meaning obviously, mode of delimitation usage in part of subject meaning in Mulla Sadra's and Mir Damad's works, shows this term has been distorted in later periods and supposed equivalent of "mediator of occurrence". Never and nowhere has been mentioned the usage of new meaning for mode of delimitation but it is pretended that the previous philosophers applied mode of delimitation in this new meaning. Even though it is said that a philosopher does not deal with terms, generally mediator of occurrence cannot be considered as a mode of the subject.

Keywords: Mode of Delimitation; Mode of Causation; Mediator of Occurrence.

1. Ph.D candidate of transcendental philosophy, Institute for Humanities and Cultural Studies. Email: iranianhadi@yahoo.com

The Existence as Light Metaphor in Mulla Sadra's Philosophy

Vahid Khademzadeh[1]

(Received: 15 August 2015- Accepted: 9 December 2015)

Abstract

Lakoff criticized Aristotelian view of metaphor and founded cognitive theory of metaphor. Assuming the acceptance of this theory, abstract concepts in Islamic philosophy are understood by conceptual metaphors. The conceptual metaphors are often unconsciously used by the philosophers.

The existence as one of important bases of Mulla Sadra's philosophy is conceptualized by several conceptual metaphors. "Existence Is Light" metaphor imports our conventional experiences of sensible light in format of systematic descriptions to Mulla Sadra's metaphysics and applies it to the conceptualization of the existence. The mentioned metaphor plays remarkable role in Sadrian metaphysics and epistemology. The gradation of the existence is understood by this metaphor; the existence, like light, can be intense or weak. According to this metaphor, the existence, like light, is self-manifesting and makes others apparent.

Keywords: Lakoff, Metaphor, Existence, Light, Mulla Sadra

1. Assistant Professor, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad.
Email:v.khademzadeh@ferdowsi.um.ac.ir

A Critical Analysis of Al-Isharat commentaries' views on Divine Unity

Sardar Dekami[1], Mohammad Saeedi Mehr[2]
(Received: 6 September 2015- Accepted: 9 December 2015)

Abstract

Ibn Sina, in his Al-Isharat, presents an argument for the Divine Unity based on His Uniqueness. This argument has been the subject of different interpretations of the Al-Isharat commentaries. The first interpretation is whether Ibn Sina presented one argument or two for Divine Uniqueness. The second is whether his argument against the uniqueness outside God's essence is one or two. There are also interpretations on what Ibn Sina meant by "… wa baqy al-aqsaam muhaal" ("…Other options are impossible"). In this paper we will investigate all the three interpretations and propose the correct one in each case.

Keywords: Divine Uniqueness, Divine Unity, Ibn Sina, Al-Isharat va al-Tanbihat

1. PhD Student of Tarbiat Modares University. Email: sdekami@yahoo.com
2. Associate Professor of Tarbiat Modares University.

The Representation of Reality and Epistemic Value in Non-Certain Knowledge Based on Allameh Tabataie's Theory of Conventionality

Mahdi Ashoori[1] , Abd-al-Hosein Khosropanah[2]
(Received: 5 Octpbr 2015- Accepted: 1 June 2016)

Abstract

In Islamic philosophy non-certain beliefs are not knowledge but Ignorance, and arguments for the validity of "confidence" in the Science of Usul al-Fiqh only prove its pragmatic value; The question is whether or not non-certain opinions have epistemic values? In this article, we reconstruct the theory of “conventional perceptions” and divide the "mental existence" to "inherent mental existence" and "conventional mental existence", and then we explain some conventional ideas can represent the facts. Conventional perception represents reality, if it relies on the inherent perception; otherwise, this convention is arbitrary. This link is the source of representation in conventional perceptions and the source of partial truth in non-certain knowledge; but we cannot determine directly this source, and in non-certain knowledge the criterion of evaluation does not rely on the criterion of representation.

Keywords: Representation of Reality, Epistemic Value, Non-Certain Knowledge, Conventional Perceptions

1. PhD Student of Philosophy of Science, Iranian Institute of Philosophy, Email: Ashoori@irip.ir
2. Professor, Institute of Islamic Culture and Thought (IICT), Email: khosropanahdezfuli@gmail.com

The Critical Analysis of Davies' Interpretation of Putnam's Externalist Argument against Skepticism

Hamid Alaeinejad[1], Seyyed Mohammad Ali Hodjati[2]
(Received: 31 October 2015- Accepted: 1 June 2016)

Abstract

Skepticism about the external world is a philosophical view that claims we can't know anything about the external world. Some kinds of philosophical skepticism use skeptical hypothesis to prove that we cannot know anything about the external world. This view has its roots in the fact that we don't know skeptical hypothesis is wrong. Putnam hold that accepting the semantical externalism refutes this kind of skepticism about the external world. Davies has an important interpretation of Putnam's argument against the external world skepticism. In this paper, we have logically analyzed and evaluated Davies' semantical externalism argument against skepticism concerning the external world. The conclusion is that Davies's argument refutes an important kind of skeptical hypothesis. By using the other kinds of skeptical hypothesis, however, the skeptics can't conclude that it is impossible to know anything about the external world.

Keywords: Skepticism about the External World, Semantical Externalism, Putnam, Davies, Skeptical Hypothesis

1. PhD Student, Department of Philosophy, Tarbiat Modares University.
Email: Hamid_alaeinejad@yahoo.com
2. Associate Professor, Department of Philosophy, Tarbiat Modares University.

A Critical Analysis of the Khajeh Nasir's Viewpoint on How Equivocal Types Refer to Their Tokens

Sayyed Ali Alamolhoda[1]

(received: 29 August 2015- Accepted: 9 December 2015)

Abstract

In this paper, through exploring the problem of equivocal types and its historical roots in Islamic Peripatetic school, we will explain the differences between Khajeh Nasir's approach to equivocal types and Avicenna's one; and show that such differences result from Sohrevardi's criticisms and his belief in the priority of essence.

On the one hand, Khajeh Nasir embraces Sohrevardi's criticism of Avicenna, and on the other, he never could accommodate modulation and gradation of essence in the framework of Peripatetic school. Thus, he considers the equivocal types as required common accidental of their tokens. In this paper, it has been shown that, firstly, Khajeh Nasir borrows this idea from the matter of the relation of genus and differentia and of accident and Aristotle's accidental categories. Secondly, to embrace such idea epistemologically results in inconformity between subject and object form Peripatetic point of view. Furthermore, from theological point of view, it paves the way to Ibn Kamooneh's doubt.

Keywords: Khajeh Nasir, Univocal Types, Peripatetic School, Avicenna

1. Associate Prof. of Islamic Philosophy and Theology, Payame Noor University.
Email: alamolhoda53@gmail.com.

A Reflection upon the Status of Reason from Salafis and Akhbaris' Viewpoints

Bahador Mehraki[1], Alimohammad Sajedi[2]
(Received: 25 December 2015- Accepted: 1 June 2016)

Abstract

The present paper studies the status of reason in the religious issues from the viewpoints of the Salafis and Akhbaris sects. The study indicates that the Salafis rely only on the appearances of the traditions (hadiths) of the Prophet and the life style (seerah) of predecessor scholars, and similarly the Akhbaris consider the appearances of the narrations of Imams the only authentic resources for religious reference. They deny the validity of reasoning and Ijtihad in their opinion.It can be said in criticism of their opinions: despite the plenty of advices from the exact religious texts on reasoning and its significance, rationality is completely ignored by them.

Keywords: Salafis, Akhbaris, Rationalism, Textualism, The Principles of Fighh and Ijtihad

1. Department of Islamic Education, Shiraz University of Medical Sciences, Email:DR.B.MEHRAKI@GMAIL.COM.
2 . Associate Professor of Shiraz University, Email: drsajedi@yaho.com

The Typology of the Multiplicity of the Human Soul in Three Stages of before, during and after Belonging to the Body in Mulla Sadra's Perspective

Mohammad Hossein Vafaeian[1]

(Received: 28 December 2015- Accepted: 1 June 2016)

Abstract

The soul in transcendent theosophy has both corporeal creation and spiritual permanence; hence, it has two aspects of "corporeality and belongingness to the body" and "inherent immateriality". The main purpose of this study is to recognize the multiplicity of the human soul in three stages of its coming-to-be

Human Souls were immaterial intellects before they came to be attached to the body. Hence, the multiplicity of human souls can be regarded as the multiplicity of the "species of the intellects." After the corporeal creation of humans, all of them became the "species of the natural" category in terms of the body, and they are also multiple. But after the acquisition of permanent spiritual states and on the basis of these states' alliance with the essence of the soul, every soul has a different essence from other essences in terms of their nature. Hence, every soul has a unique and "imaginal class". A small number of human souls that have reached perfection and became immaterial intellects based on their origin and target alliance will acquire the perfection of the "species of the intellects" category.

Keywords: Soul, Multiplicity of the Intellects, Substantial Motion, Temporality of the Soul.

1. PhD Candidate of Islamic Philosophy and Theology, University of Tehran, Faculty of Theology and Islamic Sciences. Email: mh_vafaiyan@ut.ac.ir