



Research Paper

The Ontological Foundations of Iranian Philosophy and its Political Requirements

Mohammadjafar Jamehbozorgi^{1*}, Majid Sarvand²

¹ Corresponding Author: Assistant Professor, Iranian Institute of Philosophy, Tehran, Iran. Email: jamebozorgi@irip.ac.ir

² PhD, Department of Political Science, Faculty of Law & Political Science, University of Tehran, Iran. Email: majidsarvand68@ut.ac.ir

Abstract

The purpose of this research is to outline the ontological foundations of Iranian philosophy from a specific point of view, in order to deduce its political requirements. In the process of explaining and throwing of light upon Iranian ontology, the foundations of epistemology, anthropology and metaphysics were inexorably discussed. In general, the spirit of spirituality and attention to worlds beyond the material and tangible world are so prominent in Iranian thought that it reveals itself in the examination of all the aforementioned areas. Therefore, believing in a hierarchical system of existential worlds and understanding the manifestation of existence and the relationship between the rank of each person in the existential dimensions and the level of his knowledge and awareness, offer a possibility of centrality of the person and the idea of returning to the paradisiacal place and recovery of the delayed eternity. Bearing in mind that anyone who has more knowledge and is placed in higher ranks of existence, has the competence and duty to guide other people who are in a lower rank, the role of an ideal King or Imam as well as other political dimensions of this thought are highlighted.

The key research question is as follows: What political requirements are illustrated in the foundations and specific characteristics of Iranian thought on existence, epistemology, metaphysics, and eschatology? In the research hypothesis, it is asserted that the type of spiritualism and attention to the realms beyond the material and tangible world, which are noticeable in Iranian thought have explicit political consequences. The authors use the qualitative thematic analysis method to examine some prominent works in

***How to Cite:** Jamehbozorgi, Mohammadjafar; and Majid Sarvand. (2023, Fall) "The Ontological Foundations of Iranian Philosophy and its Political Requirements," *Faslnāmeḥ-ye siyāsāt (Politics Quarterly)* 53, 3: 425-447, <DOI:10.22059/JPQ.2024.243899.1007162>.

Manuscript received: 16 October 2017; final revision received: 22 October 2023; accepted: 3 December 2023, published online: 16 December 2023



this field. Their discussions are basically focused on the main themes which together present the core of the ideas and explanations offered by scholars such as Henry Carbon and Alameh Tabatabai to explain the consequences, dimensions, and political foundations of Iranian spiritual philosophy. The conclusion of the study is that the stated principles in these works have presented a spiritual theme of guidance, leadership, and politics, which differ from worldly power and leadership.

Key Words: Corbin, Hierarchical Ontology, Ideal King (*Shah Armani*), Imam, Intuitive Epistemology

Declaration of conflicting interests

The authors declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

Funding

The authors received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

References

- Alem, Abdol Rahman. (2012) *Tārikh-e falsafeh-ye siyāsi-e gharb; asr-e jadid va sadeh-ye nozdahom (History of Western Political Philosophy; the New Era and 19th Century)*. Tehran: Publications of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 15th ed. [in Persian]
- Ashtiani, Jalaloddin. (1995) *Zartosht, Mazdisnā, hokomat (Zoroaster, Mazdayasna, and Government)*. Tehran: Sherkat-e sahāmi, 7th ed. [in Persian]
- Carbone, Henry. (2005) *Takhayol-e khalagh dar erfān-e Ibn 'Arābi (Creative Imagination in the Sufism of Ibn 'Arabi)*, trans. Enshaallah Rahmati. Tehran: Jami. [in Persian]
- Carbone, Henry. (2008) *Ibn Sinā va tamsil-e erfāni (Avicenna and the Visionary Recital)*, trans. Inshallah Rahmati. Tehran: Jāmi. [in Persian]
- Carbone, Henry. (2011) *Eslām dar sarzamin-e Īrān (Islam in the Land of Iran)*, trans. Reza Kohkan. Tehran: Hikmat and Philosophy Research Institute, V. 2. [In Persian]
- Carbone, Henry. (2012) *Eslam-e Īrān (Iranian Islam)*, trans. Enshaallah Rahmati. Tehran: Sophia, V. 1. [in Persian]
- Carbone, Henry. (2013) *Ravābet-e hekmat-e eshrāgh va falsafeh-ye Īrān bāstān, gozāresh-e ahmad fardid va abdol-hamid golshan (The Relationship between Wisdom and Ancient Iranian Philosophy, Reported by Ahmad Fardid and Abdolhamid Golshan)*. Tehran: Iranian Research Institute of Philosophy, 4th ed. [in Persian]
- Carbone, Henry. (2013a) *Ensān-e norāni dar tasavof-e Īrāni (The Man of Light in Iranian Sufism)*, trans. Faramarz Javaherinia. Tehran: Golban, 3rd ed.
- Carbone, Henry. (2013b) *Tārikh-e falsafeh-ye eslāmi (History of Islamic Philosophy)*, trans. Javad Tabatabai. Tehran: Minoy-e Kherad. [in Persian]

- Carbone, Henry. (2013c) *Falsafeh-ye Īrāni va falsafeh-ye tatbighi (Iranian Philosophy and Comparative Philosophy)*, trans. Javad Tabatabai. Tehran: Minoy-e Kherad. [in Persian]
- Carbone, Henry. (2015) *Zamān-e advāri dar mazdisnā va erfān-e esmāiliyeh (Cyclical Time and Ismaili Gnosis)*, trans. Inshallah Rahmati. Tehran: Sofia. [in Persian]
- Chittick, William. (2009) *Elm-e jahān, elm-e jān; rabt-e jahān'shenāsi-ye eslāmi dar donyā-ye jadid (Science of the Cosmos, Science of the Soul: The Pertinence of Islamic Cosmology in the Modern World)*, trans. Seyed Amir Hossein Asghari. Tehran: Ettela'at. [in Persian]
- Clark, Peter. (1998) *Zoroastrianism: An Introduction to an Ancient Faith*. Eastbourne, UK: Sussex Academic Press.
- Corrado, Mark. (1999) *Orientalism in Reverse: Henry Corbin, Iranian Philosophy, and the Critique of the West*. A Thesis for MA in History, Simon Fraser University, British Columbia, Canada. Available at: <https://core.ac.uk/reader/56373830> (Accessed 23 May 2022).
- Gignoux, Philippe. (2012) *Ensān va kayhān dar Īrān-e bāstān (Man and Cosmos in Ancient Iran)*, trans. Linda Godarzi. Tehran: Nash-e mahi. [in Persian]
- Mehrabani Fadai, Mehdi. (2009) *Paydāi-ye andisheh-ye siyāsi-ye erfāni dar Īrān; Az Aziz nasafi tā sadroddin shirazi (The Emergence of Mystical Political Thought in Iran; from Aziz Nasafi to Sadruddin Shirazi)*. Tehran: Nay (Online version of Fidibo). [in Persian]
- Moin, Mohammad. (1947) *Mazdisnā va tasir-e ān dar adabiyāt-e pārsi (Mazdayasna and its Influence in Persian Literature)*. Tehran: University of Tehran. [in Persian]
- Mojtabai, Fathollah. (1973) *Shah-re zibā-ye aflāton va shāhi Armāni dar Īrān bāstān (Plato's Beautiful City and the Ideal Kingdom in Ancient Iran)*. Tehran: Anjoman-e farhang-e Īrān bāstān. [In Persian]
- Motameni, Ahmad R. (2014) *Iranian Philosophy of Religion and the History of Political Thought*. Riverside, CA: University of California Riverside.
- Nasr, Seyyed Hossein; and Mehdi Amin Razavi. (2013) *An Anthology of Philosophy in Persia, Vol. 4: From the School of Illumination to Philosophical Mysticism*. London: I. B. Tauris, in Association with the Institute Of Ismaili Studies.
- Nasr, Seyyed Hossein; and Mehdi Amin Razavi. (2015) *An Anthology of Philosophy in Persia, Vol. 5: From the School of Shiraz to the Twentieth Century*. London: I. B. Tauris.
- Razi, Hashem. (2001) *Hehmat-e khosravāni; hehmat-e eshrāgh va erfān az zardosht tā sohrevardi (Hekmāt Khosravāni; the Wisdom of Enlightenment and Mysticism from Zoroaster to Sohrevardi)*. Tehran: Behjat, 2nd ed. [in Persian]
- Sabot, Akbar. (2006, March) "Nazariyeh-e tashkik dar vojood dar hehmat Īrān-e bāstān va falsafeh-ye eslāmi (Theory of Doubt in Existence in Ancient Iranian Wisdom and Islamic Philosophy)," *Ettela'at-e hehmat va marefat (Information of Wisdom and Knowledge)* 2: 31-43. Available at: <http://ensani.ir/fa/article/3728> (Accessed 23 August 2020). [in Persian]

- Safizadeh, Farooq. (2014) *Sayre tahavol-e erfān dar Īrān-e bāstān (Evolution of Mysticism in Ancient Iran)*. Tehran: Iran Jam. [in Persian]
- Shaygan, Dariush. (1992) *Afāgh-e tafakor-e Manavi dar eslām-e Īrāni (The Horizons of Spiritual Thought in Iranian Islam)*, trans. Baqer Parham. Tehran: Agah. [in Persian]
- Sohravardi, Sheikh Shahaboddin. (1993) *Hikmah al-Ishraq, Sharh-e Shahrzori (Illuminating Wisdom, Sharzori's Explanation)*, ed. Najafaqli Habibi. Tehran: Iranian Research Institute of Philosophy. [in Persian]
- Sohravardi, Sheikh Shahaboddin. (1996) *Majmoeh-ye masnafāt be koshesh-e henry karbon (Collection of Works, ed. Henry Carbone)*. Tehran: Humanities and Cultural Studies Research Institute. [in Persian]
- Tabatabaei, Mohammad Hossein; and Henry Carbone. (2006) *Shieh; mozākerāt va mokātebāt-e profosor henry carbone va alāmeḥ tabātābāi (Shia; Discussions and Correspondence between Professor Henry Carbon and Allameh Tabatabai)*. Tehran: Moasaseh-ye pajoheshi-ye Hekmat va falsafeh (Iranian Research Institute of Philosophy), 5th ed. [in Persian]
- Vasunia, Phiroze. (2007) *Zarathushtra and the Religion of Ancient Iran (The Greek and Latin Sources in Translation)*. Mumbai, India: the K.R. Cama Oriental Institute.



This article is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC-BY) license.



Research Paper

Reformist and Fundamentalist: A Small-Scale Comparative Study of Personality and Mental Health

Mehdi Reza Sarafraz^{1*}, Sepehr Pourkhalili²

¹ Corresponding Author: Assistant Professor, Department of Clinical Psychology, Faculty of Psychology and Educational Sciences, Shiraz University, Iran. Email: msarafraz@shirazu.ac.ir

² MA in Psychology, Department of General Psychology, Faculty of Human Science, Guilan University, Rasht, Iran. Email: sepehr_pour@webmail.guilan.ac.ir

Abstract

Increasing interest in the study of the relationship between personality and the choice of political ideology have emerged, and previous studies have found evidence of the impact of personality traits on political preferences of individuals. However, further research can be undertaken in this area in order to gain better understanding of the interactions of personal attributes and political orientations of individuals living in a society. The primary research question is as follows: What are the differences between individuals in the two main political movements of reformism (*eslāh'talabī*) and fundamentalism (*bonyād'garāī*) in Iran in terms of their personality and mental health? In the research hypothesis, it is postulated that variations in political ideologies of reformists and fundamentalists may be attributed to disparities in their personality traits. Islamic Iran Participation Front (IIPP) exemplifies the reformist groups, whereas the 'Principlists' (*osol'garāyān*) serves as a typical example of the fundamentalist political groups.

The population of the study included political journalists, party and political activists, government officials, and members of student political associations in Isfahan and Tehran in the summer of 2017. The use of snowball sampling method resulted in the selection of 65 respondents which included 33 reformists and 32 fundamentalists. Two questionnaires consisting of 60 items (answered on a five-point Likert scale) were used to

***How to Cite:** Sarafraz, Mehdi Reza; and Sepehr Pourkhalili. (2023, Fall) "Reformist and Fundamentalist: A Small-Scale Comparative Study of Personality and Mental Health," *Faslnameh-ye siyāsat (Politics Quarterly)* 53, 3: 449-472, <DOI: 10.22059/JPQ.2020.303181.1007596>.

Manuscript received: 20 May 2020; final revision received: 20 November 2023; accepted: 3 December 2023, published online: 16 December 2023



collect information from these respondents. The first questionnaire was designed for the ‘Neuroticism, Extraversion and Openness’ (NEO) Personality Inventory Test; and the second one was for the ‘Depression, Anxiety, and Stress Scale 21’ (DASS-21). Descriptive and inferential statistics were computed, with multivariate analysis of variance (MANOVA) utilized for data analysis.

The results revealed significant differences between the reformists and fundamentalists on specific personality traits, notably in the subcategories of extroversion, openness to experience, and agreeableness. Moreover, the comparison of mental health indicators showed that these two groups have significant differences in the depression and stress subscales. The reformists scored higher in the variables of openness to experience, depression, and stress, whereas the fundamentalists scored higher in the extroversion and agreeableness scales. These findings are consistent with the results of similar studies. Furthermore, this study concludes that given the role of religion in Iran's politics, it is useful to examine the relationship between religion and the personality traits of political activists and ordinary citizens in future studies.

Keywords: The Big Five Personality Traits, Mental Health, Political Ideology, Political Psychology

Declaration of conflicting interests

The authors declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

Funding

The authors received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

References

- Adorno, Theodor W., et al. (1950) *The Authoritarian Personality*. New York: Harper and Row.
- Alford, John R., et al. (2005) “Are Political Orientations Genetically Transmitted?” *American Political Science Review* 99, 2: 153-167, <DOI:10.1017/S0003055405051579>.
- Antony, Martin M., et al. (1998) “Psychometric Properties of the 42-Item and 21-Item Versions of the Depression Anxiety Stress Scales in Clinical Groups and a Community Sample,” *Psychological Assessment* 10, 2: 176-181, <DOI:10.1037/1040-3590.10.2.176>.
- Ashori, Dariush. (2010) *Dānesh 'nāmeḥ-ye siyāsī (Political Encyclopedia)*. Tehran: Morvarid. [in Persian]
- Bell, Daniel. (1962) *The End of Ideology: On the Exhaustion of Political Ideas in the Fifties*. New York: Free Press, rev. ed. Available at: <https://search.library.wisc.edu/catalog/999539544502121> (Accessed 14 May 2023).

- Bernardi, Luca; et al. (2024, February) "A Cognitive Model of Depression and Political Attitudes," *Electoral Studies* 87: 102737, <DOI:10.1016/j.electstud.2023.102737>.
- Bouchard, Thomas J. Jr. (1997) "The Genetics of Personality," *Handbook of Psychiatric Genetics*. Boca Raton, FL: CRC Press.
- Bowling, Nathan A., et al. (2005) "Giving and Receiving Social Support at Work: The Roles of Personality and Reciprocity," *Journal of Vocational Behavior* 67, 3: 476-489, <DOI: 10.1016/j.jvb.2004. 08. 004>.
- Caparos, Serge, et al. (2015, January) "The Tree to the Left, the Forest to the Right: Political Attitude and Perceptual Bias," *Cognition* 134: 155-164, <DOI:10.1016/j.cognition.2014.10.006>.
- Carlo, Gustavo, et al. (2005) "The Interplay of Traits and Motives on Volunteering: Agreeableness, Extraversion and Prosocial Value Motivation," *Personality and Individual Differences* 38, 6: 1293-1305, <DOI:10.1016/j.paid.2004.08.012>.
- Chan, Eugene Y. (2019) "Political Orientation and Physical Health: The Role of Personal Responsibility," *Personality and Individual Differences* 141: 117-122, <DOI: 10.1016/j.paid.2019.01.005>.
- Cockerham, William C. et al. (2006) "Health Lifestyles and Political Ideology in Belarus, Russia, and Ukraine," *Social Science & Medicine* 62, 7: 1799-1809, <DOI:10.1016/j.socscimed.2005.08.024>.
- Costa, Paul T; and Robert R. McCrae. (1991) "Facet Scales for Agreeableness and Conscientiousness: A Revision of the NEO Personality Inventory," *Personality and Individual Differences* 12, 9: 887-898, <DOI:10.1016/0191-8869(91)90177-D>.
- Costa, Paul T.; and Robert R. McCrae. (1985) *Manual for the NEO Personality Inventory Manual*. Odessa, FL: Psychological Assessment Resources, 323-339.
- Dawes, Christopher T.; and Aaron C Weinschenk. (2020) "On the Genetic Basis of Political Orientation," *Current Opinion in Behavioral Sciences* 34: 173–178, <DOI:10.1016/j.cobeha.2020.03.012>.
- Delavar, Ali. (2019) *Ravesh-e tahghigh dar rāvān'shenāsi va oloom-e tarbiyati (Research Methods in Psychology and Education)*. Tehran: Virayesh. [in Persian]
- Fatke, Matthias. (2017) "Personality Traits and Political Ideology: A First Global Assessment," *Political Psychology* 38, 5: 881-899. Available at: <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/pops.12347> (Accessed 2 June 2023).
- Gerber, Alan S., et al. (2010) "Personality and Political Attitudes: Relationships across Issue Domains and Political Contexts," *American Political Science Review* 104, 1: 111–133, <DOI:10.1017/S0003055410000031>.
- Gerber, Alan S., et al. (2011) "The Big Five Personality Traits in the Political Arena," *Annual Review of Political Science* 14, 1: 265-287, <DOI:10.1146/annurev-polisci-051010-111659>.
- Ghafari Hashjin, Zahid; and Jabar Shujai. (2016) "Moghāyeseh-ye rāhbord-e mozākereh bā jariyān'hā va keshvar'hā-ye gheir-e hamsō az negāh-e du

- jariān-e osol'garā va eslāh'talab (A Comparison of "Negotiation Strategy" with the Non-aligned Movements and Countries from the Viewpoint of Two Fundamentalist and Reformist Camps)," *Jostār'hā-ye siyāsi-ye mo'āser (Contemporary Political Studies)* 24: 21-48. Available at: <https://www.sid.ir/fa/journal/ViewPaper.aspx?ID=348748> (Accessed 7 September 2022). [in Persian]
- "Jariān-e eslāh'talabān hāmi-ye dolat-e Rohāni ast (The Reformist Camp Supports Rouhani Government)," (2017, April 11) *Iran Students News Agency (ISNA)*. Available at: <https://www.isna.ir/news/96012208543> (Accessed 8 September 2022). [in Persian]
- "Jebhe-ye pāydārī-e enqelāb-e eslāmī ham seyed ebrahim raeisi rā be onvān-e nāmzad-e aslah moarefi kard (The Front of Islamic Revolution Stability also Introduced Seyed Ebrahim Raisi as the Most Advisable Candidate)," (2017, May 3) *Raja News Agency*. Available at: <http://rajanews.com/node/270300> (Accessed 4 September 2022). [in Persian]
- Jæger, Mads Meier. (2006) "What Makes People Support Public Responsibility for Welfare Provision: Self-Interest or Political Ideology? A Longitudinal Approach," *Acta Sociologica* 49, 3: 321-338, <DOI:10.1177/0001699306067718>.
- Jost, John T. (2006) "The End of the End of Ideology," *The American Psychologist* 61, 7: 651-670, <DOI:10.1037/0003-066X.61.7.651>.
- Jost, John T, et al. (2009) "Political Ideology: Its Structure, Functions, and Elective Affinities," *Annual Review of Psychology* 60, 1: 307-337, <DOI:10.1146/annurev.psych.60.110707.163600>.
- Kakajani, Abbas. (2013) *Jariān'shenāsi-ye osol'garāi dar jomhurī-'i eslāmī-'i Irān (The Flow of Fundamentalism in the Islamic Republic of Iran)*. Tehran: Islamic Revolution Documentation Center. [in Persian]
- Kanai, Ryota, et al. (2011) "Political Orientations Are Correlated with Brain Structure in Young Adults," *Current Biology* 21, 8: 677-680, <DOI:10.1016/j.cub.2011.03.017>.
- Kandler, Christian, et al. (2012) "Left or Right? Sources of Political Orientation: The Roles of Genetic Factors, Cultural Transmission, Assortative Mating, and Personality," *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 102, 3: 633-645, <DOI:10.1037/a0025560>. Available at: <https://psycnet.apa.org/record/2011-22899-001> (Accessed 2 June 2023).
- Kannan, Viji Diane; and Peter J. Veazie. (2018) "Political Orientation, Political Environment, and Health Behaviors in the United States," *Preventive Medicine* 114: 95-101, <DOI:10.1016/j.ypmed.2018.06.011>.
- Kivikangas, Matias J., et al. (2021) "Moral Foundations and Political Orientation: Systematic Review and Meta-analysis," *Psychological Bulletin* 147, 1: 55-94, <DOI:10.1037/bul0000308>.
- Kondrichin, Sergei V.; and David Lester. (1998) "Voting Conservative and Mortality," *Perceptual and Motor Skills* 87, 2: 466-466, <DOI:10.2466/pms.1998.87.2.466>.
- Leary, Mark R., and Rick H. Hoyle, eds. (2009) *Handbook of Individual Differences in Social Behavior*. New York: Guilford Press.

- Mayers, Andrew. (2013) *Introduction to Statistics and SPSS in Psychology*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson Higher Education.
- McCrae, Robert R. (1996) "Social Consequences of Experiential Openness," *Psychological Bulletin* 120, 3: 323-337, <DOI:10.1037/0033-2909.120.3.323>.
- McCrae, Robert R.; and Paul T. Costa, Jr. (1997) "Personality Trait Structure as a Human Universal," *American Psychologist* 52, 5: 509-516. Available at: <https://psycnet.apa.org/record/1997-04451-001> (Accessed 2 June 2023).
- Mir Taghi Grossi Farshi, Mahmoud; and Amir Houshang Qazi Tabatabai. (2001) "Kārbord-e āzmon-e jadid-e shakhsiyati-ye neo va baresi-ye tahlili-ye vizhegi va sākhtār-e āmeli-ye ān dar bein-e dānesh'joyān-e dāneshgāh'hā-ye Irān (Using the New NEO Personality Test and Analyzing its Characteristics and Structure among Iranian University Students)," *Oloom-e ensāni, dāneshgāh-e al-zahra (Human Sciences, Al-Zahra University)* 39: 173-198. Available at: <http://ensani.ir/fa/article/264514> (Accessed 7 September 2022). [in Persian]
- Nam, Hannah H., et al. (2021) "Toward a Neuropsychology of Political Orientation: Exploring Ideology in Patients with Frontal and Midbrain Lesions," *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* 376, 1822: 20200137, <DOI:10.1098/rstb.2020.0137>.
- Sahibi, Ali, et al. (2005) "Etebār'yābi-ye meghyās-e afsordegi ezterāb'tanidegi (DASS-21) barāye jamiyat-e Irān (Validation of Depression Anxiety and Stress Scale (DASS-21) for Iranian Population)," *Rāvān'shenāsi-ye tahavoli: rāvān'shenāsān-e Irāni (Developmental Psychology: Iranian Psychologists)* 4: 36-54. Available at: http://jip.azad.ac.ir/article_512443.html (Accessed 4 September 2022). [in Persian]
- Samani, Siamak; and Bahram Jokar. (1997) "Baresi-ye etebār va ravāi-ye form-e kotāh-e meghyās-e ezterāb va feshār-e rāvāni (An Analysis of the Validity and Reliability of the Short Form of Depression, Anxiety and Mental Stress Scale)," *Oloom-e ejtemā'i va ensāni (Social Science and Humanities, the Shiraz University)* 52: 65-77. Available at: <https://www.noormags.ir/view/fa/articlepage/861620> (Accessed 4 September 2022). [in Persian]
- Schultz, Devon; and Sydney Ellen Schultz. (2008) *Theories of Personality*, trans. Yahya Seyed-Mohammadi. Tehran: Virayesh. [in Persian]
- "Seyed mustafa hashemi tabā elām kard dar entekhābāt-e riyāsāt-e jomhori be hasan rohāni rā'i mi'dahad (Seyed Mustafa Hashemi Taba Announced that He will Vote for Hassan Rouhani in the Presidential Election)," (2017, May 13) *Bāshgāh-e khabar'negārān-e javān (Young Journalists Club)*. Available at: <https://www.yjc.news/00PXFb> (Accessed 4 September 2022). [in Persian]
- "Seyed mustafa mirsalim faghat be misāgh'nāmeḥ-ye hezb-e mutalfā eslāmi motahed ast (Seyed Mustafa Mirsalim is only Committed to the Charter of the Islamic Coalition Party)," (2017, April 7) *Iran Students News Agency (ISNA)*. Available at: <https://www.isna.ir/news/96011805987> (Accessed 20 August 2022). [in Persian]

- Shariatnia, Kazem; and Massoud Motalebi. (2011) "Rāvān'shenāsi-ye siyāsī va vorood b arseh-ye nazariyeh'pardāzi dar elm-e siyāsāt (Political Psychology and Entering the Field of Theorizing in Political Science)," *Faslnāmeḥ-ye motāleāt-e siyāsī (Political Studies Quarterly)* 4, 93-125. Available at: <https://www.sid.ir/fa/journal/ViewPaper.aspx?ID=224873> (Accessed 20 August 2022). [in Persian]
- Shaw, Mary, et al. (2002) "Mortality and Political Climate: How Suicide Rates Have Risen during Periods of Conservative Government, 1901-2000," *Journal of Epidemiology and Community Health* 56, 10: 723LP-725, <DOI:10.1136/jech.56.10.723>.
- Sibley, Chris, et al. (2012) "Personality and Political Orientation: Meta-Analysis and Test of a Threat-Constraint Model," *Journal of Research in Personality* 46, 6: 664-677. Available at: <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0092656612001158> (Accessed 2 June 2023).
- Zarifinia, Hamidreza; and Sayyed Mostafa Tajzadeh. (1999) *Kālbod'shekāfi-ye jenāh'hā-ye siyāsī-ye Īrān, 1358-1378 (Autopsy of Iran's Political Factions, 1979 to 1999)*. Tehran: Azadi Andisheh. [in Persian]



This article is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC-BY) license.



Research Paper

The Impact of Maurice Duverger's Translated Works on Iran's Constitutional Theory

Seyed Naser Soltani ^{1*}

Assistant Professor of Public Law, Faculty of Law, College of Farabi, University of Tehran, Qum, Iran. Email: naser.soltani@ut.ac.ir

Abstract

Maurice Duverger was a French political scientist and professor of constitutional law in the 1950s-1970s, and greatly influenced the intellectual climate of constitutional law and political science. His fame spread abroad throughout Europe, North America and Asia, and his books and articles became known to thinkers and students in a score of countries as diverse as Iran, the U.S., and Spain. Duverger stood between these two academic disciplines and tried to establish a link between them. Abolfazl Qazi, a constitutional law professor at the University of Tehran undertook the task of translating some of Duverger's books into Persian, e.g., *Institutions politiques et Droit constitutionnel* (Constitutional Rights and Political Institutions), and *Sociologie politique* (Political Sociology). He also wrote a book which was clearly and significantly influenced by the French scholar's writings on the subject of constitutional law. Nowadays, research conducted on the history of French constitutional thought have been analyzing the negative impact of Duverger's school of thought. The important narrative that he presented about political institutions, for example, his discussions of 'semi-authoritarian system' and 'semi-parliamentarism' has been gradually forgotten. At the end of the 1970s, a slow but significant change in political science was taking place as the result of the systematic and comprehensive use of methods and theories of sociology and history by political scientists, and the growing value of collaborative research, empirical analyses and multidisciplinary scholarly efforts to discuss and analyze issues. This change turned Maurice Duverger into a historical figure who belonged to an obsolete

***How to Cite:** Soltani, Seyed Naser. (2023, Fall) "The Impact of Maurice Duverger's Translated Works on Iran's Constitutional Theory," *Faslnāmeḥ-ye siyāsāt (Politics Quarterly)* 53, 3: 473-498, <DOI:10.22059/JPQ.2024.318016.1007733>.

Manuscript received: 27 January 2021; final revision received: 30 November 2023; accepted: 3 December 2023, published online: 16 December 2023



© 2023 by the University of Tehran. Published by the University of Tehran Press

and pre-scientific period. This "new" political science was not exclusively interested in the same issues that were of concern for Duverger such as voting behavior and political parties. Instead, the attention somehow turned to exploring how politics can draw inspiration from other disciplines and encourage collaboration, elaboration, and evaluation.

The results of the recent studies which have critically examined Duverger's writings might also apply to the discussions of Iranian Constitutional theory. The main objective of this article is to find suitable answers to the following research questions: a) How have Duverger's works influenced Iran's theory of constitutional rights? and b) What consequences have these works had on research concerning constitutional rights in Iran? Using the qualitative content analysis method, the most significant works of Duverger and Abolfazl Ghazi are examined in order to answer these questions. In the research hypothesis, the author claims that Ghazi's translations of Duverger's books have had a negative impact on the studies of constitutional law in Iran. The main findings indicate that the studies of constitutional rights in Iran are still under the influence of Abolfazl Ghazi's work which had been in part influenced by Maurice Duverger's thought. These studies have been diverted from the right course and have not found its way. Thus, Iranian scholars and leading experts must pay closer attention to the link between constitutional rights and political science as two imperative fields of knowledge.

Keywords: Abolfazl Qazi, Constitutional Law, Maurice Duverger, Political Science, Political Sociology

Declaration of conflicting interests

The author declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

Funding

The author received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

References

- Ackerman, Bruce. (2020) *Tafkik-e ghovā-ye jadid (New Separation of Powers)*, trans. Hassan Vakilian. Tehran: Negah-e mo'āser. [in Persian]
- Arnaud, André- Jean. (1975) *Les Juristes Face à la Société du XIXe Siècle à nos Jours*. Paris: Presses universitaires de France (PUF). [in French]
- Aron, Raymond. (1983) *Mémoires*. Paris: Julliard. [in French]
- Avril, Pierre. (1989, avril) "Une Revanche du Droit Constitutionne," *Pouvoirs* 30, 49: 5-13. à: <https://revue-pouvoirs.fr/Une-revanche-du-droit.html> [in French]
- Burdea, Georges. (1956) "Une Survivance: la Notion de Constitution," à Achille Mestre, ed. *L'évolution du Droit Public. Études Offertes*. Paris: Sirey. [in French]
- Burdeau, Georges. (1959) *Méthode de la Science Politique*. Paris: Dalloz. [in French]

- Burdeau, Georges. (1980) *Droit constitutionnel et institutions politiques*. Paris: Les cours de droit. [in French]
- Chevallier, Jean-Jacques. (1965) "Destin de la science politique," *Revue de l'enseignement supérieur* 4, p. 8. [in French]
- Cox, Gary W. (1997) *Making Votes Count. Strategic Coordination in the World's Electoral Systems*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Dorandeu, Renaud. (1990, September) "Maurice Duverger: un Professeur dans *Le Monde*," Congrès de l'AFC, Strasbourg. [in French]
- Duverger, Maurice. (1970, April) "Du chehreh-ye jānos: mafhom-e siyāsāt (The Two Faces of Janus: The Concept of Politics)," trans. Abulfazl Ghazi. *Negin Magazine* 59: 8-7. Available at: <https://www.noormags.ir/view/fa/articlepage/642027> (Accessed November 27, 1402). [in Persian]
- Duverger, Maurice. (1973) *Osool-e elm-e siyāsāt (Principles of Political Science)*, trans. Abulfazl Ghazi. Tehran: Pocket Books Co. [in Persian]
- Duverger, Maurice. (1948) *Manuel de Droit Constitutionnel et de Science Politique*. Paris: PUF, 5th ed. [in French]
- Duverger, Maurice. (1959a) "L'analyse Stratégiste Comme Méthode de Recherche en Science Politique," Colloque *Science Politique et Sociologie*, Grenoble, 11-12 juin. [in French]
- Duverger, Maurice. (1959b) *La Cinquième République*. Paris: PUF. [in French]
- Duverger, Maurice. (1959c) *Méthodes de la Science Politique*. Paris: PUF. [in French]
- Duverger, Maurice. (1965) "De la Science Politique Considérée Comme Mystification," *Revue de l'Enseignement Supérieur* 4: 13-22. [in French]
- Duverger, Maurice. (1969, March) "Ravan'kavi va siyāsāt (Psychoanalysis and Politics)," trans. Abulfazl Ghazi. *Negin Magazine* 58: 2, 42 and 85. Available at: <https://www.noormags.ir/view/fa/articlepage/641999> (Accessed 18 November 1402). [in Persian]
- Duverger, Maurice. (1975) *Regim'hā-ye siyāsī (Political Regimes)*, trans. Nasser Sadr al-Hafazi. Tehran: Iran Books Printing and Publications. [in Persian]
- Duverger, Maurice. (1982) "Les vaches sacrées," in Léo Hamon, ed. *Itinéraires. Études en l'honneur*. Paris: Economica. [in French]
- Duverger, Maurice. (1986) *Les Régimes Semi-présidentiels (Semi-Presidential Regimes)*. Paris: PUF. [in French]
- Duverger, Maurice. (1986) *Les Régimes Semi-présidentiels*. Paris: PUF. [in French]
- Duverger, Maurice. (1987) *Échec au Roi*. Paris: Albin Michel. [in French]
- Duverger, Maurice. (1993) *Jāme'eh'shenāsi siāsī (Political Sociology)*, trans. Abulfazl Qazi Shariatpanahi. Tehran: University of Tehran, 2nd ed. [in Persian]
- Favoreu, Louis. (1984) "Propos d'un Néo-Constitutionnaliste," in Jean-Louis Seurin, ed. *Le constitutionnalisme aujourd'hui*. Paris: Economica. [in French]
- Favoreu, Louis. (1988) *La politique saisie par le droit*. Paris: Economica. [in French]

- François, Bastien. (1993a) "Du Juridictionnel au Juridique," in Jean-Jacques Chevallier, ed. *Droit et Politique*. Paris: PUF. [in French]
- François, Bastien. (1993b) "La constitution du droit? La doctrine constitutionnelle à la recherche d'une légitimité juridique et d'un horizon pratique," in Yves Poirmeur and Alain Bernard. *La Doctrine juridique*. Paris: PUF, 210-229. [in French]
- François, Bastien. (2010) "Maurice Duverger, La Gloire Avant L'oubli (en France)," *Revue Internationale de Politique* 17, 1: 23-38, <DOI:10.3917/ripc.171.0023>. Available at: <https://www.cairn.info/revue-internationale-de-politique-comparee-2010-1-page-23.htm> (Accessed 2 October 2018). [in French]
- Gatti-Montain, Jacqueline. (1986) "Le Droit et Son Enseignement: Un Demi-siècle de Réflexions," *Droits* 4 : 109-122. [in French]
- Gurvitch, Georges. (1960) *Traité de Sociologie*, dir. *Revue Française de Sociologie*, Paris: PUF, 2 Vol. [in French]
- Lavau, Georges. (1965, Octobre-Novembre-Décembre) "La science politique et les cadres universitaires," *Revue de l'enseignement supérieur* 4: 143-154. [in French]
- Lavau, Georges. (1969) AFSP, Entretiens du samedi, n°10, "L'état de la science politique en France," Mars. [in French]
- Lochak, Danièle. (1989) "La Doctrine sous Vichy ou les Mémoires de la Positivisme," in Danièle Lochak, ed. *Les Usages Sociaux du Droit*. Paris: CURAPP-Presses universitaires de France, 252-285. [in French]
- de Merny, Gustave. (2019) *Dars'hā-ye hoghogh-e edāri dar madresseh-ye siyāsi (Administrative Law Lessons in the Political School)*, trans. Mirza Abdollah Khan, ed. Seyed Naser Soltani. Tehran: Negah-e mo'āser. [in Persian]
- Parodi, Jean-Luc. (1972) *Les Rapports Entre Le Législatif et L'exécutif Sous la Ve République 1958-1962*. Paris: Armand Colin. [in French]
- Qazi Shariatpanahi, Abolfazl. (1989) *Hoghogh-e assāsi va nahād'hā-ye siāsi (Constitutional Rights and Political Institutions, Vol. I: Generalities and Foundations)*. Tehran: University of Tehran. [in Persian]
- Qazi Shariatpanahi, Abolfazl. (1992) "(Constitutional Law; The Course of Concept and Discourse from a Comparative Perspective," *Majaleh'i Dāneshkadeh'i Hoghogh va Ulom-e siyāsī (Journal of the Faculty of Law and Political Science)* 28: 30-78. Available at: https://journals.ut.ac.ir/article_15114.html (Accessed 18 November 1402). [in Persian]
- Qazi Shariatpanahi, Abolfazl. (1994) *Bāyasteh'hā-ye hoghogh-e omomi (Constitutional Rights Requirements)*. Tehran: Yaldā. [in Persian]
- Qazi Shariatpanahi, Abolfazl. (1996) *Goftār'hā-i dar hoghogh-e omomi (Speeches in Public Law)*. Tehran: Dādgar, V. 1. [in Persian]
- Soltani, Naser. (2011, September) "Darāmadi tārikhi bar masa'leh-ye ejrāye ghānoon-e asāsi (A Historical Introduction on the Implementation of the Constitution)," *Nashri-ye hoghogh-e asāsi (Journal of Constitutional Rights)* 7, 13: 35-56. Available at: https://www.asasimag.ir/article_105029.html?lang=en (Accessed 18 November 2023). [in Persian]

- Soltani, Seyyed Nasser. (2021) "Hoghoḡh-e asāsi -ye nā'neveshteh: darsi farāmosh'shodeh az abolfazl-e qāzi (Unwritten Constitutional Rights; A Forgotten Lesson from Abulfazl Qazi," *Dānesh-e hoghoḡh-e omomi (Journal of Public Law Knowledge)* 10, 34: 112-83, <DOI:10.22034/qjplk.1400.237>. [in Persian]
- Tabatabaei, Seyyed Javad. (2017, January 4) "Sokhan'rāni dar hamāyesh-e Īrān hamin jāst ke estādeh'im (Speech at the "Iran Conference, this is where we stand)," (*3danet.ir*) Tehran: Khāneh-ye andishmandān-e oloom-e ensāni. Available at: <https://3danet.ir/iran-1395> (Accessed 18 November 1402). [in Persian]
- Vedel, Georges. (1990) "Rapport de synthèse," in Association française des constitutionnalistes, *La continuité constitutionnelle en France de 1789 à 1989*. Paris: Economica. [in French]
- Vedel, Georges. (1958-1959) *Cours De Droit Constitutionnel Et D'institutions Politiques*. Paris: Les cours de Droit. [in French]
- Vedel, Georges. (1981) "Une image de la science politique à travers la Revue française de science politique, étude quantitative (1951-1980) pour contribuer à une histoire de la science politique en France," *mém. DEA d'Études politiques*, Paris : IEP. [in French]
- Venn Dicey, Albert. (2016) *Darmādi bar hoghoḡh-e assāsi (An Introduction to Constitutional Rights)*, ed. Seyyed Naser Soltani. Tehran: Negah-e mo'āser. [in Persian]



This article is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC-BY) license.



Research Paper

Human Happiness and Political Theory in the Holy Qur'an

Mohammad Shojaiyan *

Associate Professor, Political Science Department, Research Institute of Hawzah and University, Tehran, Iran. Email: shojaiyan@rihu.ac.ir

Abstract

Human happiness might be one of the influential principles of political theory, and indeed political theorists are required to understand human nature and its fundamental characteristics and explore ways and means to reach a desirable society. From this perspective, every political theory is based on specific epistemological claims about the traits of human beings. One issue-area in theory-building is how human nature plays a decisive role in the attainment of happiness. A key objective of the present article is to discuss 'well-being' in various aspects of everyday lives of humankind and examine its implications for political theory from the perspective of the Holy Quran. The primary research question to be answered is: Given the existential structure of human beings from the perspective of the Holy Qur'an, would they be able to present a theory of happiness as one of the foundations of political theory, independently and on their own? By using the method of thematic study of the Qur'an, the author seeks to answer this question and produce heightened awareness of many issues related to the association between the conception of human well-being and political theory about why happy people are happy, what factors result in happiness, and how to attain happiness. In the research hypothesis, it is argued that political theory's inattention to the fundamental nature of human happiness will be an obstacle to creating a desirable society. The use of the words "*bashar*" and "*ensān*"—that means exactly the same as the word "human"—to refer to the divine prophets in the Holy Book indicated that they were humans but they had the unique ability to receive 'revelation'. This ability fulfills a general need, i.e., the need for transcendental and divine guidance for the attainment of human happiness. The Prophet Mohammad (peace and blessings be upon him) received revelation of the Qur'an from God. The structure of humans' existence and the way of life of human beings on earth are such that they

***How to Cite:** Shojaiyan, Mohammad. (2023, Fall) "Human Happiness and Political Theory in the Holy Quran," *Faslnāmeḥ-ye siyāsāt (Politics Quarterly)* 53, 3: 499-518, <DOI:10.22059/JPQ.2024.322485.1007788>.

Manuscript received: 22 April 2021; final revision received: 9 October 2023; accepted: 3 December 2023, published online: 16 December 2023



need divine guidance through the descent of an angel who is a divine messenger to convey the message of divine guidance to human beings to fulfill that need.

For the sake of brevity and presenting a concise discussion, only the term 'human' and some of their Qur'anic applications will be used to answer the research question. The use of the word 'human' to refer to the divine prophets in the Qur'an shows that they are not fundamentally different from other human beings. In terms of the existential structure and nature, in spite of the fact that they had a special and, of course, very important quality (i.e., the ability to receive 'revelation'). This explanation about the implication of a theory of human well-being, which must necessarily be derived from a revelatory source, will be very important for political theory. In this respect, political theory must seek a divine source to explain and attain happiness. This can put an end to the endless and seemingly insurmountable differences that exist in the theories of happiness. The implication of a theory about human happiness, which must inevitably be derived from a revelatory source, is very important for theory building in politics. Political theory must consider the theological dimension of existentialism and the enrichment of human life. If political theory ignores this fundamental feature of the nature of human happiness, it cannot achieve its fundamental objective that is to create a desirable society.

Keywords: Happiness, Holy Qur'an, Political Theory, Prophets, Revelation

Declaration of conflicting interests

The author declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

Funding

The author received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

References

- The Holy Quran*. [in Arabic]
The Holy Quran, trans. Ayatollah Makarem Shirazi. [in Persian]
 Askari (Āl-Askari), Abu Hilal. (2005) *Muejam al-furuq fi al-lughah (Dictionary of Linguistic Differences)*. Qom: Al-Nashar al-Islami Institute. [in Arabic]
 Berry, Christopher. (1986) *Human Nature*. London: Macmillan.
 Enayat, Hamid. (1998) *Bonyād-e falsafeh-ye siyāsi dar gharb (Foundation of Political Philosophy in the West)*. Tehran: Zemestān. [in Persian]
 Farabi, Abu Nasr Mohammad. (1992) *Siyāsāt-e madīnah (Madinah Politics)*, trans. Seyyed Jafar Sajjadi. Tehran: Vezārat-e fārhāng va ershād-e eslāmi (Ministry of Culture and Islamic Guidance). [in Persian]
 Firouzabadi (al-Fayrūzabādī), Muhammad bin Yaqub. (2009) *Muejam al-qamous al-muhit (Al-Qamoos al-Muhait Dictionary)*. Beirut: Dar Almarefa. [in Arabic]

- Haybron, Daniel. (2014) *Sē'ādat (Happiness)*, trans. Hossein Azimi. Tehran: Qaqnus. [in Persian]
- Heywood, Andrew. (2008) *Mafahim-e kelidi dar elm-e siyāsāt (Key Concepts in Politics)*, trans. Hossein Saeed Kolahi and Abbas Kardan. Tehran: Scientific and Cultural. [in Persian]
- Ibn Faris bin Zakaria, Ahmad. (2008) *Muejam muqayys allughah (Dictionary of Language Standards)*. Beirut: Dar Ihya al-Turath al-Arabi. [in Arabic]
- Ibn Manzur, Muhammad ibn Mukarram. (2005) *Lisan al-'Arab (The Arabic Language)*. Beirut: Al-Alami, V. 1. [in Arabic]
- Jones, William Thomas. (2004) *Khodāyān-e andisheh-ye siyāsi (Gods of Political Thought)*, trans. Javad Sheikholislami. Tehran: Elmi va farhangi, V. 2. [in Persian]
- Lesani Fasharaki, Mohammad Ali; and Hossein Moradi Zanjani. (2014) *Ravesh-e tahghigh-e mozo'i dar qurān-e karim (Thematic Research Method in the Holy Quran)*. Qom: Bostān-e Ketāb. [in Persian]
- Murad, Saeed. (1992) *Nazaria al-saeada eind al-falasifa al-islam (The Theory of Happiness among the Philosophers of Islam)*. Cairo: Maktaba Al-Angelo al-Masriyah. [in Arabic]
- O'Sullivan, Noel. (2009) *Nazariyeh-e siyāsi dar gozār (Political Theory in Transition)*, trans. Hassan Ab-Niki. Tehran: Kavir. [in Persian]
- Pakatchi, Ahmed. (2012) *Ravesh-e tahghigh: ba takid bar Hozeh-ye oloom-e qurān (Research Method: With an Emphasis on the Field of The Qur'an and the Hadith Science)*. Tehran: Imam Sadiq University (AS). [in Persian]
- Plant, Raymond. (1999) *Modern Political Thought*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell.
- Ragib (Al-Raghib al-Isfahani), Hossein bin Muhammad. (n.d.) *Al-mufradāt fay ghuryb al-Qur'an (Vocabulary in the Qur'an)*. Tehran: Daftar-e nashr-e al-ketāb. [in Arabic]
- Raphael, D. D. (1991) *Problems of Political Philosophy*. London: Macmillan, 2nd ed.
- Sadr, Seyed Mohammad Bagher. (1980) *Ensān-e masool va tārikh'sāz az didgāh-e Qurān-e Karim (Responsible Man and History Maker from the Perspective of the Holy Qur'an)*, trans. Mohammad Mehdi Fouladvand. Tehran: Mizan. [in Persian]
- Schumacher, Paul. (2010) *The Political Theory: A Reader*. New York: Wiley.
- Spragens, Thomas. (1991) *Fahm-e nazariyeh'hā-ye siyāsi (Understanding Political Theory)*, trans. Farhang Rajai. Tehran: Agah. [in Persian]
- Strauss, Leo. (1988) *What is Political Philosophy? And Other Studies*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.
- Tabarsi (al-Tabarsi), al-Fazl bin al-Hassan. (2009) *Tafsir jawami'al-jami'a (Interpretation of the Mosques of the Mosque)*. Qom: Al-Nashar al-Islami Institute. [in Arabic]
- Tabataba'i, Muhammad Husayn. (2009) *Al-Mizan fi Tafsir al-Qur'an (Al-Mizan in the Interpretation of the Qur'an)*. Qom: Al-Nashar al-Islami Institute. [in Arabic]

- Tarihi (al-Tarihi), Fakhreddin. (2007) *Majma-ul-Bahrain (The Confluence of the Two Seas)*, Ahmad Al-Husaini, ed. Beirut: Institute of Arabic History, V. 2. [in Arabic]
- Trigg, Roger. (1999) *Ideas of Human Nature: An Historical Introduction*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 2nd ed.
- Wright, Nicholas P. (2015) *Tārikh-e mokhtesāri az khoshbakhti (A Brief History of Happiness)*, trans. Omid Shafii Qahfarkhi. Tehran: Imam Sadegh University (AS). [in Persian]
- Zibakalam, Saeed. (2002, June) "Inapt Link between Positivism and Political Ideas," *Fasl-nāmeḥ-ye pajoheškadeh-ye hawzah va daneshgāh (Journal of Research Center of Hawzeh and University)* 8, 30: 4-28. Available at: https://journals.rihu.ac.ir/article_636.html (Accessed 16 October 2022) [in Persian]



This article is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC-BY) license.



Research Paper

Middle Eastern Elites, the Subjects of the Eurocentric International Order

Elahe Kolaee¹✉, Javad Mirgaloyebayat²

¹ Corresponding Author: Professor, Faculty of Law & Political Science, University of Tehran, Tehran, Iran. Email: ekolaee@ut.ac.ir

² A PhD Candidate, Faculty of Law & Political Science, University of Tehran, Iran. Email: mirjavadbayat@ut.ac.ir

Abstract

During the last two centuries, particularly in the post-World War II period, many former colonies in the Middle East have gained independence. However, there is a growing gap between countries—dichotomized into different groups in the international system such as Developed or Undeveloped, North or South, First World or Third World, Center or Periphery, West or East, and so on. The Middle East or ‘the Islamic East’ is one of the regions which have been suffering from either drastic backwardness or dependent development. In postcolonial discourse, the epistemological agency of the non-European world is revived and the one-sided narration of westerners about the whole world is not the only source of knowledge. Intellectual and political elites of the newly independent societies as ‘nationalist and anticolonialist subjects’ entered into battle in order to change the subordinate position of these countries in the international order and find ways to overcome the problem of underdevelopment and dependence on the western countries, but these so-called ‘Middle Easterner subjects’ as referred to in this paper were unable to be independent subjects and actually became subjected to the influence of the external forces. Most Middle Eastern intellectual and political elites had to change their attitudes and activities due to eurocentrism, especially in the area of foreign policy and international relations. As the subjects of the Eurocentric international order, they unconsciously cooperated with the forces which intended to maintain the existing international order, despite the fact that they were initially trying to change this superior-subordinate arrangement in protest against its unequal nature. The so-called subjectivity of these elites has led to an even expanding backwardness in many parts of

***How to Cite:** Kolaee, Elahe; and Javad Mirgaloyebayat. (2023, Fall) “Middle Eastern Elites, the Subjects of the Eurocentric International Order.” *Faslnāmeḥ-ye siyāsāt (Politics Quarterly)* 53, 3: 519-540, <DOI: 10.22059/JPQ.2024.347796.1007989>.

Manuscript received: 27 August 2022; final revision received: 25 October 2023; accepted: 3 December 2023, published online: 16 December 2023



the region.

The authors' main objective is to answer the following research questions: 1. How have the postcolonial discourses, which have originated from the Eurocentric international order been reinforced? 2. Why were the anti-colonial elites of the Middle East ultimately influenced by the Eurocentric view in spite of their initial opposition to eurocentrism? In the research hypothesis, it is argued that the worldview of eurocentrism of the Middle Eastern elites and intellectuals have acted as positive reinforces of the Eurocentrism perspective and orientation in the Middle Eastern countries. To answer these questions, they use the framework of the theories of post-colonialism, and draw conclusions from Spivak's discussions of the subalterns and domination, Edward Said's writings on the subject of Orientalism, and the discourse of the elites of the so-called Islamic East who had struggled to confront the challenge of backwardness of their countries during the 1960-1970 period. The findings of the research showed that even some of the staunchest anti-colonial political elites and intellectuals—in spite of their rebellion against imperial powers and critical views of the Eurocentric attitudes of the westerners—ended up as the subjects of the European-dominated international order. Such results are valuable for understanding the persistent backwardness of countries in the Middle East which are confronted with this challenge in different ways and varying degrees of severity.

Keywords: Edward Said, Eurocentrism, Middle East, Orientalism, Subalterns Studies

Declaration of conflicting interests

The authors declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

Funding

The authors received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

References

- Abdel-Malek, Anouar. (1981) *Civilization and Social Theory*. London: Macmillan.
- Abrahamian, Ervand. (2009) *Īrān beyne du enghelāb (Iran between Two Revolutions)*, trans. Ahmad Gol Mohamadi and Mohamad Ebrahim Leylayi. Tehran: Nay. [in Persian]
- Ansari, Hamed. (1986) *The Stalled Society*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.
- Ansari, Mansour; and Masoud Darroudi. (2014, April) “Motāleāte pasā-estemāri, talāsh matn mehvar dar jahat-e vārooneh’sāzi-ye cheshmandāz’hā (Post-Colonial Studies: Two Different Approaches),” *Jostār’hā-ye siāyasi-ye mo’āser (Contemporary Political Studies)* 5, 12): 1-23. Available at: https://politicalstudy.ihcs.ac.ir/article_1407.html (Accessed 17 July 2022). [in Persian]

- Ashcroft, Bill, et al. (2005) *Post-Colonial Studies: The Key Concept*. London and New York: Routledge
- Balta, Paul; and Rollo Chlorne. (1991) *Maghreb-e bozorg, az esteghlāl tā sāl-e 2000 (Great Maghreb, from Independence to the 2000)*, trans. Abbas Agahi. Tehran: Nashre MFA. [in Persian]
- Blaut, James M. (2010) *Hasht tārikh'dāne oroopā-mehvar (Eight Eurocentric Historians)*, trans. Arastoo Mizani and Behyan Rafie. Tehran: Amir Kabir. [in Persian]
- Byrne, Jeffrey James. (2009) "Our Own Special Brand of Socialism: Algeria and the Contest of Modernity in the 1960s," *Diplomatic History* 33, 3: 427-447, <DOI:10.1057/9780230392786_4>.
- Carver, Michael. (2011) *A Correct and Progressive Road: U.S.-Turkish Relation, 1945-1964*, A PhD Dissertation in History, Bowling Green State University, Ohio, USA. Available at: https://etd.ohiolink.edu/apexprod/rws_etd/send_file/send?accession=bgsu1300992155&disposition=inline (Accessed 8 October 2022).
- Edens, David; and William Snaveley. (1970) "Planning for Economic Development in Saudi Arabia," *Middle East Journal* 24, 1: 17-30. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/i398307> (Accessed 2 August 2022).
- Eisenstadt, Shmuel Noah (1996) *Modernization: Protest and Change*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Gandī, Leila. (2012) *Pasā-estemār'gār-i (Post Colonialism)*, trans. Maryam Alamzadeh and Homayoon Kaka Soltani. Tehran: Pajoheshkadeh-ye motāleālt-e farhangī va ejetmāee. [in Persian]
- Gikandi, Simon. (2012) *Pasā-sāktār'gār-i va goftemān-e pasā-estemāri (Poststructuralism and Postcolonial Discourse)*, trans. Jalal Farzaneh Dehkordi and Ramin Farhadi. Tehran: Dāneshgāh-e Imām Sadegh. [in Persian]
- Gramsci, Antonio. (2021) *Daftar'hā-ye zendān (Prison Note Book)*, trans. Hasan Mortazavi. Tehran: Cheshmeh. [in Persian]
- Guha, Ranajit, ed. (1982) *Subaltern Studies I*. Oxford and New Delhi: Oxford University Press.
- Hakimi, Hadi; and Mohammad Tagi Maboodi. (2017) "Tahlili bar teori-ye nosāzi tosēh (An Analysis of the Modernization Theory of Development)," *Fasl'nāmeḥ-ye rāhbord-e tosēh (Journal of Development Strategy)* 13, 51: 29-59. Available at: <http://rahbord-mag.ir/Article/13970404195748112950> (Accessed 17 July 2022). [in Persian]
- Harris, Lillian Craig. (1986) *Libya: Gadhafi's Revolution and the Modern State*. Boulder, Colorado: Westview Press.
- Harrison, David. (1991) *The Sociology of Modernization and Development*. London: Routledge.
- Hiddleston, Jane. (2009) *Understanding Postcolonialism*. Stocksfield: Acumen.
- Hinnebusch, Raymond. (1981) "Egypt under Sadat: Elites, Power Structure, and Political Change in a Post-Populist State," *Society for Study of Social Problems* 28, 4: 442-464, <DOI:10.2307/800057>.

- Hinnebusch, Raymond; and Anoushirvan Ehteshami. (2011) *Siyāsāt khāreji-ye keshvarhā-ye eslāmi (The Foreign Policies of Middle East States)*, trans. Morteza Sabbah and Rahman Ghahremanpour. Tehran: Dāneshgāh-e Imām Sadegh. [in Persian]
- Hobson, John M. (2012) *The Eurocentric Conception of World Politics, Western International Theory 1760-2010*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Hodgson, Marshall G. (1993) *The Venture of Islam*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.
- Hooks, Bell. (1990) "Marginality as a Site of Resistance." in Russell Ferguson, et al., eds. *Out There: Marginalization and Contemporary Cultures*. Cambridge, MA: MIT, 152-190.
- Jirvand, Abdollah. (1989) *Tosēh eghtesādi (Economic Development)*. Tehran: Molavi. [in Persian]
- Kandil, Hazem. (2016) *The Power Triangle: Military, Security, and Politics in Regime Change*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Kesseiri, Raida. (2005) *Ideologised Foreign Policy and the Pragmatic Rationale: The Case of Algeria under Houari Boumedienne, 1965-1978*, A PhD Dissertation in Middle Eastern Studies, the University of Leeds, UK. Available at: <https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/40033451.pdf> (Accessed 8 May 2022).
- Marsh, David; and Jerry Stoker. (2013) *Ravesh va nazariyeh dar oloom-e siyāsi (Theory and Methods in Political Science)*, trans. Amir Mohamad Haji-Yoosefi. Tehran: Pajoheshkadeh-ye motāleāte rāhbordi. [in Persian]
- Mccully, Burse. (1940) *English Education and the Origins of Indian Nationalism*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Miliken, Jennifer. (2006, December) "The Study of Discourse in International Relations: A Critique of Research and Methods," trans. Homerirah Moshirzadeh, *Public Law Research* 8, 21: 209-260. Available at: https://qjpl.atu.ac.ir/article_2816.html?lang=en (Accessed 17 July 2022). [in Persian]
- Milz, Sara. (2003) *Goftemān (Discourse)*, trans. Fatah Mohamadi. Zanjan: Hezāreh sevom. [in Persian]
- Moeini Alamdari, Jahangir. (2006) "Hoviat va tavil: dar jostejoo-ye yek hoviate pāsā-estemāri (Identity and Interpretation: In Search of a Postcolonial Identity)," *Faslnāmeḥ-ye motāleāt-e melli (Journal of National Studies)* 7, 1: 23-52. Available at: <https://www.sid.ir/fa/Journal/ViewPaper.aspx?ID=42917> (Accessed 17 July 2022). [in Persian]
- Parry, Benita. (2012) *Nahādineh kardan-e motāleāt-e pasā-estemāri (Institutionalizing Postcolonial Studies)*, trans. Jalal Farzaneh Dehkordi and Ramin Farhadi. Tehran: Dāneshgāh-e Imām Sadegh. [in Persian]
- . (2004) "The Institutionalization of Postcolonial Studies," *The Cambridge Companion to Postcolonial Literary Studies*, 66-80, <DOI:10.1017/CCOL0521826942.004>.

- Pelt, Adrian. (1970) *Libyan Independence and the United Nations: A Case of Planned Decolonization*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 168-170, <DOI: 10.1017/S0021853700000402>.
- Pipes, Daniel. (1992) *Greater Syria: The History of an Ambition*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Rami, Ginat. (1997) *Egypt's Incomplete Revolution: Lutfi Al-Khuli and Nasser's Socialism in the 1960s*. London: Routledge.
- Robinovitch, Itamar. (1972) *Syria under the Baath, 1963-1966*. Jerusalem: Israel University Press.
- Rostow, Walt W. (1960) *The Stages of Economic Growth: A Non-Communist Manifesto*. New York and Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Saeed, Ahmad. (2011) *Masāel-e siyāsī va eghtesādī jahān-e sevom (Political and Economic Issues of the Third World)*. Tehran: SAMT. [in Persian]
- . (2007) “Moghadameh-ei bar nazariyeh va naghhd nosāzi (An Introduction to Postcolonial Theory and Criticism),” *Majaleh'i dāneshkadeh'i hoghogh va oloom-e siyāsī (The Journal of the Faculty of Law and Political Science)* 73: 133-154. Available at: <https://www.sid.ir/fa/journal/ViewPaper.aspx?id=60762> (Accessed 17 July 2022). [in Persian]
- Said, Edward. (2016) *Shargh'shenāsi (Orientalism)*, trans. Abdolrahim Govahi. Tehran: farhāng-e eslāmi. [in Persian]
- Sardar, Ziaoldin. (2008) *Shargh'shenāsi (Orientalism)*, trans. Mohamad Ali Ghasemi. Tehran: Pajooheshkadeh-ye motāleāt-e farhangī va ejtemāi. [in Persian]
- Spivak, Gayatri. (1988) *Āyā foroodast mitavānad sokhan begooyad (Can the Subaltern Speak?)*, trans. Ayoob Karimi. Tehran: Falāt. [in Persian]
- . (1987) “Three Women's Text and a Critique of Imperialism,” *Critical Inquiry* 12, 1: 243-261. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/1343469> (Accessed 3 August 2022).
- . (1985, Winter-Spring) “Can the Subaltern Speak? Speculations on Widow-Sacrifice,” *Wedge* 7/8: 120-130. Available at: https://abahlali.org/files/Can_the_subaltern_speak.pdf (Accessed 3 October 2023).
- St John, Ronald B. (2008) “The Changing Libyan Economy, Causes and Consequences,” *Middle East Journal* 62, 1: 75-91. Available at: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/233583356_The_Changing_Libyan_Economy_Causes_and_Consequences (Accessed 2 August 2022).
- Taghizadeh Tabari, Abasaleh. (2009) “Eslāhāt dar maktab-e nosāzi (Reforms in the School of Modernization),” *Rahā'vārd-e siyāsī (Political Result)* 7, 24 and 25: 91-106. Available at: <http://ensani.ir/fa/article/220659> (Accessed 17 July 2022). [in Persian]
- Tipps, Dean. (1976) *Modernization Theory and the Comparative Study of Societies: A Critical Perspective*. New York: Free Press.
- Tompka, Piotrs. (2003) “Nazariyeh'hā-ye nosāzi ghadim va jadid (Old and New Modernization Theories),” trans. Gholam Reza Arjmandi. *Peyk-e noor* 1, 1: 11-23. Available at: <https://www.sid.ir/fa/journal/ViewPaper.aspx?id=127001> (Accessed 17 July 2022). [in Persian]

- Torrey, Gordon H.; and John F. Delvin. (1965) "Arab Socialism," *Journal of International Affairs* 19, 1: 47-62. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/i24362871> (Accessed 2 August 2022).
- Turner, Brayan. S. (2007) *Sharg'shenāsi pasā-modernism va jahāni'shodan (Orientalism, Postmodernism and Globalization)*, trans. Saed Vesali. Tehran: Bonyad-e nahj'olbalāgeh. [in Persian]
- Vandewalle, Dirk. (2006) *A History of Modern Libya*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Yodfat, Aryeh. (1971) "The End of Syria's Isolation," *The World Today* 27, 8: 329-339. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/40394532> (Accessed 2 August 2022).
- Young, Robert. (2003) *Postcolonialism: A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Ziai, Aram. (2012) "Postcolonial Perspectives on Development," Center for Development Research, University of Bonn, *ZEF Working Paper Series*, 103. Available at: <https://www.econstor.eu/bitstream/10419/88339/1/773389075.pdf> (Accessed 2 August 2022).



This article is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC-BY) license.



Research Paper

India's Defense Diplomacy in the Persian Gulf

Afshin Mottaghi ^{1*}✉, Shahrirar Faraji Nasiri ²

¹ Corresponding Author: Associate Professor of Political Geography, Department of Geography, Kharzmi University, Tehran, Iran. Email: amottaghi@khu.ac.ir

² Assistant Professor, Department of Political Science, University of Lorestan, Khoramabad, Iran.

Abstract

In recent decades, India has become one of the emerging powers or rising powers in the international system. Because of India's rapid economic growth and the country's ever-increasing need for energy, the Persian Gulf—as one of the top energy resource-rich regions in the world—have become attractive for the Indian politicians. The expansion of India's strategic interests in the Persian Gulf region (PGR), combined with the need to ensure the country's energy security has led New Delhi to explore the opportunity and possibility of military and security presence in the PGR. In recent years, India has consequently entered into a "strategic partnership" with several Persian Gulf countries and has started extensive defense-security cooperation with these states. The objectives of the present study are as follows: a) to explain the dimensions and components of India's defense diplomacy in the Persian Gulf region; and b) to examine the policy instruments which are used by India to secure its national interests and to protect its national security based on defense diplomacy.

In the research hypothesis, it is assumed that there is a significant relationship between India's defense diplomacy in the Persian Gulf and its national security. India has explored the opportunities of defense cooperation with PG states in various fields, including cooperation in military training, joint military exercises and provision of resources, research and development (R&D), production and marketing of defense equipment in the PG countries in order to prevent the encirclement of India by China or Pakistan. The Indian policymakers want to expand their country's relations with the US as the major provider of foreign aid for safeguarding national security interests of New Delhi. The theoretical framework of Anton de Plessis's theory of military diplomacy is used. This political scientist defines

***How to Cite:** Mottaghi, Afshin; and Shahrirar Faraji Nasiri. (2023, Fall) "India's Defense Diplomacy in the Persian Gulf," *Faslnāmeḥ-ye siyāsāt (Politics Quarterly)* 53, 3: 541-567, <DOI: 10.22059/JPQ.2024.360020.1008073>.

Manuscript received: 28 August 2023; final revision received: 5 October 2023; accepted: 1 December 2023, published online: 16 December 2023



this military type of diplomacy broadly as "the use of military personnel, including service dependents, to support conflict prevention and resolution". Among a wide range of activities, military diplomacy includes providing foreign aid for the purpose of developing liable democratic armed forces. Du Plessis also provided a broader definition of military diplomacy as "the use of armed forces in operations other than war, relying on their expertise and trained discipline to achieve national and foreign goals abroad".

For hypothesis testing, one-way analysis of variance (F test) has been used. The research findings show that the relationship between India's defense diplomacy in the Persian Gulf and its national security is significant at the confidence level of 0.99. Moreover, Pearson's correlation coefficient was used to estimate the strength and direction of the relationship between India's defense diplomacy in the Persian Gulf and the its national security. The Pearson correlation coefficient between the variables indicates that the intensity of the relationship between them is moderate and its direction is positive. In other words, India's defense diplomacy in the Persian Gulf moderately plays a role in protecting Indian national security.

Key Words: Defense Diplomacy, India, Look West, Maritime Diplomacy, Persian Gulf

Declaration of conflicting interests

The authors declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

Funding

The authors received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

References

- Blannin, Patrick. (2017) "Defence Diplomacy in the Long War," *Diplomacy and Foreign Policy* 43: 11-40, <DOI:10.1163/9789004331211>. Available at: https://brill.com/view/journals/rpdf/2/1-2/article-p1_1.xml?language=en (Accessed 13 September 2022).
- Chaudhury, Dipanjan Roy. (2018, February 13) "PM Modi's Oman Visit: Indian Navy Can Now Access Duqm Port," *The Economic Times*. Available at: <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/defence/pm-modis-oman-visit-navy-can-now-access-duqm-port/articleshow/62894357.cms?from=mdr> (Accessed 1 September 2022).
- Cottey, Andrew; and Anthony Foster. (2004) *Reshaping Defence Diplomacy: New Roles for Military Cooperation and Assistance*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Drab, Lech. (2018) "Defense Diplomacy- An Important Tool for the Implementation of Foreign Policy and Security of the State," *Security and Defence Quarterly* 20, 3: 57-71, <DOI:10.5604/01. 3001. 0012. 5152>.
- Du Plessis, Anton. (2008) "Defence Diplomacy: Conceptual and Practical Dimensions with Specific Reference to South Africa," *Strategic Review*

- for *Southern Africa* 30, 2: 87–119. Available At: https://repository.up.ac.za/bitstream/handle/2263/10381/DuPlessis_Defence%282008%29.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y (Accessed 10 December 2022).
- Ebrahimifar, Tahereh; and Seyed Amir Saeed Hedayati. (2014, Fall) "Tasir-e monāsebāt-e fazāyandeh-ye siyāsi-eghtesādi-ye hend va keshvār'hā-ye shurāy-e hamkāri-ye khaliy-e fārs bar tose'-ye eghtesādi-ye in keshvār'hā (The Impact of Expanding Political-Economic Relations Between India and the Countries of the Persian Gulf Cooperation Council on the Economic Development of These Countries)," *Faslnāmeḥ-ye oloom-e siyāsī (Political Science Quarterly)* 10, 28: 191-193. Available at: <https://sanad.iau.ir/fa/Article/648847?FullText=FullText> (Accessed 11 July 2022). [in Persian]
- Grare, Frederic. (2022, July 5) "Is India a Maritime Player in the Gulf?," *Middle East Institution, Insight* 200, 3. Available at: <https://mei.nus.edu.sg/publication/insight-280-is-india-a-maritime-player-in-the-gulf/> (Accessed 4 May 2023).
- Handel, Michael. (2005) *Masters of War: Classical Strategic Thought*. London: Frank Cass.
- "Indian Navy Committed to Enhance Cooperation with Like-minded Navies: Admiral Singh," (2019, October) *The Economic Times*. Available at: <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/defence/indian-navy-fully-seized-of-its-role-in-maritime-cooperation-navy-hief/articleshow/71645073.cms> (Accessed 30 April 2022).
- India Ministry of External Affairs. (2022, February) "Joint India-UAE Vision Statement-Advancing the India-UAE Comprehensive Strategic Partnership: New Frontiers," (*wam.ae*). Available at: <https://www.wam.ae/en/details/1395303022276> (Accessed 29 March 2022).
- Jaishankar, Dhruva. (2016) "India's Military Diplomacy," *Defence Primer: India at 75, gmfus.org* 75: 18-24. Available at: https://www.gmfus.org/sites/default/files/Military_Layout_Final-1.20-26.pdf (Accessed 9 December 2022).
- Khushnam, P.N. (2021, March 23) "India-UAE Relations: Poised to Climb to New Heights," *The Middle East Institute (MEI)*. Available at: <https://www.mei.edu/publications/india-uae-relations-poised-climb-new-heights> (Accessed 10 December 2022).
- Kute, Pratik. (2022, March) "50 Year of India-Qatar Relation (1973-2022): Achievements," *Voice of Research* 10, 4: 170-177. Available at: http://www.voiceofresearch.org/Doc/Mar-2022/Mar-2022_16.pdf (Accessed 10 December 2022).
- Leahy, Peter. (2014) "Military Diplomacy, Defence Diplomacy: Is the Game Worth the Candle," *The Centre of Gravity Series (Paper 17)*, Australian National University, Canberra, 16, 5: 20-35. Available at: <https://bellschool.anu.edu.au/sdsc/experts-publications/publications/1826/defence-diplomacy-game-worth-candle> (Accessed 15 December 2022).
- Ministry of Defence. (2014-2015, March 13) "Indo-Oman Joint Ex Al Nagah," Ministry of Defence, *PIB Delhi (pib.gov.in)*. Available At:

- <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1568781> (Accessed 20 April 2022).
- Muthanna, K.A. (2011, January 1) "Military Diplomacy," *Journal of Defence Studies* 5, 1: 1-18. Available at: https://www.idsa.in/system/files/jds_5_1_kamuthanna.pdf (Accessed 20 August 2022).
- Panda, Ankit. (2018) "India Gains Access to Oman's Duqm Port, Putting the Indian Ocean Geopolitical Contest in the Spotlight," *Center for Land Warfare Studies*. Available at: <https://www.claws.in/omans-strategic-duqm-port-and-indias-opportunities> (Accessed 22 August 2022).
- Pradhan, Prashanta Kumar. (2010, Winter) "India and the Gulf Cooperation Council: Time to Look Beyond Business," *Strategic Analysis* 34, 3: 409-419, <DOI:10.1080/09700161003659103>.
- Prasad, N. Ram. (2021, January 25) "India-Saudi Defense Ties on the Upswing," *Arab News*. Available at: <https://arab.news/64aa2> (Accessed 30 August 2022).
- Rajagopalan, Rajeswari Pillai. (2021, February 20) "India-Saudi Security Ties Getting Stronger," *The Diplomat*. Available at: <https://thediplomat.com/2021/02/india-saudi-security-ties-getting-stronger> (Accessed 25 August 2022).
- Roy-Chaudhury, Dipanjan. (2018, February 13) "PM Modi's Oman Visit: Indian Navy Can Now Access Duqm Port," *The Economic Times*. Available at: <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/defence/pm-modis-oman-visit-navy-can-now-access-duqm-port/articleshow/62894357.cms?from=mdr> (Accessed 15 April 2022).
- Seyed Emami, Kavos. (2004) *Pizhohish dar oloom-e siyāsi; esbāt'garā, tafsiri, va enteghādi (Research in Political Science; Positivist, Interpretive and Critical Approaches)*. Tehran: Research Institute of Cultural and Social Studies. [in Persian]
- Sharma, Anu. (2020) "India's Strategic Option: Duqm Port (Oman)," *Defense and Security Alert* 12, 3: 3-9. Available at: https://www.academia.edu/44934962/Indias_Strategic_Option_Duqm_Port_Oman_6 (Accessed 21 April 2022).
- Sibal, Kanwal. (2020) "Role of Military Diplomacy in India's Foreign Policy," 22nd Colonel Pyara Lal Memorial Lecture, 19 September 2018, United Services Institute, New Delhi (usiofindia.org). Available at: <https://usiofindia.org/publication/usi-journal/role-of-military-iplomacy-in-indias-foreign-policy> (Accessed on 16 April 2020).
- Siddiqui, Huma. (2019, October 25) "Strengthening Ties: India-Saudi Arabia to Hold the First Ever Joint Naval Drill," *Financial Express*. Available at: <https://www.financialexpress.com/defence/strengthening-ties-india-saudi-arabia-to-hold-the-first-ever-joint-naval-drill/1745816> (Accessed 17 April 2022).
- Simbar, Reza, et al. (2015) *Siyāsāt-e khārejī-ye hend (India's Foreign Policy)*. Gilan: Gilan University Press. [in Persian]
- Singh, Abhijit. (2020) "India's Evolving Maritime Posture in the Indian Ocean: Opportunities for the Gulf," Emirates Diplomatic Academy (www.agda.ac.ae). Available at: <https://www.agda.ac.ae/docs/default->

source/Publications/eda-insight-aug-2020-eng-abhijit.pdf?sfvrsn=6
(Accessed 10 March 2022).

- Singh, Bhubhinder; and Tan S. Singh. (2011) "From Boots to Brogues: The Rise of Defence Diplomacy in Southeast Asia," *RSIS Monograph, S. Rajaratnam School of International Studies*, Singapore, 1-128. Available at: <https://www.rsis.edu.sg/wp-content/uploads/2000/01/Monograph21.pdf> (Accessed 23 May 2022).
- Taghizadeh Ansari, Mohammad. (2017) "Tahavol-e siyāsat-e khāvareh' miyāneh' ī-ye hend dar partov-e esterāteji-ye negāh b gharb (The Evolution of India's Middle East Policy in the Light of the Strategy of Looking to the West)," *Faslnāmeḥ-ye jahān-e eslām (Journal of the Islamic World)* 7, 1: 223-253, <DOI: 10.21859/priw-070109>. [in Persian]
- "The Significance of Duqm Port for India," (2022, February) *New Delhi Times*. Available at: <https://www.maritimegateway.com/the-significance-of-duqm-port-for-india> (Accessed 20 April 2022).
- Thomas, Roby. (2021, November) "Indian Defence Diplomacy," *MP-IDS Monograph Series 74 (idsa.in/system)*. Available at: <https://idsa.in/system/files/monograph/monograph74.pdf> (Accessed 5 April 2022).
- Willard, James E. (2006) "Military Diplomacy: An Essential Tool of Foreign Policy at the Theater Strategic Level," *School of Advanced Military Studies*, US Army Command and General Staff College, Fort Leavenworth, Kansas, 1-71. Available at: <https://apps.dtic.mil/sti/tr/pdf/ADA450837.pdf> (Accessed 5 May 2022).



This article is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC-BY) license.



Research Paper

Myth-Based Discursive Formalism: A Theoretical Framework for Understanding Non-Realist Foreign Policies

Homeira Moshirzadeh^{1*}, Sajad Minadi²

¹ Corresponding Author: Professor, Department of International Relations, Faculty of Law & Political Science, University of Tehran, Iran. Email: hmoshir@ut.ac.ir

² A PhD Candidate in International Relations, Department of International Relations, Faculty of Law & Political Science, University of Tehran, Iran. Email: sajadminadi@ut.ac.ir

Abstract

Foreign policies of many countries in various conditions have been proved to be inconsistent with the predictions and prescriptions of realism. In this article, a realist foreign policy is defined as one followed on the basis of what realists regard as being rational, more or less risk-averse, furthering national interest and security, employing diplomacy as the preferred way for achieving goals, taking into account others' vital interests, making a balance between one's power and objectives, and being prudent. However, nearly irrational unrealistic foreign policies are not uncommon and attempts at explaining them have led to the emergence of other theoretical frameworks that take into account various factors, from cognition to bureaucratic politics to the role of identity and emotions in order to supplement realism.

In this article, a discursive formalist theoretical framework based on Ernst Cassirer's understanding of myth as a form of thought with extra-rational elements and categories has been introduced to show how unrealistic foreign policies—especially those inspired by ideologies such as nationalism—become possible through the formation of specific emotions, identities, and cognition. These elements and categories, when taken into language, acquire fluidity resulting from semantic and semiotic exchanges. Therefore, discourse analysis can help us understand them in specific cases. In order to emphasize the significance of unconsciousness in its interplay with mythical discourse, Lacanian psychoanalysis has been employed. Then,

***How to Cite:** Moshirzadeh, Homeira; and Sajad Minadi. (2023, Fall) "Myth-Based Discursive Formalism: A Theoretical Framework for Understanding Non-Realist Foreign Policies." *Faslnāmeḥ-ye siyāsāt (Politics Quarterly)* 53, 3: 569-595, <DOI: 10.22059.JPQ.2024.367059.1008133>.

Manuscript received: 21 October 2023; final revision received: 1 December 2023; accepted: 3 December 2023, published online: 16 December 2023



the limitations posed by the ideational structure of the international system comes into play to make changes in myth-based foreign policies inevitable and again the shift is not beyond the realms of possibility of mythical form of thought.

Mythical form of thought as a whole contains certain characteristics and categories that make unrealistic foreign policies possible. It does not distinguish between objective reality and most subjective experiences such as fantasies and dreams and between objects and their representations such as pictures or symbols. This can be seen in nationalist ideologies where national symbols are as important as the nation itself, and any disrespect for the representations of the nation and/or its representatives are taken as disrespect for the nation leading to emotional reactions. The overemphasis of mythological form of thought on causality makes whatever cannot be easily understood or explained by a specific tangible cause to be attributed to something the effect of which cannot be verified, for example, the conspiracy of others; hence adding to the common pessimism in international life leading to proneness to preventive measures. Parts and whole are not separable here. Therefore, every characteristic is taken to be essentially the same as the object. Thus, for example, in Nazism, being German/Aryan provides one with a superiority over others. The way in which similarities work result in over-generalizations that make, for example, the other an enemy.

As space is divided into holy and unholy/profane places and holy spaces cannot be disintegrated, the homeland or even beyond that may take a holiness that makes defending it not only legitimate but also a necessity. This may lead even to over-expansionist aspirations to include the holy spaces that are somehow in the hands of others as a mission that cannot be ignored. Perhaps the most significant example is the Zionist territorial expansionist ideal of a territory from the Nile to the Euphrates. Time in this form of thought is not linear; present is not distinguished from the past which is justified and even sanctified. Referring to the past in order to justify and legitimize specific actions in the present thus becomes common in foreign policies no matter how different they are.

If this form of thought exists in the cultural background of a society, mostly through the existence of particular myths, such as city upon a hill, the Russian World and the like, it can be unconsciously present in the cognition of everyone. When this mythical form of thinking becomes dominant, the agents of foreign policy reflect it in the form of narratives that have an unconscious dimension being explicable by psychoanalysis according to which the symbolic order, as the intersubjective relations, norms, rules, conventions and the like is the site of unconsciousness. The symbolic order which exists both at domestic and international levels imposes limitations upon actors. It is where the desire of the subject is formed and the real is perceived through the subject's desire. Yet both the subject and the symbolic order face the lack as the subject cannot actualize its desire and the symbolic order cannot provide the subject with fantasy. When the state as an international agent faces the limitations of the international structure, its foreign policy may change but again within the limits of mythical thought.

Consequently, a mythical state, on the basis of a predestined mission and a sanctified past becomes an exceptional state assuming that whatever it imagines can be achieved in one form or another. These elements together form an identity that makes unrealistic policy choices possible.

Keywords: Agent-structure, Foreign Policy Analysis, Myth-based Discursive Formalism, Unconscious, Unrealistic Foreign Policy

Declaration of conflicting interests

The authors declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

Funding

The authors received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

References

- Allison, Graham. (1985) *Shive'hā-ye tasmim'giri dar siyāsāt-e khārejī (Essence of Decision: Explaining the Cuban Missile Crisis)*, trans. Manouchehr Shojai. Tehran: Elmi-Farhangi. [in Persian]
- Archer, Margaret S. (1995) *Realist Social Theory: The Morphogenetic Approach*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Baily, Mark. (2020) "Cassirer, Fatalism and Political Myth: Historical Lessons in the Consequences of Pessimism for International Relations," in Tim Stevens, and Nicholas Michelsen, eds., *Pessimism in International Relations*. New York: Palgrave.
- Carlsnaes, Walter. (1992, September) "The Agency-Structure Problem in Foreign Policy Analysis," *International Studies Quarterly* 36, 3: 245-270, <DOI:10.2307/2600772>.
- Cassirer, Ernst. (2014) *Falsafeh-ye sorat'hā-ye sambolik, jeldeh dovom: andisheh-ye ostoreh'ī (The Philosophy of Symbolic Forms, V. 2: Mythical Thought)*, trans. Yadollah Moqen. Tehran: Hermes. [in Persian]
- Cassirer, Ernst. (1955) *The Philosophy of Symbolic Forms, Vol. I: Language*, trans. Ralph Manheim. New Haven & London: Yale University Press.
- Cottam, Martha. (1985) "The Impact of Psychological Images on International Bargaining: The Case of Mexican Natural Gas," *Political Psychology* 6, 3: 413-440, <DOI:10.2307/3791080>.
- Dessler, David. (1989, Summer) "What's at Stake in the Agent-Structure Debate?" *International Organization* 43, 3: 441-473, <DOI:10.1017/S0020818300032999>.
- Esmailpour Motlaq, Abolqassem. (2022) *Ostoreh, bayān-e namādin (Myths: The Symbolic Expressions)*. Tehran: Soroush. [in Persian]
- Evans, Dylan. (2007) *Farhang-e moghademāti-ye estelahāt-e ravānkāvi-ye lākāni (An Introductory Dictionary of Lacanian Psychoanalysis)*, trans. Mehdi Rafi and Mehdi Parsa. Tehran: Gam-e-No. [in Persian]
- "Fantasy," (2019) in *No Subject - Encyclopaedia of Psychoanalysis*. Available at: <https://nosubject.com/Fantasy#:~:text=The%20principal%20point%20for%20Lacan,in%20fulfilment%2C%20contentment%20or%20satisfaction> (Accessed 12 July 2023).

- George, Alexander L. (1969, June) "The 'Operational Code': A Neglected Approach to the Study of Political Leaders and Decision Making," *International Studies Quarterly* 13, 2: 190-222, <DOI:10.2307/3013944>.
- Herrmann, Richard K.; and Michael P. Fischerkeller. (1995, Summer) "Beyond the Enemy Image and the Spiral Model: Cognitive-Strategic Research after the Cold War," *International Organization* 49, 3: 415-450, <DOI:10.1017/S0020818300033336>.
- Hudson, Valerie M.; and Christopher S. Vore. (1995, October) "Foreign Policy Analysis Yesterday, Today and Tomorrow," *Mershon International Studies Review* 39, 2 suppl: 209-238, <DOI:10.2307/222751>.
- Hutchison, Emma. (2016) *Affective Communities in World Politics: Collective Emotions after Trauma*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Janis, Irving. (1972) *Victims of Groupthink: A Psychological Study of Foreign Policy Decisions and Fiascoes*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin.
- Jervis, Robert. (2019) *Dolat'mardān chegoneh fekr mi'konān (How Statesmen Think: The Psychology of International Politics)*, trans. Abbas Maleki, et al. Tehran: Allameh Tabataba'i University. [in Persian]
- Jervis, Robert. (1976) *Perception and Misperception in International Politics*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Kubalkova, Vandulka. (2013) *Siyāsāt-e khārejī dar jahān-e barsākhteh (Foreign Policy in a Constructed World)*, trans. Mehdi Mirmohammadi and Alireza Khosravi. Tehran: Pajoheshkadeh-ye motālē'āt rāhbordi. [in Persian]
- Lacan, Jacques. (1977) *Ecrits: A Selection*, trans. Alan Sheridan. London and New York: Routledge.
- Lacan, Jacques. (1998) *The Seminar of Jacques Lacan: The Four Fundamental Concepts of Psychoanalysis*, trans. Alan Sheridan. New York & London: W. W. Norton.
- Mearsheimer, John J. (2001) *The Tragedy of Great Power Politics*. New York: W. W. Norton.
- Milliken, Jennifer. (2006) "Motālē'h-ye goftemān dar ravābet-e bein'ol mellal: naghd va pajohesh va raveshteh (The Study of Discourse in International Relations: A Critique of Research and Methods)," trans. Homeira Moshirzadeh. *Pajohesh hoghogh va siyāsāt (Law and Politics Research)* 8: 209-253. Available at: https://qjpl.atu.ac.ir/article_2816.html (Accessed 1 October 2023). [in Persian]
- Morgenthau, Hans J. (1995) *Siyāsāt miān-e mellat'hā (Politics Among Nations)*, trans. Homeira Moshirzadeh. Tehran: IPIS. [in Persian]
- Onuf, Nicholas. (1989) *World of Our Making: Rules and Rule in Social Theory and International Relation*. Columbia: University of South Carolina Press.
- Sasley, Brent E. (2011) "Theorizing States' Emotions," *International Studies Review* 13, 3: 452-476, < DOI: 10.1111/j.1468-2486.2011.01049.x>.
- Shapiro, Michael J.; and G. Matthew Bonham. (1973) "Cognitive Process and Foreign Policy Decision-Making," *International Studies Quarterly* 17, 2: 147-174, <DOI:10.2307/2600226>.

- Schweller, Randall L. (1994) "Bandwagoning for Profit: Bringing the Revisionist State Back In," *International Security* 19, 1: 72-107, <DX.DOI:10.2307/2539149>.
- Schweller, Randall L. (2014) "China's Aspirations and the Clash of Nationalisms in East Asia: A Neoclassical Realist Examination," *International Journal of Korean Unification Studies* 23, 2: 1-40. Available at: <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/280239411> (Accessed 12 July 2023).
- Smith, Jason (2017). "Textual Analysis," in *The International Encyclopedia of Communication Research Methods*. Chichester: John Wiley & Sons, <DOI: 10.1002/9781118901731.iecrm0248>.
- Stavrakakis, Yannis. (2013) *Lācān va amr-e siyāsi (Lacan and the Political)*, trans. Mohammad Ali Jafari. Tehran: Ghoghnoos. [in Persian]
- Steele, Brent J. (2008). *Ontological Security in International Relations: Self-Identity and IR State*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Tetlock, Philip; and Charles McGuire. (1986) "Cognitive Perspectives on Foreign Policy," in Samuel Long, ed., *Political Behavior Annual*. Boulder CO: Westview Press, V. 1.
- Walker, Stephen; et al. (1998, March) "Systematic Procedures for Operational Code Analysis: Measuring and Modeling Jimmy Carter's Operational Code," *International Studies Quarterly* 42, 1: 175-190, <DOI:10.1111/0020-8833.00074>.
- Waltz, Kenneth. (1979) *Theory of International Politics*. New York: Random House.
- Wendt, Alexander. (2005) *Nazariyeh-e ejtemā'i siyāsāt-e bein'ol mellal (Social Theory of International Politics)*, trans. Homeira Moshirzadeh. Tehran: IPIS. [in Persian]
- Wendt, Alexander E. (2004) "The State as Person in International Theory," *Review of International Studies* 30: 289-316, <DOI: 10.1017/S0260210504006084>.
- Wendt, Alexander E. (1987) "The Agent-Structure Problem in International Relations Theory." *International Organization* 41, 3: 335-370, <DOI:10.1017/S002081830002751X>.
- Wivel, Anders. (2017) "Realism in Foreign Policy Analysis," *Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Politics*, <DOI:10.1093/acrefore/9780190228637.013.475>. Available at: <https://oxfordre.com/politics/display/10.1093/acrefore/9780190228637.001.0001?acrefore-80190228637-e-475>.
- Young, Michael D.; and Mark Schafer. (1998) "Is There Method in Our Madness? Ways of Assessing Cognition in International Relations," *Mershon International Studies Review* 42, 1: 63-96, <DOI:10.2307/254444>.



This article is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC-BY) license.



Research Paper

Continuity and Change in Russia-U.S. Relations during Putin's Fourth Term, 2018-2024

Alireza Noori *

Assistant Professor, Faculty of Economics and Political Science, Shahid Beheshti University, Tehran, Iran. Email: alirezanoi2@gmail.com

Abstract

The main purpose of the article is to examine the reasons of change and continuity in Russia-U.S. Relations during Putin's fourth term, 2018-2024. After the collapse of the Soviet Union, these relations have been characterized by various fluctuations, including enthusiasm about promoting mutual understanding and collaboration during the dominance of the Euro-Atlantic discourse in the early 1990s, and the heightened tension during the realist discourse led by Putin. The U.S.-Russia relations have been deteriorating as a consequence of the uncertainties and insecurity which have increased due to the international order transition. The 2022 Russo-Ukrainian War, as the greatest challenge in the relations between the United States and Russia in the post-Soviet period, is a clear manifestation of the gloomy situation. Russia considers this conflict to be a proxy war which is only part of the broader U.S. grand strategy to limit Russia's geopolitical influence by lessening its strategic depth. The West's support for Ukraine is viewed as a continuation of Washington's previous attempts—including inciting the color revolutions in the post-Soviet space, gradually infiltrating the Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS), interfering in Russia's internal affairs, supporting the war in Yugoslavia, NATO's Eastward Expansion, and the establishment of an anti-missile shield — aimed at containing Russia without resorting to direct confrontation. On the other hand, American policymakers who seek to maintain U.S. supremacy in the international system, view Putin's Russia as a challenging and destructive actor that has improved its international position and has been trying to change the regional and global balance of power to the detriment of Washington by acting as a revisionist force, individually or collectively in collaboration with other members of the international revisionist front. In this context, the U.S. has adopted the strategy of '*broad offensive*'

***How to Cite:** Noori, Alireza. (2023, Fall) "Change and Continuity in Russia – U.S. Relations during Putin's Fourth Term, 2018-2024," *Faslnāmeḥ-ye siyāsāt (Politics Quarterly)* 53, 3: 597-624, <DOI:10.22059/JPQ.2024.362298.1008087>.

Manuscript received: 15 July 2023; final revision received: 20 November 2023; accepted: 3 December 2023, published online: 16 December 2023



deterrence' (BOD) against Russia. Out of an abundance of caution, Moscow is pursuing the strategy of '*active offensive defense*' (AOD) in the hope of reviving and strengthening its great power position. The adoption of these two competing strategies has intensified tension in the bilateral Russia-U.S. relations, and have had repercussions for other states.

The author tries to answer the following research questions: 1. What are the causes of the persistence of conflict and tension in the U.S.-Russia relations? 2. How has the confrontation between the two strategies of '*broad offensive deterrence*' (BOD) of the United States and '*active offensive defense*' (AOD) of Russia led to the escalation of tension in their bilateral relations? Using the theoretical framework of neoclassical realism, the analysis is focused on three inexorable variables (i.e., geopolitical power competition, security, and political culture) in order to find conclusive answers to the two questions. In the research hypothesis, it is argued that the persistence of tension in the U.S.-Russian relations is caused by three tension-generating variables of geopolitical power competition, security, and political culture. The method of qualitative textual analysis of the official documents and previous works on the subject revealed the impact of these variables on the nature of the relations between the two rival powers. The findings show that transformative variables (e.g., the circulation of the elites) had a positive effect on the bilateral relations between the United States and Russia in the short term, but the three above-mentioned factors have caused tension to prevail.

However, Russia and the U.S. will probably continue their cooperation in three issue-areas: 1. Maintaining security and strategic stability in the international system as manifested in their support for the nuclear non-proliferation regime; 2. Confronting certain destabilizing regional challenges, particularly in the Middle East and the CIS; and 3. Dealing with asymmetric security threats such as international terrorism and cyber security. Nevertheless, the failure of the conciliatory approach and the perceived NATO-U.S. belligerent approach to Russia (including the "Reset" project), as well as the continual U.S. aggressive actions against Russian national interest have deepened their mutual mistrust. This perception of the U.S. intentions has been strengthened in Putin's third and fourth terms; and the Kremlin continue to believe inactions, restraint, and disengagement in response to the U.S. actions will not lead to a mutually-advantageous balanced relations. Russian leaders are concerned that a flexible and appeasing attitude towards the U.S. might result in increasing use of coercive and aggressive foreign policy instruments by Washington. This perception has forced Russia to adopt a posture of resistance and the strategy of '*extensive aggressive defense*' against the U.S. It is expected to see the continuation of the tense bilateral relations and the situation of mutual mistrust between the two great powers in the medium term.

Keywords: Geopolitics, Neoclassical Realism, Political Culture, Russia-U.S. Relations, Security

Declaration of conflicting interests

The author declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

Funding

The author received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

References

- Alvand, Marzieh Sadat; and Maryam Sadat Hosseini. (2019) "Tahlil-e siyāsat-e khāreji-ye tahājomi/konesh'garāyāneh-ye arabestān-e suodi az manzar-e vāgheh'garāi-ye no'kelāsik (Analysis of Offensive/Reactionary Foreign Policy of Saudi Arabia from the Perspective of Neoclassical Realism), 2010-2020," *Fasl'nāmeḥ-ye motālē'āt-e bonyādin- va kārbordi-ye jahān-e eslām (Journal of Islamic World Basic and Applied Studies)* 2, 6: 1-24. Available at: https://journal.iwfs.com/article_130903.html. [in Persian]
- Andermo, Erik; and Martin Krāgh. (2021) "Sanctions and Dollar Dependency in Russia: Resilience, Vulnerability, and Financial Integration," *Post-Soviet Affairs* 37, 3: 276-301, <DOI:10.1080/1060586X.2021.1913932>.
- Антонов, Анатолий (Antonov, Anatoly). (2023) "Не уступка, не реверанс, но необходимость. Сотрудничество России и США в ядерном нераспространении (Not a Concession, not a Curtsey, but a Necessity. Cooperation between Russia and the U.S. in Nuclear Nonproliferation)," *Россия в глобальной политике (Russia in Global Affairs)* 2, 20: 220-222, <DOI: 10.31278/1810-6439-2023-21-2-220 - 222>. [in Russian]
- Bunn, Matthew. (2021) "US-Russian Cooperation to Improve Security for Nuclear Weapons and Materials," in Sarah Bidgood and William C. Potter, eds. *End of an Era: The United States, Russia, and Nuclear Nonproliferation*. Monterey, CA: James Martin Center for Nonproliferation Studies. Available at: https://nonproliferation.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/08/end-of-an-era-the-united-states-russia-and-nuclear-nonproliferation__potter_bidgood_book.pdf (Accessed 23 May 2023).
- "Concept of Foreign Policy of the Russian Federation (Концепция Внешней Политики Российской Федерации)," (2023) Администрация Президента России (Administration of the President of Russia). Available at: <https://www.mid.ru/ru/detail-material-page/1860586> (Accessed 18 March 2023). [in Russian]
- Dueck, Colin. (2005) "Realism, Culture and Grand Strategy: Explaining America's Peculiar Path to World Power," *Security Studies* 14, 2: 195-231, <DOI:10.1080/09636410500232891>.

- "The Foreign Ministry has Published Russia's Reaction to the US Response on Security Guarantees (МИД обнародовал реакцию России на ответ США по гарантиям безопасности)," (2022, Февраля 18) *РИА Новости (RIA Novosti)*. Available at: https://ria.ru/20220218/v_otvet-1773474632.html (Accessed 18 March 2023). [in Russian]
- Gvalia, Giorgi, et al. (2019) "Neoclassical Realism and Small States: Systemic Constraints and Domestic Filters in Georgia's Foreign Policy," *East European Politics* 35, 1: 21-51, <DOI:10.1080/21599165.2019.1581066>.
- He, Kai. (2010) "The Hegemon's Choice between Power and Security: Explaining US Policy toward Asia after the Cold War," *Review of International Studies* 36, 4: 1121-1143. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/40961973> (Accessed 21 May 2023).
- Khlorov, Oleg A. (Хлопов А., Олег) (2023) "Отношения России с Западом в Условиях Формирования Справедливой Системы Международных Связей (Russia's relations with the West in the Conditions of Forming a Fair System of International Relations)," *Общество: политика, экономика, право (Society: Politics, Economics, Law)* 3: 28-33. Available at: <https://disk.yandex.ru/i/Y1zkDOOD8EGlg> (Accessed 9 June 2023). [in Russian]
- Klimentov, Vassily A. (2020) "Russia and America. The Asymmetric Rivalry," *Europe-Asia Studies* 72, 10: 1769-1770, <DOI:10.1080/09668136.2020.1834779>.
- Kosov, A. P. (Косов А. П.) (2023) "Development of Russia-U.S. Relations in the Post-Bipolar World: Position of the Communist Party of the Russian Federation (Развитие Российско-Американских Отношений в Постбиполярном Мире: Позиция Кпрф)," *Greater Eurasia: Development, Security, Cooperation (Большая Евразия: развитие, безопасность, сотрудничество)* 6, 1: 193-199. Available at: <http://ukros.ru/archives/33941> (Accessed 17 June 2023). [in Russian]
- Kuchins, Andrew C. (2018) "What is Eurasia to US (the U.S.);" *Journal of Eurasian Studies* 9, 2: 125-133, <DOI:10.1016/j.euras.2018.07.001>.
- "Lavrov: The USA and NATO Want Victory over Russia "on the Battlefield" to Destroy our Country (Лавров: США и НАТО хотят победы над Россией "на поле боя" для уничтожения нашей страны)," (2022, Декабря, 27) *TACC (TASS)*. Available at: <https://tass.ru/politika/16694843> (Accessed 4 February 2023). [in Russian]
- Magcamit, Michael. (2020) "The Duterte Method: A Neoclassical Realist Guide to Understanding a Small Power's Foreign Policy and Strategic Behavior in the Asia-Pacific," *Asian Journal of Comparative Politics* 5, 4: 416-436, <DOI:10.1177/2057891119882769>.
- Mazarr, Michael J., et al. (2016) *Understanding the Current International Order*. Santa Monica, CA: RAND Corporation. https://www.rand.org/pubs/research_reports/RR1598.html (Accessed 21 May 2023).

- Meibauer, Gustav, et al. (2021) "Forum: Rethinking Neoclassical Realism at Theory's End," *International Studies Review* 23, 1: 268-295, <DOI: 10.1093/isr/viaa018>.
- "National Security Strategy of the Russian Federation (Стратегия национальной безопасности Российской Федерации)," (2021) *Администрация Президента России (Administration of the President of Russia)*. Available at: <http://www.kremlin.ru/acts/bank/47046> [in Russian]
- Niyakoi, Amir; and Asgar Safari. (2016) "Rāhbord'hā-ye hastei-ye motefāvet-e Īrān; tabeini az daricheh-ye vāgheh'garāi-ye no'kelāsik (Iran's Distinctive Nuclear Strategies; An Explanation through the Lens of Neoclassical Realism)," *Faslnāmeḥ-ye motāleāt-e Jahān (World Studies Quarterly)* 6, 2: 85-122, <DOI:10.22124/wp.2017.2486>. [in Persian]
- Nouri, Alireza. (2021, Fall-Winter) "Māhiyat-e tajdid'nazar'talabi-ye rosiyeh va chin; siyāsāt va manafeh-ye Īrān (The Nature of Russian and Chinese Revisionism; Iran's Politics and Interests)," *Du'fasl'nāmeḥ-ye motāleāt-e orāsiyā-ye markazī (Journal of Central Eurasia Studies)* 14, 2: 379-396, <DOI:10.22059/jcep.2021.328326.450023>. [in Persian]
- Nouri, Alireza. (2021, Winter) "Rosiyeh va nazm-e dar hāl-e taghir-e bein'ol mellali; roy'kard v amal'kard (Russia and the Changing International Order; Approach and Performance)," *Faslnāmeḥ-ye motāleāt-e Jahān (World Studies Quarterly)* 11, 4: 36-7, <DOI:10.22124/wp.2022.22997.3081>. [in Persian]
- Noori, Ali Reza, and Heidarali Masoudi. (2022) "Re-Focusing on Iran-Russia Cooperation in the Syrian Crisis; A 'Broader' Strategic Stability on Agenda," *Geopolitics Quarterly* 17, 4: 156-185. Available at: <https://dori.net/dor/20.1001.1.17354331.1400.17.64.7.4> (Accessed 21 May 2023).
- Özşahin, Mustafa Cüneyt, et al. (2022) "China-Turkey Relations from the Perspective of Neoclassical Realism," *Contemporary Review of the Middle East* 9, 2: 218-239, <DOI:10.1177/23477989211062659>.
- "Patrushev Called the Events in Ukraine a Military Confrontation between NATO and Russia (Патрушев назвал события на Украине военным противостоянием НАТО с Россией)," (2023, Января 9) *Интерфакса*. Available at: <https://www.interfax.ru/russia/879960> (Accessed 4 February 2023). [in Russian]
- "Putin Said that the West Started the War in Ukraine, Not Russia (Путин Заявил, Что Запад Начал Войну на Украине, а не Россия)," (Февраля 21, 2023) *Газета.ru (Gazeta.ru)*. Available at: <https://www.gazeta.ru/business/news/2023/05/16/20441252.shtml> (Accessed 28 February 2023). [in Russian]
- "Putin: the Goal of Western Countries is to Eliminate Russia (Путин: цель стран Запада — ликвидировать Россию)," (февраля 26, 2023) *ТВ-Новости (russian.rt.com)*. Available at: <https://russian.rt.com/world/news/1116055-putin-zapad-cel> (Accessed 12 March 2023). [in Russian]

- Rathbun, Brian. (2008) "A Rose by Any Other Name: Neoclassical Realism as the Logical and Necessary Extension of Structural Realism," *Security Studies* 17, 2: 294–321, <DOI:10.1080/09636410802098917>.
- Rose, Gideon. (1998) "Neoclassical Realism and Theories of Foreign Policy," *World Politics* 51, 1: 144-172. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/25054068> (Accessed 21 May 2023).
- Ryan, Missy; and Annabelle Timsit. (2022, April 25) "U.S. Wants Russian Military 'Weakened' from Ukraine Invasion, Austin Says," *Washington Post*. Available at: <https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/2022/04/25/russia-weakened-lloyd-austin-ukraine-visit/> (Accessed 15 February 2023).
- Samsonov, Alexander (Самсонов, Александр). (2014, Марта 21) "Стратегия национальной безопасности Российской Федерации (Цель проекта «Украина» —разрушение русского мира)," *Русский мир. Украина* (Russian World. Ukraine). Available at <http://rusmir.info/pol/5203-cel-razrushenie-russkogo-mira.html> (Accessed 12 March 2023). [in Russian]
- Sanger, David E.; and Anton Troianovski. (March 18, 2021) "Biden and Putin Agree to Extend Nuclear Treaty," *New York Times*. Available at: <https://www.nytimes.com/2021/01/26/world/europe/biden-putin-nuclear-treaty.html> (Accessed 19 June 2023).
- Saradzhyan, Simon; and William Tobey. (2017) "US-Russian Space Cooperation: A Model for Nuclear Security," *Bulletin of the Atomic Scientists*. Available at: <https://thebulletin.org/2017/03/us-russian-space-cooperation-a-model-for-nuclear-security/> (Accessed 07 January 2023).
- Schweller, Randall. (2003) "The Progressiveness of Neoclassical Realism" in Colin Elman and Miriam Fendius Elman, eds. *Progress in International Relations Theory: Appraising the Field*. Cambridge: The MIT Press, 311-348, <DOI:10.7551/mitpress/5627.003.0012>.
- Sheehan, Michael. (1989) "The Place of the Balancer in Balance of Power Theory," *Review of International Studies* 15: 123-134, <DOI:10.1017/S0260210500112963>.
- Stent, Angela. (2012) "US–Russia Relations in the Second Obama Administration," *Survival* 54, 6: 123-138, <DOI:10.1080/00396338.2012.749635>.
- Tabeh Afshar, Sanaz; and Kehan Barzegar. (2015) "Vāgheh'garāi-ye no'kelāsik va siyāsāt-e khāreji-ye amrika: tahlili Nazari bar fahm-e siyāsāt-e khāreji-ye ayālāt-e motahedeh (Neoclassical Realism and U.S. Foreign Policy; A Theoretical Analysis of the Understanding of U.S. Foreign Policy)," *Fasl'nāmeḥ-ye rahyāft'hā-ye siyāsī va bein'ol mellali* (*Journal of Political and International Approaches*) 8, 1: 42-70. Available at: https://piaj.sbu.ac.ir/article_99476.html. [in Persian]
- Taliaferro, Jeffrey W. (2006) "State Building for Future Wars: Neoclassical Realism and the Resource-Extractive State," *Security Studies* 15, 3: 464-495, <DOI:10.1080/09636410601028370>.
- "This is a Matter of Life and Death. Putin Explained Why Russia Launched a Military Operation (Это вопрос жизни и смерти. Путин объяснил,

- почему Россия начала военную операцию),” (2022, Февраля 24) *Вестн.Ру (Vesti.Ru)*. Available at: <https://www.vesti.ru/article/2681632> (Accessed 13 February 2023). [in Russian]
- Trenin, Dmitry (Тренин, Дмитрий). (2013, Мая 30) "Четвертый вектор Владимира Путина (Vladimir Putin's Fourth Vector)," *Россия в глобальной политике (Russia in Global Politics)*. Available at: <http://www.globalaffairs.ru/number/Chetvertyi-vektor-Vladimira-Putina--15992> (Accessed 4 June 2023). [in Russian]
- Tyler, Patrick E. (March 8, 1992) "U.S. Strategy Plan Calls for Ensuring No Rivals Develop," *New York Times*. Available at: <https://www.nytimes.com/1992/03/08/world/us-strategy-plan-calls-for-insuring-no-rivals-develop.html> (Accessed 24 June 2023).
- The White House. (2022) *U.S. National Security Strategy*. Available at: <https://www.whitehouse.gov/wp-content/uploads/2022/10/Biden-Harris-Administrations-National-Security-Strategy-10.2022.pdf> (Accessed 12 December 2023).
- The White House. (2021, February 19) "Remarks by President Biden at the 2021 Virtual Munich Security Conference," *whitehouse.gov*. Available at: <https://www.whitehouse.gov/briefing-room/speeches-remarks/2021/02/19/remarks-by-president-biden-at-the-2021-virtual-munich-security-conference> (Accessed 11 February 2023).



This article is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC-BY) license.