

---

*Politics Quarterly*  
Journal of the Faculty of Law & Political Science

Volume 53, Issue 4, Winter 2024

**Abstracts and References in English**

---



## Table of Contents

*Fasl' nāmeḥ-ye siyāsāt (Politics Quarterly) 53, 4 (Winter 2024): 625-838*

Authors	Title	Pages
Abadian, Hossein; Saman Rahmani	The Political-Social Consequences of Foreign Capital and Externalization of the Gilan's Economy in the Qajar Era	625-650
Eslami, Rohola; Elahe Valizadeh	Ideological Apparatus in Iran's Education Policy	651-679
Shafiee, Nozar	The Zero-Sum Game: An Analysis of India-Pakistan Rivalry in the South Caucasus	681-707
Qajar, Sona	Roots of the "Subject" in Genetic Structuralism	709-735
Kazemi, Hojjat; Sajjad Ahmadian	Max Weber and the Organizational-Economic Foundations of the Rise of the 'Vocational Politician	737-760
Lotfian, Saideh; Mohammad Baratian	The People-Centered Public Security and Good Security Governance: Lesson Learning for Policy Recommendations	761-790
Momeni, Farshad; Seyed Mohsen Alavimanesh	Religion, Law and Development: Studying the Performance of Forty Years of Iran's Legislative System, 1980-2020	791-817
Nazari, Ali Ashraf; Seyed Masoud Azarfam	The Concept of Legitimacy and Its Place in the Debate between Schmitt, Löwith and Blumenberg on Modernity	819-838



Research Paper

## The Political-Social Consequences of Foreign Capital and Externalization of the Gilan's Economy in the Qajar Era

Hossein Abadian<sup>1\*</sup>, Saman Rahmani<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Corresponding Author: Professor, Department of History, Faculty of Literature and Humanities, Imam Khomeini International University, Qazvin, Iran. Email: [abadian@hum.ikiu.ac.ir](mailto:abadian@hum.ikiu.ac.ir)

<sup>2</sup> A PhD Candidate in Political Science, Department of Political Science, Faculty of Law & Political Science, University of Tehran, Iran. Email: [saman.rahmany@ut.ac.ir](mailto:saman.rahmany@ut.ac.ir)

### Abstract

During the industrial revolution in Europe, foreign investors and businessmen were drawn to the numerous business opportunities of Gilan, which subsequently became one of the first regions in Iran to begin the process of integration into the global economy. Indeed, this northern territory bordering the Caspian Sea attracted foreign investment in the economic sectors of fisheries, industry, agriculture and oil, particularly in the second half of the Qajar era. The trade routes of Gilan had been among the main highways for the importation of new consumer goods, and accordingly the customs authorities in Astara and Anzali played a unique role in the country's international trade. However, due to the weakness of the Iranian government that ultimately led to the fall of the Qajar Dynasty, this accumulation of capital in Gilan led to the expansion of the power and influence of this province in relation to the central government; and to some extent, it gained more autonomy from the national economy. The two research questions to be answered are: a) What was the nature of the process of economic externalization in Gilan in the late Qajar period? and b) What were the implications of this economic externalization for the social and political conditions of Gilan in the late Qajar period? In the research hypothesis, it is argued that the foreign capital injection into the economy of Gilan gradually led to its dependency on the global economy and

**\*How to Cite:** Abadian, Hossein; and Saman Rahmani. (2024, Winter) "The Political-Social Consequences of Foreign Capital and Externalization of the Gilan's Economy in the Qajar Era," *Fasl' nāmeḥ-ye siyāsāt (Politics Quarterly)* 53, 4: 625-650, <DOI:10.22059/JPQ.2024.366360.1008122>.

Manuscript received: 8 October 2023; final revision received: 28 February 2024; accepted: 11 March 2024; published online: 12 March 2024



concurrently helped it to gain relative economic independence from the national economy which in turn weakened the political influence of the central government over the local economic players. Data is collected by the use of the method of qualitative thematic analysis of historical records and documents in addition to exploring the findings of previous research on the subject. As the last decades of Qajar rule approached, Gilan was well on the threshold of becoming an industrialized province with more economic independence from the government in Tehran, due to the direct ties established between foreign investors and a score of Gilan's merchants and upper-class businessmen who no longer needed to be supported by the central government.

The authors' theoretical framework is based on Eric Wolf's study of the peasant revolts in the 20th century. His main argument is that the peasant revolts had occurred in the situations where the local economy-global economy linkage had resulted in the relative strengthening of the villagers and the creation of a large middle-class and wealthy peasants. At the same time, this linkage has led to the foreign powers' support for the 'rebel' region and consequently to the weakening of the central government's hold on that region. In the conclusion, it is stated that the foreign investors, notably Russia, created the economic dependency of merchants, peasants and artisans of Gilan by importing capital goods, establishing several factories and commercial offices, purchasing fertile land from the local. Russia also provided extensive military support for its loyal local allies in Gilan, and thus the central government's power in this province was severely weakened politically and militarily. As a result, the groundwork was put in place for the activities of opposition forces in Gilan in the period of 1905-1925.

**Keywords:** Capital Goods, Extroversion, Foreign Investment, Global Division of Labor, National Economy

#### **Declaration of conflicting interests**

The authors declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article. They confirm being the contributors of this work and have approved it for publication.

#### **Funding**

The authors received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

#### **References**

- Abbott, William J. (1996) "Tejārat va manāfeh-ye gilān dar sāl-e 1869 (Trade and Interest of Gilan in 1869)," trans. Ahmad Saif, *Tārikh-e mo'āser Irān (Contemporary History of Iran)*, Vol 10. Tehran: Institute of Cultural Research and Studies of the Mostafazahān Foundation of the Islamic Revolution. [in Persian]
- Abdollahyov, Fathallah. (1982) *Rostāiyān-e Irān dar avākher-e qājārieh (Iran's Villagers in the Late Qajar Period, A Collection of Articles on*

- Agrarian and Peasant Issues*), trans. Marina Kazemzadeh. Tehran: Āgāh. [in Persian]
- Abrahamian, Ervand. (2021) *Maghālāti dar jāme'eh'shenāsi siāsi Īrān (Essays in Iran's Political Sociology)*, trans. Soheila Torabi Farsi. Tehran: Shirāzeh Ketāb Mā. [in Persian]
- Alavi, Hamza. (1973) "Peasant Classes and Primordial Loyalties," *The Journal of Peasant Studies* 1, 1: 23-62, <DOI:10.1080/03066157308437871>.
- Alavi, Seyyed Abolhasan. (2006) *Rejāl-e asr-e mashroteh (Elites of the Constitutional Age)*. Tehran: Asātir. [in Persian]
- Ashraf, Ahmed. (1980) *Mavāne'-e tārikhi-ye roshd-e sarmāyeh'dāri dar Īrān-e doreh-ye qajāriyeh (Historical Obstacles of the Growth of Capitalism in Iran in the Qājār Era)*. Tehran: Zamineh. [in Persian]
- Azimi Dobakhshari, Nasser. (2012) *Tārikh-e tahavolāt-e ejtemā'i va eghtesādi-ye gilān (History of Social and Economic Developments in Gilan)*. Rasht: Gilakān. [in Persian]
- Behzadi, Mohammad Reza; and Reza Kasravi. (2019) *Ahd'nāmeḥ-ye golestān va torkmanchāy, matn-e kāmel-e ahd'nāmeḥ'hā az roy-e ārshiv-e vezārat-e khārejeh-ye rosieh (Treaty of Golestan and Turkmanchai, the Full Text of the Treaties from the Archives of Russia's Ministry of Foreign Affairs)*. Tehran: Parandeh. [in Persian]
- Benjamin Greene Wheeler, Samuel. (1990) *Īrān va Īrāniyān-e asr-e nāser al-dīn shāh (Persia and the Persians in Qajar Era)*, trans. Mohammad Hossein Kordbacheh. Tehran: Jāvidān. [in Persian]
- Chodźko, Alexander. (1975) *Sarzamin-e gilān (The Land of Gilan)*, trans. Siros Sahami. Tehran: Payām. [in Persian]
- Curzon, George Nathaniel. (1990) *Īrān va qaziyeh-e Īrān (Persia and the Persian Question)*, trans. Vahid Mazandarani. Tehran: Elmi farhangi, Vols. 1-2. [in Persian]
- D'allemagne, Henry-René. (1956) *Du Khorassan au pays des Backhtiaris: Trois mois de Voyage en Perse (From Khorasan to the Land of the Backhtiaris: Three Months of Travel in Persia)*, trans. Ali Mohammad Farahvoshi. Tehran: Amir Kabir. [in Persian]
- "Detailed Documents of the Fifth Majles-e shorā-ye eslāmi, Session 154: April 1925 and Session 105: 29 November 1925 and Session 103: 1 January 1926," CD-ROM of Internal Documents of the 24<sup>th</sup> Session of the Islamic Consultative Assembly (*lib.majles.ir*). Available at: Majles Digital Library, <https://lib.majles.ir/parvan/home> [in Persian]
- "Document No. 16345/296, Ivanovski's Letter to Monajem'bāshi," (n.d.) Department of Non-book Document Collection, National Library and Records Organization of Iran (*opac.nlai.ir*). Available at: <http://opac.nlai.ir/opac-prod/search/searchDF.do> (Accessed 17 April 2023). [in Persian]
- Document No: 12791-0-N," (n.d.) Bā kārvan tārikh (sanad), the Digital Exhibition of Documents of the Institute of Contemporary History of Iran (*iichs.org*). Available at: <http://www.iichs.org> (Accessed 17 April 2023). [in Persian]

- "Document No: 14-127-40M," (n.d.) Bā kārvan tārikh (sanad), Digital Exhibition of Documents of the Institute of Contemporary History of Iran (*iichs.org*). Available at: <http://www.iichs.org> [in Persian]
- Documents of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MFA). (2001) "Document No. 89: 213," "Document No. 97: 237," "Document No. 105: 252," "Document No. 123: 281," *Documents on Iran-Russia Relations from Naser al-Din Shah Era to the Fall of the Qajar Dynasty*, ed., Fatemeh Ghaziha. Tehran: MFA. [in Persian]
- Entner, Marvin L. (1990) *Russo-Persian Commercial Relations, 1828-1914*, trans. Ahmad Tavakoli. Tehran: Afshar Endowment. [in Persian]
- Fakhraei, Ibrahim. (1992) *Gilān dar jonbesh-e mashrotiyāt (Gilan in the Constitutional Movement)*. Tehran: Enghelāb-e Eslāmi, 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. [in Persian]
- Fakhteh-jobneh, Ghorban. (1992) "Ozāe '-e siyāsi, ejtemā'ī va eghtesādi-ye gilān dar āstāneh-ye enghelāb-e mashrotiyāt (Political, Social and Economic Conditions of Gilan on the Eve of the Constitutional Revolution)," *Gilān 'nāmeḥ (Gilan Letter)*. Rasht: Tā'ati, Vol. 3. [in Persian]
- Ferguson, Frances D. (1976, January) "Rural/Urban Relations and Peasant Radicalism: A Preliminary Statement," *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 18, 1: 106-118, <DOI:10.1017/S0010417500008100>.
- "File Folder 108-102:1302," (n.d.) *Majmoe' h-ye scan-e asnād-e dijitāli (Digital Scanned Documents Collection)*. Tehran: Political Studies and Research Institute. Available at: <https://psri.ir> (Accessed 17 April 2023). [in Persian]
- Foran, John. (2010) *Moghāvemāt-e shekanandehm tārikh-e tahavolāt-e ejtemā'ī-ye Īrān az 1500 (Fragile Resistance: Social Transformation in Iran from 1500 to the Revolution)*, trans. Ahmad Tadayan. Tehran: Rasā. [in Persian]
- Hasannejad, Zamane. (2019) "Ravābet-e bāzār'hā-ye shomāl-e Īrān bā bāzār'hā-ye tezāri dar doreh-ye safavi va Qājār (The Relationships between Northern Iranian Markets and Imperial Markets in the Qajar Era)," *Tārikh-e andish (History of Thought)* 1, 4: 52-39. Available at: <https://www.noormags.ir/view/fa/articlepage/1498092> (Accessed 18 April 2023). [in Persian]
- Issawi, Charles. (1990) *Tārikh-e eghtesādi-ye Īrān (Iran's Economic History)*, trans. Yaqob Azhand. Tehran: Gostareh. [in Persian]
- . (1999, Fall) "Nofoz-e eghtesādi-ye oropā va eghtesād-e Īrān dar āstāneh-ye mashrotiyāt, 1872-1921 (Economic Influence of Europe and Iran's Economy on the Threshold of Constitutionalism 1921-1872)," trans. Nader Mir Saidi, *Fasl' nāmeḥ-ye tārikh-e mo'āser-e Īrān (Iran's Contemporary History)* 3, 11: 69-94. Available at: <https://www.noormags.ir/view/fa/articlepage/418114> [in Persian]
- Jamalzadeh, Mohammad Ali. (1956) *Ganj-e Shāyḡān: ozae' eghtesādi-ye Īrān (Ganj-e Shaygan: Iran's Economic Situation)*. Tehran: Kāveh. [in Persian]

- Karimi Gilayeh, Yasser. (2020) *Taa 'moli yek gharn siyāsāt va eghtesād (A Reflection of Century of Politics and Economy in Gilan)*. Tehran: Givā. [in Persian]
- Katouzian, Mohammad Ali Homayoun. (1995) *Eghtesād-e siyāsi-ye Īrān (The Political Economy of Modern Iran)*, trans. Mohammad Reza Nafisi and Kambiz Azizi. Tehran: Markaz. [in Persian]
- Kazembeigi, Mohammad Ali. (2019) *Ravābet-e eghtesādi-ye Īrān va rosiyeh az āghāz tā soḡhot-e qājārieh (Iran-Russian Economic Relations from the Beginning to the Fall of Qajar)*. Tehran: Ministry of Foreign Affairs [in Persian]
- Khalilifar, Samaneh. (2018) "Nahād'hā-ye eghtesādi-ye rasht dar doreh-ye safavi va Qājār (Economic Institutions of Rasht in the Safavid and Qajar Periods)," *Nashriyeh-ye Tārikh'Andish (Journal of Historical Thinking)* 1, 2: 112-99. Available at: <https://www.noormags.ir/view/fa/articlepage/1497800> (Accessed 18 April 2023). [in Persian]
- Kulagina, Ludmila Mikhailovna. (1980) *Estilā-ye empriālism bar Īrān va tabdil-e in keshvar beh nimeh'mostamereh (The Conquest of Iran by Imperialism and the Transformation of This Country into a Semi-Colony)*, trans. Siros Yazidi. Tehran: Elm. [in Persian]
- Leitten, Wilhelm. (1988) *Īrān Az nofoz-e mosālemat'āميز tā taht'olhemāyategi: asnād va haghāyegh-e darbāreh-ye tārikh-e nofoz-e oropāin dar Īrān (Iran from Peaceful Influence to Protectorate: Documents and Facts about the History of European Influence in Iran 1860-1919)*, trans. Maryam Mirahmadi. Tehran: Moin. [in Persian]
- McDaniel, Robert A. (1971) "Economic Change and Economic Resiliency in 19th Century Persia," *Iranian Studies* 4, 1: 36-49, <DOI:10.1080/00210867108701407>.
- Migdal, Joel S. (1974) *Peasant, Politics and Revolution: Pressures Toward Political and Social Change in the Third World*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Millspaugh, Arthur Chester. (1977) *Mamoriyāt-e āmrikāi'hā dar Īrān (American Mission in Iran)*, trans. Hossein Abotarabian. Tehran: Payām. [in Persian]
- Motazed, Khosrow. (1987) *Haj Amin al-Zarb, tārikh-e sarmāyeh'gozāri-ye san'ati dar Īrān (Haj Amin al-Zarb, History of Industrial Investment in Iran)*. Tehran: Jamālzādeh. [in Persian]
- Nadi, Zahra, et al. (2018, January) "Roshd-e monāsebāt-e arbābi va tasir ān bar zendegi-ye keshāvarzān dar doreh-ye Qājār (The Growth of Landowner Relations and its Impact on the Life of Farmers during the Qajar Era, with an Emphasis on Northern Provinces of Iran)," *Nashriyeh-e pajohesh'hā-ye tārikhi (Journal of Historical Research)* 9, 4: 277-292, <DOI:10.22108/jhr.2017.83592>.
- Neshat, Guity. (1981, Winter-Spring) "From Bazaar to Market: Foreign Trade and Economic Development in Nineteenth-Century Iran," *Iranian Studies* 4, 1-2: 53-85. Available at: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/4310353> (Accessed 4 November 2023).
- Nikitin, Basil. (1977) *Memoirs and Travelogues*, trans. Ali Mohammad Farahoshi. Tehran: Ma'rif, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. [in Persian]



- Noshirvani, Seyed Vahid. (1982) *Sar'āghāz-e tejāri'shodan-e keshāvarzi dar Īrān (The Beginning of the Commercialization of Agriculture in Iran, in the Collection of Articles on Agricultural and Peasant)*. Tehran: Agāh. [in Persian]
- Orsolle, Ernest. (2003) *Le Caucase et la Perse*, trans. Ali Asghar Saidi. Tehran: Research Institute of Humanities and Cultural Studies. [in Persian]
- Owen, Eugene. (1983) *Iran Today*, trans. Ali Asghar Saidi. Tehran: Naqsh-e Jahān. [in Persian]
- Pavlovich, Mikhail, et al. (1978) *Ce maghāleh darbāreh-ye enqelāb-e mashroteh-ye Īrān (Three Essays on Iran's Constitutional Revolution)*, trans. Maziar Hoshiar. Tehran: Amir Kabir. [in Persian]
- Pourmohammadi Amlashi, Nasrallah. (2007) "Negareshi jāme'eh'shenākhti b josnesh'hā-ye rostāi-ye gilān dar asr-e mashroteh (A Sociological Approach to the Rural Movements of Gilan in the Constitutional Era)," *Fasl-nāme-ye tārikh (History Quarterly)*, Mahalat University, 2, 7: 51-71. Available at: <https://ensani.ir/fa/article/9726> (Accessed 17 April 2023). [in Persian]
- Rabino, Hyacinth Louis. (1987) *Velāyat-e dār'ol-marz-e Īrān, gilān (Dārolmarz Provinces of Iran, Gilan)*, trans. Jafar Khammamizadeh. Rasht: Tāa'ti. [in Persian]
- Shormij, Mohammad. (2019) "Naghsheh avāmel-e eghtesādi dar shekl'giri-ye jonbesh-e mashroteh-ye gilān (The Role of Economic Factors in the Formation of the Gilan Constitutional Movement, During 1911-1948 Period)," *Pajohesh'hā-ye tarikhi-ye Īrān va eslām (Journal of Historical Research of Iran and Islam)* 13, 25: 85-102, <DOI:10.22111/jhr.2019.25346.2357>. [in Persian]
- Torabi Farsani, Soheila. (2005) *Tojār, mashrotiyat va dolat-e modern (Merchants, Constitutionalism and Modern Government)*. Tehran: Tārikh-e Īrān. [in Persian]
- Wolf, Eric R. (1969) *Peasant Wars in the Twentieth Century*. New York: Harper & Row.
- Zagoria, Donald S. (1976, April) "Introduction: Peasants and Revolution," *Comparative Politics* 8, 3: 321-326. Available at: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/421402> (Accessed 4 November 2023).



This article is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC-BY) license.



Research Paper

Rohola Eslami<sup>1\*</sup>, Elahe Valizadeh<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Corresponding Author: Assistant Professor, Department of Political Science, Faculty of Law and Political Science, Ferdowsi University, Mashhad, Iran. Email: [eslami.r@um.ac.ir](mailto:eslami.r@um.ac.ir)

<sup>2</sup> MA in Political Science, Department of Political Science, Faculty of Law and Political Science, Ferdowsi University, Mashhad, Iran. Email: [elaheh.valizadeh@mail.um.ac.ir](mailto:elaheh.valizadeh@mail.um.ac.ir)

### Abstract

In any political system or government, there are conflicting forces composed of a multitude of actors (e.g., politicians, activists and other stakeholders) with diverse ideologies that are vying for power to influence the public policy process at all stages from policy formulation and policy execution to policy assessment. Certainly, one of the most significant government policy areas is in the field of education. Contrary to the positivist approach, education policies and strategies are not formed in a vacuum. Outside all political systems, there are individuals and institutions that expectedly endeavor to set the agenda for national education policies. These external actors are often powerful enough to have a determining impact on education policies based on their worldviews and rigid ideological thinking about education. Even though they might not necessarily oppose policies aimed at improving the quality of education in order to confront both the traditional and emerging challenges of building and maintaining efficient, equitable and forward-looking education systems.

The authors try to find suitable answers to the following research questions: 1. Which actors greatly influence Iran's decision-making and policymaking process in the field of education? 2. What are the ideological thinking and typical demands of each major groups of actors influencing Iran's education policies? In the hypothesis, it is claimed that the weaknesses of competitive mechanism by which political parties, labor unions and non-governmental organizations often crucially influence policymaking in the public sphere have led to a situation in the existing political arena that the demands of stakeholders and actors who are aligned with the dominant political ideology are predominantly considered by the policymakers' agenda-setting efforts in the field of education. For the purpose of hypothesis testing, the authors use a composite theoretical framework based on

---

\***How to Cite:** Eslami, Rohola; and Elahe Valizadeh. (2024, Winter) "Ideological Apparatus in Iran's Education Policy," *Fasl'nāmeḥ-ye siyāsāt (Politics Quarterly)* 53, 4: 651-679, <DOI: 10.22059/JPQ.2024.366946.1008130>.

Manuscript received: 18 October 2023; final revision received: 5 March 2024; accepted: 11 March 2024; published online: 12 March 2024



Habermas' theory of public space, Althusser's theory of ideology (and ideological state apparatuses), and Bourdieu's field theory. They relied on the works of these prominent scholars because Habermas's theory of the public sphere offers valuable lenses through which one might be able to examine the intricate interplay between the external actors and the broader public domain. Althusser's concept of ideological apparatus serves as a critical tool for understanding how ideologies are disseminated and mobilized in the education policy arena. Furthermore, Bourdieu's theory of the field provides valuable insights into the power dynamics that shape the education policy landscape.

Using the method of critical analysis, the demands related to the material interest, socio-economic needs, and politico-cultural preferences of the key activists and stakeholders (e.g., the Ministry of Education, administrative authorities, professional associations for teachers, student councils, parent-teacher association, seminaries and theological institutions, etc.) as the factors influencing the education policymaking process will be examined. By subjecting these demands to a careful scrutiny within their chosen theoretical framework, the authors attempt to reveal the ideological forces that underlie Iran's education policies. In the hope of overcoming the shortcomings of the country's education policymaking efforts, a few policy recommendations are ultimately presented in the concluding section, for instance, the necessity to base the education policymaking on an inclusive participatory approach, strengthening the role of all relevant governmental and non-governmental actors working cooperatively in the public sphere, and optimally using the capacity of all major stakeholders' scientific associations, organizations and labor unions in the field of education in Iran.

**Keywords:** Educational Policymaking, Field, Ideology, Iran, Public Space

#### **Declaration of conflicting interests**

The authors declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article. They confirm being the contributors of this work and have approved it for publication.

#### **Funding**

The authors received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

#### **References**

- Afkar News. (2019, August 26) "The Conference of the Islamic Community of Educators will be Held," (*afkarnews.com*). Available at: <https://www.afkarnews.com/fa/tiny/news-895840> (Accessed 13 April 2023). [in Persian]
- Ashouri, Mojtaba, et al. (2021) "Discovering the Experience of Failing University Entrance Exam among Applicants: A Grounded Theory Study," *Journal of Psychological Science* 19, 96: 1593-1605, <DOI: 20.1001.1.17357462.1399.19.96.6.4>. [in Persian]
- Asr-e Īrān. (2020, September 24) "The Objection of Seven Specialized

- Associations to the Employment of Students as History and Social Science Teachers,” (*asriran.com*). Available at: <https://www.asriran.com/fa/news/748259> (Accessed 25 May 2023). [in Persian]
- Atiye Online. (2021, March 7) “The Financial Turnover of Entrance Exam and Education Intermediaries,” (*atiyeonline.ir*). Available at: <https://www.atiyeonline.ir/news/10385> (Accessed 27 April 2023). [in Persian]
- Basij Organization of the Educators. (2018, March 2) “The Need to Transform the Idea of “Citizen” Training into “Slave” Training,” Available at: <https://cbo.ir/node/22263> (Accessed 16 April 2023). [in Persian]
- Bonnewitz, Patrice. (2012) *Primary Lessons on Sociology from Pierre Bourdieu (Premières Leçons sur la Sociologie de Pierre Bourdieu)*, trans. Jahangir Jahangiri and Hassan Poorsafir. Tehran: Aghah. [in Persian]
- Bourdieu, Pierre. (2017) *Ensān-e dāneshgāhi (Homo Academicus)*, trans. Hasan Chavoshian. Tehran: Parse. [in Persian]
- Daneshfard, Karamollah. (2014) *Farayand-e khat-e 'mash 'i-gozāri-ye omomi (Public Policymaking Process)*. Tehran: Saffar. [in Persian]
- Dawoodi, Rasol. (2011) “Evaluation of the Performance and Obstacles in front of the Student Council for Involving Students in School Activities,” *Rahyāfti no dar modiriyat-e āmozes̄hi (New Approaches in Educational Management)* 3, 12: 141-155. Available at: [https://journals.marvdasht.iau.ir/article\\_980.html](https://journals.marvdasht.iau.ir/article_980.html) (Accessed 29 April 2023). [in Persian]
- Dehgan, Alireza. (2021, July 26) “Will the Ratings Make it Through the Final Turn Safely?” *Etemad*. Available at: <https://www.magiran.com/article/4202586> (Accessed 25 April 2023). [in Persian]
- Ensafnews. (2022, June 22) “Spokesperson of the Teachers’ Organization: Eliminate the Security View, The Teachers’ Movement is Admirable,” Available at: <https://ensafnews.com/353247> (Accessed 9 April 2023). [in Persian]
- Farasatkah, Maghsoud. (1998) *Sar'āghāz-e no'andishi-ye mo'āser (The Beginning of Contemporary New Thinking)*. Tehran: Sherkat Sahami Enteshar. [in Persian]
- Fathtabar Firouzjaei, Kazem, et al. (2021) “Pathology of the Current Situation of the Student Assessment and Admission System in the Country with a Focus on the Entrance Examination and Providing a Solution to Improve the Student Assessment and Admission Model: A Comparative Study,” *Pajohesh'ha-ye tarbiyati (Educational Research)* 8, 42: 49-77, <DOI: 10.52547/erj.8.42.49>. [in Persian]
- Feirahi, Davood. (2001) “Islamic State and Products of Religious Thought,” *Majaleh'i dāneshkadeh'i hoghogh va olom-e siyāsī (The Journal of the Faculty of Law and Political Science)* 51, 0: 157-196. Available at: [https://journals.ut.ac.ir/article\\_12650.html](https://journals.ut.ac.ir/article_12650.html) (Accessed 18 April 2023). [in Persian]
- . (2015) *Fegh va siyāsāt Irān-e mo'āser (Jurisprudence and Politics*

- in the Contemporary Iran*). Tehran: Ney, Vol. 2. [in Persian]
- Ferretter, Luke. (2013) *Louis Althusser*, trans. Amir Ahmadi Arian. Tehran: Markaz. [in Persian]
- Habermas, Jürgen. (2002) *Bohrān-e moshroe'yat (Legitimation Crisis)*, trans. Jahangir Moeini. Tehran: Ghameno. [in Persian]
- . (2015) *Nazarieh-ye konesh-e ertebāti: aghl va aghlāniyat-e jāme'eh, zist'jahān va nezām-e naghādi-ye mafhom-e kār kard'garāyāneh-ye aghl (The Theory of Communicative Action, Vol. 1: Reason and the Rationalization of Society)*, trans. Kamal Poladi. Tehran: Markaz. [in Persian]
- Hashemian, Fakhrosadat, et al. (2016, February) “Tahlil-e moshārekhat-e bakhsh-e khososi dar nezām-e āmozhesh va parvareh (Analysis of Private Sector Participation in the Education System),” *Fasl'nāmeḥ-ye siyāsāt'ha-ye rāhbordi-ye va kalān (Quarterly Journal of The Macro and Strategic Policies)* 3, 12: 1-26. Available at: [https://www.jmsp.ir/article\\_12951.html](https://www.jmsp.ir/article_12951.html) (Accessed 24 April 2023). [in Persian]
- Hawzah. (2013, October 2) “The Guidelines of the Eminent Authorities and Scholars of the Hawzeh for the Excellence of the Programs of the Ministry of Education,” ([hawzahnews.com](http://hawzahnews.com)). Available at: <https://hawzah.net/fa/Magazine/View/6435/7890/101823> (Accessed 21 April 2023). [in Persian]
- . (2019, November 2) “Statement of the Qom Province’s Islamic Association of Educators Concerning the Current Issues of the Country,” *Hawzah News Agency (hawzahnews.com)*. Available at: <https://www.hawzahnews.com/news/924594> (Accessed 31 March 2023). [in Persian]
- . (2020, November 28) “The Work of Textbook Revision would be Started and Pursued with the Cooperation of the Hawzeh,” *Hawzah News Agency (hawzahnews.com)*. Available at: <https://www.hawzahnews.com/news/930088> (Accessed 4 April 2023). [in Persian]
- Headquarters of Seminaries-Schools Cooperation Website. (n.d.) “Headquarters of Hawzeh-Schools Cooperation at A Glance,” Available at: <http://hamkariha.ir/fa/about> (Accessed 23 April 2023). [in Persian]
- . (2017, September 3) “Practical Guide for the Provincial Activities of the Headquarters of Hawzeh-Schools Cooperation,” Available at: <http://hamkariha.ir/fa/news/11220/8/10> (Accessed 24 April 2023). [in Persian]
- Heywood, Andrew. (2017) *Siyāsāt-e jahāni (Global Politics)*, trans. Seyed Masoud Mousavi Shafae. Tehran: Samt, Vol. 1. [in Persian]
- Islamic Association of Khansar Teachers, the. (n.d) “The Statute of the Islamic Teachers’ Association of Iran,” ([moalleman.blog.ir](http://moalleman.blog.ir)). Available at: <https://moalleman.blog.ir/page/about-me> (Accessed 16 April 2023). [in Persian]
- IRNA (The Islamic Republic News Agency). (2002, August 27) “The Center for the Solidarity of Iranian Educators Invited Tehran’s Intellectual

- Elites to a Gathering,” (*irna.ir*). Available at: <https://www.irna.ir/news/5563885> (Accessed 9 April 2023). [in Persian]
- . (2019, July 11) “Commercialization Weakens the Functions of the Educational System,” (*irna.ir*). Available at: <https://www.irna.ir/news/83391851> (Accessed 8 April 2023). [in Persian]
- . (2020, February 21) “The Constant Presence of Alborz Educationalists in the Elections,” (*irna.ir*). Available at: <https://www.irna.ir/news/83684196> (Accessed 17 April 2023). [in Persian]
- ISNA (The Iranian Students' News Agency). (2015, July 14) “The Party of Iran’s Children’s Gratitude to the Negotiating Team of Our Country,” (*isna.ir*). Available at: <https://www.isna.ir/news/94042313049> (Accessed 7 April 2023). [in Persian]
- Islamic Parliament Research Center. (2003) “(Negāresh-ei b majles-e dānesh’āmozi (A Look at the Student Assembly),” *Markaz-e pajohesh’hā-ye majlis-e shorā-ye eslāmi* (*rc.majlis.ir*). Available at: <https://rc.majlis.ir/fa/report/show/733231> (Accessed 2 May 2023). [in Persian]
- Jalali, Mohammad Reza. (2007) “Tahlil-e rābeteh-ye nā’barābari’hā-ye tabaghāti va nā’barābari’hā-ye āmozeshi (An Analysis of the Relationship between Social Class and Educational Inequalities with an Emphasis on the Role of Intervening Variables),” *Faslnāmeḥ-ye talim va tarbiyat* (*Journal of Education*) 91: 15-53. Available at: <https://www.magiran.com/paper/471112> (Accessed 26 April 2023). [in Persian]
- Jame Jam Online. (2002, May 3) “Islamic Association of Gilan Educators: Consider Special Privileges for the Elementary School Teachers,” (*jamejamonline.ir*). Available at: <https://jamejamonline.ir/fa/news/8341> (Accessed 14 April 2023). [in Persian]
- Karamipour, Hamid. (2018) *Az setiz tā setāyesh (From Tension to Compromise: Modern Education and Religious Forces in Iranian Contemporary History)*. Tehran: Negārestān andisheh. [in Persian]
- Kazemi, Abbas. (2016) *Amr-e rozmareh dar jāme’eh-ye pasā’enghelābi (The Everyday in Post-Revolutionary Society)*. Tehran: Farhang-e Javid. [in Persian]
- Kraft, Michael E.; and Scott R. Furlong. (2017) *Siyāsāt’gozāri-ye omomi (Public Policy: Politics, Analysis, and Alternatives)*, trans. Nader Hoshmandyar. Tehran: shor’āfarin. [in Persian]
- Menashri, David. (2018) *Education and the Making of Modern Iran*, trans. Mohammad Hosein Badamchi and Erfan Mosleh. Tehran: Sina. [in Persian]
- Ministry of Interior News Portal. (2022a) “List of Political Parties and Groups,” (*old.moi.ir*). Available at: <https://old.moi.ir/Files/MOI/Files/17/1710a257-2f78-4db9-b5ec-b8c9a6ef460b.pdf> (Accessed 30 March 2023). [in Persian]
- Ministry of Interior, General Department of Political Affairs. (2022b) “The Characteristics of Professional Associations and Non-Political Specialized Organizations,” *Ministry of Interior News Portal* (*old.moi.ir*). Available at: <https://old.moi.ir/Files/MOI/Files/f8/>

- f88e0495-8786-4d9b-8931-131db8eeff35.pdf (Accessed 30 March 2023). [in Persian]
- Mohammadpour, Ahmad. (2011) *Ravesh dar ravesh: darbāreh-ye sākht-e ma' refat dar oloom-e ensāni (Method in Method: On the Structure of Knowledge in Humanities)*. Tehran: Logos. [in Persian]
- Mohammadpour, Ahmad. (2021) *Zed-e ravesh (Counter-Method: The Philosophical Underpinnings and Practical Procedures of Qualitative Methodology)*. Tehran: Logos. [in Persian]
- Moini Alamdari, Jahangir. (2006) *Ravesh 'shenāsi-ye nazari-eh'hā-ye jadid dar siyāsāt (Methodology of New Theories of Politics)*. Tehran: University of Tehran. [in Persian]
- Namayande. (2020, May 11) "The 11<sup>th</sup> Majlis Deals with the Bottlenecks in the Field of Education," (*namayande.com*). Available at: <https://namayande.com/news/161508> (Accessed 7 April 2023). [in Persian]
- Nash, Kate. (2017) *Jāme'eh'shenāsi siāsi-ye mo'āser: jahāni'shodan, siyāsāt va ghodrat (Contemporary Political Sociology: Globalization, Politics and Power)*, trans. Mohammad Taghi Delforozi. Tehran: Kavir. [in Persian]
- Nowzari, Hossein Ali. (2002) *Bāz'khāni-ye habermās (Rereading Habermas: An Introduction to Jürgen Habermas Opinions, Thoughts and Theories)*. Tehran: Cheshmeh. [in Persian]
- Pana News Agency. (2019, November 4) "The Formation of Alavi and Fatemi Assemblies is a Student Mobilization in order to Strengthen the Spirit of Expressing Demands," (*pana.ir*). Available at: <https://www.pana.ir/news-29/965784> (Accessed 4 May 2023). [in Persian]
- . (2021, June 16) "The Iranian Islamic Cultural Association Announced its Support for Hemati," (*pana.ir*). Available at: <https://pana.ir/news/1192901> (Accessed 11 April 2023). [in Persian]
- Parsineh. (2018, September 25) "The Connection between the Most Expensive Schools in Tehran and Political Officials: From Khatami and Hajarian to Mahdavi Kani and Haddad Adal," (*parsine.com*). Available at: <https://www.parsine.com/471153> (Accessed 28 April 2023). [in Persian]
- Pishkhan. (2021, April 18) "From the Authorities' Concern for the Academic Status of the Hawzeh to the Teaching of *Tolāb* in Schools," (*pishkhan.com*). Available at: <https://www.pishkhan.com/news/221353> (Accessed 19 May 2023). [in Persian]
- Rezamanesh, Fateme; and Mojgan Azimi Hashemi. (2013) "Investigating Methods of Strengthening the Function of Parents and Teachers Association (A Study Case of Khorasan Razavi Parents and Teachers Association)," *Andisheh'hā-ye novin-e tarbiyati (New Educational Ideas)* 10, 4: 131-154, <DOI:10.22051/JONTOE.2015.387>. [in Persian]
- Student Council, the. (2018) *The Student Council's Operational Manual*. Tehran: Menādi Tarbiat Cultural Institute. [in Persian]

Teachers' Organization News Website. (2021a, July 3) "Criticism of the 2021 National Exam and the Resolutions that Violate Justice in the Selection," Available at: <https://www.iranto.ir/15917-2> (Accessed 13 April 2023). [in Persian]



This article is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC-BY) license.





Research Paper

## The Zero-Sum Game: An Analysis of India-Pakistan Rivalry in the South Caucasus

Nozar Shafiee \*✉

Associate Professor, Faculty of Law & Political Science, University of Tehran, Iran. Email: [Nozarshafiee@ut.ac.ir](mailto:Nozarshafiee@ut.ac.ir)

### Abstract

This article is based on the premise that the South Caucasus has often been the scene of competition between regional and extra-regional powers. In the distant past, this rivalry was predominantly limited to three major powers: the Ottoman Empire, the Persian Empire and the Russian Empire. After a period of near-total Soviet rule over this region, other contenders (e.g., China, Europe and the United States) were provided with opportunities to get actively involved in the region in the aftermath of the USSR collapse. At the same time, Iran and Turkey also decided to enter the regional competition to benefit from the power void. The military conflicts between Armenia and Azerbaijan which occurred soon after the Soviet government fell, gradually enabled some new rival players (e.g., India and Pakistan) to gain a foothold in the South Caucasus. The main reasons for the involvement of the great powers and the other extra-regional players in the South Caucasus are diverse, ranging from mainly economic ones (as in the case of China) to predominantly political ones (as in the case of Iran, Turkey, the U.S. and Russia). Of course, they are all interested in the economic potential of establishing closer trade and investment ties with the regional states.

The primary research question is as follows: Why have India and Pakistan been intervening in the conflict zones in the South Caucasus which is located at a distance from their own territories? In the hypothesis, it is argued that the decisions of Pakistan and India to get involved in the interstate conflicts of the South Caucasus is a reflection of the protracted conflict between these two countries over Kashmir. The two South Asian rivals appeared on the scene after the war broke out between Azerbaijan and Armenia, and resulted in Pakistan's decision to send military forces and weapons to help the war efforts of Azerbaijan. This in turn led to India's deep concerns about Islamabad's adventurous moves to improve its power and influence abroad. The victory of Azerbaijan in the war increased New

**\*How to Cite:** Shafiee, Nozar. (2024, Winter) "The Zero-Sum Game: An Analysis of India-Pakistan Rivalry in the South Caucasus," *Fasl' nāmeḥ-ye siyāsāt (Politics Quarterly)* 53, 4: 681-707, <DOI: 10.22059/JPQ.2024.360280.1008076>.

Manuscript received: 29 August 2023; final revision received: 29 January 2024; accepted: 11 March 2024; published online: 12 March 2024.





Delhi's worry because the victory of Azerbaijan meant the victory of foreign policies of Pakistan and Turkey, which had unfavorable relations with India. This matter was important from the point of view that the adventures of Islamabad and Ankara were not limited to the South Caucasus, and might have been extended to Central Asia and from there to South Asia. The main concern of India's foreign policymakers was about the expansion of Pakistan's power and influence among the regional states that might then take side with Pakistan in its Kashmir conflict with New Delhi. Furthermore, the geostrategic location of the South Caucasus has been deemed important as a suitable corridor for creating a north-south transport corridor to connect India to Russia and Europe through Central Asia and Iran. The region has the potential to meet some of India's raw material and energy needs, including oil and gas.

Utilizing the method of qualitative thematic analysis for hypothesis-testing, the findings revealed that the rules of a zero-sum game overshadow the bilateral relations of the countries that are engaged in a protracted conflict over their vital national interest. Pakistan's support for Azerbaijan in its conflict with Armenia was aimed at expanding its influence in a strategic region in the hope of ultimately strengthening its position vis-à-vis India in the Kashmir conflict situation. Not surprisingly, India has acted in a reactionary manner to neutralize Pakistan's foreign policy initiatives by taking side with Armenia.

**Keywords:** India, Kashmir Crisis, Pakistan, South Caucasus, Zero-Sum Game

#### **Declaration of conflicting interests**

The author declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article. He confirms being the sole contributor of this work and has approved it for publication.

#### **Funding**

The authors received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

#### **References**

- Alizada, Nazrin. (2021, April 13) "Azerbaijan-Pakistan Military Relations," *Ankara Center for Crisis and Policy Studies (ANKASAM)*. Available at: <https://www.ankasam.org/azerbaijan-pakistan-military-relations/?lang=en> (Accessed 2 May 2023).
- Asatryan, Georgi. (2023, February 14) "Why Does a Powerful Nation Form an Alliance with a Minor Power? The India-Armenia Arms Deal Opens a Window on the Value of Asymmetrical Alliances," *Public Seminar*. Available at: <https://publicseminar.org/essays/why-does-a-powerful-nation-form-an-alliance-with-a-minor-power> (Accessed 15 December 2023).
- Bangash, Ayaz Haider. (2019) "Azerbaijan and Pakistan: Historical Relations and Perspectives," *The Frontier Post*. Available at:

- <https://thefrontierpost.com/azerbaijan-and-pakistan-historical-relations-and-perspectives> (Accessed 2 May 2023).
- Bhan, Aditya. (2022, December 16) "Armenia-India Relations: Budding Partnership Benefits New Delhi," *Observer Research Foundation (ORF)*. Available at: <https://www.orfonline.org/expert-speak/armenia-india-relations> (Accessed 2 May 2023).
- Bhatt, Manan. (2023, February 14) "Pakistan-Turkey Relations: What's in it for Ankara?" *DNA India (naindia.com)*. Available at: <https://www.dnaindia.com/world/report-pakistan-turkey-relations-what-s-in-it-for-ankara-3023623> (Accessed 4 May 2023).
- Blakely, Sara. (2022, October 12) "Zero-Sum Game Meaning: Examples of Zero-Sum Games," *Master Class*. Available at: <https://www.masterclass.com/articles/zero-sum-game-meaning> (Accessed 4 April 2022).
- Brecher, Michael. (1993) *Crisis in World Politics, Theory and Reality*. London: Pergamon.
- Caffero, Giorgio; and Emily Milliken. (2021, December 23) "Azerbaijan, Turkey, and Pakistan's Geopolitical Triangle," *The New Arab*. Available at: <https://www.newarab.com/analysis/azerbaijan-turkey-and-pakistans-geopolitical-triangle> (Accessed 15 April 2023).
- Cai, Feina. (2011, April 28) "Absolute and Relative Gains in the Real World," *E-International Relations*. Available at: <https://www.e-ir.info/2011/04/28/absolute-and-relative-gains-in-the-real-world> (Accessed 2 May 2023).
- Etaat, Javad; and Ibrahim Ahmadi. (2015) "Tahlil-e jeo'politik-e ravābet-e pākestan va hamsāyegān: tanesh'hā va tahdid'hā (A Geopolitical Analysis of Pakistan's Relations with its Neighbors: Tensions and Threats)," *Fasl'nāmeḥ-ye tahghihāt-e siyāsī va bein'ol mellali (Journal of Political and International Researches)* 7, 24: 1-23. Available at: <https://sanad.iau.ir/Journal/pir/Article/1012115> (Accessed 27 July 2023). [in Persian]
- Farooq, Umar. (2021) "Pakistan-Azerbaijan Relations," (*academia.edu*). Available at: [https://www.academia.edu/106733249/Pakistan\\_Azerbaijan\\_Relations](https://www.academia.edu/106733249/Pakistan_Azerbaijan_Relations). (Accessed 12 January 2024).
- Fatemejad, Seyyed Ahmad. (2014) "Monāze'eh-ye hend va Pākestan pas az 1998 va modiriyat-e ghodrat'hā-ye bozorg (Indo-Pakistani Conflict after 1998 and the Great Powers' Crisis Management)," *Fasl'nāmeḥ-ye pajohesh'ha-ye ravābet-e bein'ol-melal (Journal of International Relations Research)* 4, 12: 59-98. Available at: [https://www.iisajournals.ir/article\\_41954.html?lang=en](https://www.iisajournals.ir/article_41954.html?lang=en) (Accessed 27 July 2023). [in Persian]
- Ghose, Gauvav; and Patrick James. (2005) "Third-Party Intervention in Ethno-Religious Conflict: Role Theory, Pakistan, and War in Kashmir, 1965," *Terrorism and Political Violence* 17, 3, 427-445, <DOI: 10.1080/09546550590929200>.
- Hasanov, Ali. (2017, February 26) "Khojaly Genocide: Causes, Consequences and International Recognition," *Azerbaijan State News Agency (Azertag)*. Available at: [https://azertag.az/en/xeber/Khojaly\\_](https://azertag.az/en/xeber/Khojaly_)

- genocide\_Causes\_consequences\_and\_international\_recognition-1038780 (Accessed 15 April 2023).
- Hayrapetyan, Lilit. (2021, October 20) "India's Turn Toward Armenia: What is behind India's Recent Outreach to Armenia, Including the First-ever Visit by an Indian Foreign Minister?" *The Diplomat*. Available at: <https://thediplomat.com/2021/10/indias-turn-toward-armenia> (Accessed 2 May 2023).
- Hussain, Javed. (2020, February 14) "No Difference between Gallipoli and Occupied Kashmir': Erdogan Stands by Pakistan in Parliament Speech," *Dawn*. Available at: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1534429> (Accessed 2 May 2023).
- "India-Armenia Relations," (2022, December 30) *Drishti IAS (Drishti the Vision Foundation)*, India. Available at: <https://www.drishtias.com/daily-updates/daily-news-analysis/india-armenia-relations> (Accessed 5 May 2023).
- Kaura, Vinay. (2020, October 16) "The Erdogan Effect: Turkey's Relations with Pakistan and India," Institute of South Asian Studies (ISAS) *Working Papers* 336: 1-10, <DOI:10.48561/dp9d-fqv4>. Available at: <https://www.isas.nus.edu.sg/wp-content/uploads/2020/10/336.pdf> (Accessed 2 May 2023).
- Khalilov, Vugar. (2022, October 4) "Azerbaijan-Pakistan Ties: 30 Years on the Path of Strategic Partnership," *Azer News*. Available at: <https://www.azernews.az/nation/200281.html> (Accessed 2 May 2023).
- Khan, Imran; and Karim Haider Syed. (2021) "Pakistan Relations with Azerbaijan in 21 Century," *Pakistan Social Science Review* 5, 1: 667-679. Available at: <https://pssr.org.pk/issues/v5/1/pakistan-relations-with-azerbaijan-in-21st-century.pdf> (Accessed 2 May 2023).
- Lino, Marisa R. (2020, April 17) "Turkey and Pakistan: a Special Relationship?" *International Institute for Strategic Studies (IISS) Blog*. Available at: <https://www.iiss.org/online-analysis/online-analysis/2020/04/dmap-turkey-and-pakistan-a-special-relationship> (Accessed 2 May 2023).
- Mearsheimer, John. (2013) *Trajedī-ye siyāsāt-e ghodrāt'hā-ye bozorg (The Tragedy of Great Power Politics)*, trans. Gholamali Cheganizadeh. Tehran: IPIS, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. [in Persian]
- Milašinović, Srđan. (2008) "Crisis and Crisis Management: A Contribution to A Conceptual and Terminological Delimitation," *Megatrend Review* 5, 1: 167-185. Available at: <https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/288007914.pdf> (Accessed 2 May 2023).
- Ministry of External Affairs, Government of India. (2017) "India-Cyprus Joint Statement during the State Visit of President of Cyprus to India," ([mea.gov.in](http://mea.gov.in)). Available at: [https://www.mea.gov.in/incoming-visit-detail.htm?28426/India Cyprus+Joint+ Statement+during+the+State+ Visit+of+President+of+ Cyprus+to+India+April+2529+2017](https://www.mea.gov.in/incoming-visit-detail.htm?28426/India%20Cyprus%20Joint%20Statement%20during%20the%20State%20Visit%20of%20President%20of%20Cyprus%20to%20India%20April%2025%202017) (Accessed 12 January 2024).
- Mishra, Abhinandan. (2022, November 7) "Pakistan-Turkey-Azerbaijan Axis Brings India, Iran and Armenia Closer Together," *Greek City*

- Times*. Available at: <https://greekcitytimes.com/2022/11/07/pakistan-turkey-azerbaijan-axis> (Accessed 15 April 2023).
- Nanda, Prakash. (2022, September 25) "3 Key Reasons Why Turkey is Keen to Reset its Ties with India & Keep its Pro-Pakistan, Pro-Kashmir Sentiments on Backburner," *EurAsian Times*. Available at: <https://eurasianimes.com/3-key-reasons-why-turkey-is-keen-to-reset-its-ties-with-india> (Accessed 15 April 2023).
- Nawab, Engr Qaiser. (2023) "Potential Partnerships between Pakistan, Azerbaijan," *Pakistan Observer*. Available at: <https://pakobserver.net/potential-partnerships-between-pakistan-azerbaijan-by-engr-qaiser-nawab> (Accessed 2 May 2023).
- Omar, Ahmed. (2022, October 3) "Is the South Caucasus a New Battleground for India and Pakistan?" *Middle East Monitor*. Available at: <https://www.middleeastmonitor.com/20221003-is-the-south-caucasus-a-new-battleground-for-india-and-pakistan> (Accessed 2 May 2023).
- "Pakistan: We Will Continue to Support Turkey on the Northern Cyprus Issue," (2022, July 22) *Greek City Times*. Available at: <https://greekcitytimes.com/2022/07/22/pakistan-support-turkey-cyprus-2/>. (Accessed 2 May 2023).
- Peterson, Svenja. (2023) "Perspectives: Pakistan and India Wage Proxy Struggle in Nagorno-Karabakh," *Eurasianet*. Available at: <https://eurasianet.org/perspectives-pakistan-and-india-wage-proxy-struggle-in-nagorno-karabakh> (Accessed 25 January 2024).
- Poghosyan, Benyamin. (2023, May 4) "Armenia-India Cooperation: An Opportunity to Increase Armenia's Strategic Potential," *mediamax*. Available at: <https://mediamax.am/en/column/121416> (Accessed 2 May 2023).
- Rafiq, Arif. (2021, January 29) "The Turkey-Pakistan Entente: Muslim Middle Powers Align in Eurasia," *Middle East Institute (mei.edu)*. Available at: <https://www.mei.edu/publications/turkey-pakistan-entente-muslim-middle-powers-align-eurasia> (Accessed 2 May 2023).
- Roubanis, Ilya. (2023) "India and Pakistan Enter Caucasus Arms Race," *Caucasuswatch*. Available at: <https://caucasuswatch.de/en/insights/india-and-pakistan-enter-caucasus-arms-race.html> (Accessed 25 January 2024).
- Sazemand, Bahareh, et al. (2014, April) "Chashm'andāz-e movāseneh-ye ghodrat dar ravābet-e hend-pākestān dar partov-e tahavolāt-e akhir (The Prospect of the Balance of Power in India-Pakistan Relations in the Light of Recent Developments)," *Fasl'nāmeḥ-ye ravābet-e khārejī (Foreign Relations Quarterly Journal)* 6, 1: 43-81. Available at: [https://frqjournal.csr.ir/article\\_123641.html](https://frqjournal.csr.ir/article_123641.html) (Accessed 27 July 2023). [in Persian]
- Shafie, Nozar; and Maryam Eskandari. (2018, Winter) "Bohrān-e keshmir: arzyābi-ye senario'hā-ye hal-e bohrān (The Kashmir Crisis: An Evaluation of Crisis Resolution Scenarios)," *Fasl'nāmeḥ-ye rahyāft'hā-ye siyāsī va bein'ol mellali (Political and International Approaches)* 28:

- 205-231. Available at: <https://ensani.ir/fa/article/311231> (Accessed 27 July 2023). [in Persian]
- Tarling, Nicholas, ed. (2008) *The Cambridge History of Southeast Asia*. Available at: <https://www.cambridge.org/core/books/cambridge-history-of-southeast-asia/2128400582CF5F6A514E9F2E37D2BC> (Accessed 15 April 2023).
- Von Neumann, John; and Oskar Morgenstern. (2007) *Theory of Games and Economic Behavior*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 60<sup>th</sup> Anniversary ed.
- Waltz, Kenneth. (1959) *Man, the State and War*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Waseem, Sumaira. (2020, October 8) "Pakistan-Azerbaijan Relations: A Strategic Alliance," *Paradigm Shift*. Available at: <https://www.paradigmshift.com.pk/pakistan-azerbaijan> (Accessed 2 May 2023).
- "What's Behind the Growing Azerbaijan-Pakistan-Turkey Friendship? All Three Muslim Countries Continue to Back Each Other on Matters of National Interest," (2022) *TRT World*. Available at: <https://www.trtworld.com/magazine/what-s-behind-the-growing-azerbaijan-pakistan-turkey-friendship-43259> (Accessed 15 April 2023).
- "Why Ignoring Armenia Was India's Foreign Policy Blunder Just Like Israel?" (2020, December 2) *EurAsian Times*. Available at: <https://eurasianimes.com/why-ignoring-armenia-was-indias-foreign-policy-blunder-just-like-israel> (Accessed 2 May 2023).
- Wilson, Josh. (2023, March 17) "Armenia's Foreign Policy and Security Issues for 2023," *Geohistory*. Available at: <https://geohistory.today/armenias-foreign-policy-and-security-issues> (Accessed 3 May 2023).



This article is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC-BY) license.

Research Paper

## Roots of the “Subject” in Genetic Structuralism

Sona Qajar \*✉

Assistant Professor, Faculty of Islamic Revolution Studies Research Group, Islamic Revolution Document Center, Tehran, Iran. Email: sqajar@ut.ac.ir

### Abstract

The main purpose of this paper is to investigate the position and role of the subject—in terms of influencing or being influenced—in relation to the structure from the perspective of genetic structuralism that was proposed in the field of sociology and literary criticism by a Romanian philosopher and sociologist Lucien Goldmann. His theory of genetic structuralism has been widely applied in the sociology of literature. Using the basic elements of structuralist theory and at the same time understanding its weaknesses, Goldmann tried to save this theory from stagnation, inflexibility and inefficiency in explaining historical changes and developments by applying the theory of historical evolution in structuralism that increases its ability to explain social phenomena. By adding the concept of “genesis” to structuralist theory, an attempt is made to understand the dynamics of subject-structure and objective products of this relation. In Goldmann's theory, among these objective manifestations, literary creation is particularly emphasized.

Genetic structuralism sees literary creation as the product of the transcendental agent, which is represented in this form by its author. The meaningful structure of a literary creation is dialectically related to the mental structure of this transcendental actor, which is in a dialectical relationship with the political, social and economic structure and is constantly evolving and changing in the persistent cycle of construction-deconstruction. For Goldmann, structures have no idealistic or neo-Kantian element, and it is human being who acts collectively and along class lines in order to create or change these structures. Therefore, the structures have a non-historical and subsequently non-functional character, and there is no need for metaphysical levels to analyze them.

In the research hypothesis, it is argued that the subject of genetic structuralism, as a transcendental agent with inevitable gradual distancing from the absolute agency and non-active structural subordination, has reached a dialectical relation with structure and in the course of the formation of class consciousness and its objective manifestations, in a successive cycle of construction-deconstruction is always evolving and changing. In an attempt to understand human and social phenomena in general and cultural creations in particular, Goldmann borrows certain macro-analytic categories (such as wholeness, worldview, form, transcendental agent, possible consciousness, and object consciousness) from Georg Lukács and combines them with a series of anthropological and positivistic

**\*How to Cite:** Qajar, Sona. (2024, Winter) “Roots of the “Subject” in Genetic Structuralism,” *Fasl' nāmeḥ-ye siyāsāt (Politics Quarterly)* 53, 4: 709-735, <DOI:10.22059/JPQ.2024.243621.1007157>.

Manuscript received: 13 October 2017; final revision received: 9 March 2024; accepted: 11 March 2024; published online: 12 March 2024.



© 2024 by the University of Tehran. Published by the University of Tehran Press



categories derived from Piaget (such as meaningful structure, function, the process of construction and deconstruction, the epistemological loop of subject and object, and equilibrium).

The author uses the method of textual analysis for hypothesis testing. The most notable work of a critical theorist, Georg Lukács (i.e., *Theory of the Novel and History and Class Consciousness*) as well as Goldmann's books and essays (i.e., *the Hidden God*, and *The Human Sciences & Philosophy, Lukács and Heidegger*) are examined. The findings show that in the transition from structuralism to poststructuralism, the dialectical field of genetic structuralism combines Lukács's sociological theory with Piaget's psychological theory, using the legacy of thinkers such as Hegel and Freud, Nietzsche, etc. and seek to find a middle ground to liberate the subject while accepting the influence of structural constraints.

**Keywords:** Dialectics, Lucien Goldman, Post-structuralism, Subject's Agency, Theory of Genetic Structuralism

### **Declaration of conflicting interests**

The author declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article. She confirms being the sole contributor of this work and has approved it for publication.

### **Funding**

The author received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

### **References**

- Ahmadi, Babak. (1995) *Haghighat va zibāi (Truth and Beauty)*. Tehran: Markaz.
- Ardestani, Ali. (2015, Spring) "Sākhtār'garāi va masaleh-ye mae'nā dar oloom-e ensāni (Structuralism and the Problem of Meaning in the Humanities)," *Siyāsāt (Quarterly Journal of Politics of Tarbiat Modares University)* 5: 5-17. Available at: <https://ensani.ir/file/download/article/20161213114046-10070-15.pdf> (Accessed 23 February 2022). [in Persian]
- Bagheri, Khosrow; and Zohreh Khosravi. (2006, Spring) "Ma' refat'shenāsi-ye genetic (takvini) dar didgāh-e piyājeh (Genetic 'Developmental' Epistemology in Piaget's View)," *Hekmat va falsafeh (Wisdom and Philosophy)* 5: 7-22, <DOI: 10.22054/wph.2006.6668>. [in Persian]
- Bakhshaish, Reza. (2001, Autumn) "Nazariyeh'hā'i dar bāb-e ensān (Theories about Man)," *Ravesh'shenāsi-ye oloom-e ensāni (Methodology of Humanities)* 7, 28: 153-186. Available at: [https://method.rihu.ac.ir/article\\_835.html](https://method.rihu.ac.ir/article_835.html) (Accessed 23 February 2022). [in Persian]
- Bashirieh, Hussein. (1993, December-January) "Tārikh-e andhishe'hā va jonbesh'hā-ye siyāsi dar gharn-e bistom, mārxisim eksistensiālist (History of Political Thoughts and Movements in the Twentieth Century, Existential Marxism)," *Ettela'at-e siyāsī va eghtesādī (Political and Economic Information Journal)* 76 & 77: 10-16.

- Available at: <https://ensani.ir/fa/article/102494> (Accessed 23 February 2022). [in Persian]
- . (2004) *Andhisheh'hā-ye mārxisi, dar tārikh-e andisheh-hā-ye siyāsi dar gharn-e bistom (History of Political Thought in the Twentieth Century, Volume One of Marxist Thought)*. Tehran: Ney [in Persian]
- Basil, Enil. (1999, Spring) "Oropāiyān khod rā chegoneh me'binand? (How do Europeans See Themselves? Culture, Belief and Writing)," trans. Lily Mostafavi Kashani. *Nāmeḥ-ye farhang (Letter of Culture)* 232: 220-237. Available at: <https://ensani.ir/fa/article/265974> (Accessed 23 February 2022). [in Persian]
- Caller, Jonathan. (2000) *Ferdinand de Saussure*, trans. Cyrus Safavid. Tehran: Hermes. [in Persian]
- Cohen, Mitchell. (1994) *The Wager of Lucien Goldmann*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Colinicus, Alex. (2005) *Mārxisim va falsafeh (Marxism and Philosophy)*, trans. Akbar Masoom Beigi. Tehran: Digar [in Persian]
- Damish, Hubert. (2007, Winter) "Freud and Kant," trans. Shahriar Waqfipour, *Majaleh-ye zibā'shenāsi (Journal of Aesthetics)* 17: 171-178. Available at: <https://ensani.ir/fa/article/4327> (Accessed 23 February 2022). [in Persian]
- Dehbashi, Mehdi. (2005, April) "Tahlil va arzyābi-ye naghd-e hegel bar kānt (Kant's Critique of Hegel's Analysis)," *Hekmat va falsafeh (Wisdom and Philosophy)* 1, 1: 6-16, <DOI:10.22054/wph.2005.6655>. [in Persian]
- Goldmann, Lucien. (1969) *The Human Sciences & Philosophy*, trans. (from French) Hayden V. White and Robert Anchor. London: Jonathan Cape.
- . (1977) *Lukács and Heidegger: Towards a New Philosophy*, trans. William Q. Boelhower. London: Routledge & K. Paul.
- . (1978) *Falsafeh va oloom-e ensāni (Philosophy and Humanities)*, trans. Asad Pourpiranfar. Tehran: Jāvidān [in Persian]
- . (1980) *Essays on Method in the Sociology of Literature*, trans. William Q. Boelhower. St. Louis, MO: Telos Press.
- . (1990) *Naghd-e takvini (Developmental Criticism)*, trans. Mohammad Taghi Ghiasi. Tehran: Bozorgmehr [in Persian]
- . (2002) *Ensān chist? kānt va falsafeh-ye mo'āser (What is a Human Being? Kant and Contemporary Philosophy)*, trans. Parviz Babaei. Tehran: Negāh [in Persian]
- . (2012) *Lukács and Heidegger*, trans. Mohammad Zare. Tehran: Hekmat [in Persian]
- . Goldmann, Lucien. (2016) *The Hidden God: A Study of Tragic Vision in the Pensées of Pascal and the Tragedies of Racine*, trans. Philip Thody. London & New York: Verso.
- Howarth, David. (2007, Winter) "Saussure, sākhtār'garāi va nezām'hā-ye namādin (Saussure, Structuralism and Symbolic Systems)," trans. Nezam Bahrami Kamil. *Rasāneh (Media)* 72: 187-195. Available at: [https://qjmn.farhang.gov.ir/article\\_78230.html](https://qjmn.farhang.gov.ir/article_78230.html) (Accessed 23 February 2022). [in Persian]
- Janbaz, Omid; and Aliakbarmesgari, Ahmad, (2013, Spring and Summer) "Paydayesh-e sojeh-ye ejtemā'i dar andisheh-ye hegel (The Origin of

- the Social Subject in Hegel's Thought)," *Gharb'shenāsi-ye bonyādi (Fundamental Western Studies)* 1: 23-42 Available at: [https://occidentstudy.ihcs.ac.ir/article\\_814.html](https://occidentstudy.ihcs.ac.ir/article_814.html) (Accessed 23 February 2022). [in Persian]
- Johnson, Patricia Altenbrand. (2008) *Heidegger*, trans. Bijan Abdolkarimi. Tehran: Elm. [in Persian]
- Kamalinejad, Mohammad Hossein. (1996, October-November) "Husserl va tā' sis-e padidār'shenāsi (Husserl and the Establishment of Phenomenology)," *Kayhān-e andisheh (Kayhan Andisheh)* 68: 49-60. Available at: <https://ensani.ir/fa/article/105951> (Accessed 23 February 2022). [in Persian]
- Koffman, Walter. (2006) *Goethe, Kant and Hegel*, trans. Farinoldin Radmeh and Abutorab Sohrab. Tehran: Cheshmeh. [in Persian]
- Kolakovsky, Lashkar. (2007) *Jariyān'hā-ye asli dar mārksizm (Main Currents in Marxism)*, trans. Abbas Milani. Tehran: Agāh, Vol. 2. [in Persian]
- Lukács, George. (1971) *History and Class Consciousness*, trans. Rodney Livingstone. London: Merlin Press.
- . (1999) *Tārikh va āgāhi-ye tabaghāti (History and Class Awareness)*, trans. Mohammad Jafar Pooyandeh. Tehran: Tajrobeh. [in Persian]
- . (2002) *Nazarieh-ye romān (The Theory of Novel)*, trans. Hassan Mortazavi. Tehran: Ghesseh. [in Persian]
- Moeini Alamdari, Jahangir. (2001, Spring) "Chisti-ye goftemān-e pasā'sakhtār'garā (What is Post-Structuralist Discourse in Politics)," *Majaleh 'i dāneshkadeh 'i hoghogh va olom-e siyāsī (The Journal of the Faculty of Law and Political Science)* 51: 197-222. Available at: [https://jflps.ut.ac.ir/article\\_12651.html](https://jflps.ut.ac.ir/article_12651.html) (Accessed 23 February 2022). [in Persian]
- Piaget, Jan. (1994) "Mafāhim-e bonyāni-ye sakht'garāei (Fundamental Concepts of Constructivism)," trans. Seyyed Ali Mortazavian. *Organon* 4: 27-36. Available at: <https://ensani.ir/fa/article/64255> (Accessed 23 February 2022). [in Persian]
- Pooyandeh, Mohammad Jafar. (1997) *Jāme 'eh, farhang, adabiyāt (Society, Culture, Literature: Lucien Goldmann)*. Tehran: Cheshmeh. [in Persian]
- Poster, Mark. (1975) *Existential Marxism in Post War France from Sartre to Althusser*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Sartre, Jean Paul. (1979) *Existānsiālism va esālat-e bashar (Existentialism and Human Originality)*, trans. Mostafa Rahimi. Tehran: Morvarid. [in Persian]
- Sobhanian, Khatereh; and Ali Karbasizadeh Isfahani. (2013, Spring and Summer) "Nietzsche va naghd-e aghl-e mahz (Nietzsche and the Critique of Pure Reason)," *Gharb'shenāsi-ye bonyādi (Fundamental Western Studies)* 1: 63-80. Available at: <http://ensani.ir/file/download/article/20140406144345-9741-39.pdf> (Accessed 23 February 2022). [in Persian]

- Sofren, Pirabar. (1997) *Zartosht-e nieche (Zarathustra Nietzsche, Explanation of the Preface of Such a Saying of Zarathustra)*, trans. Behrouz Safdari. Tehran: Fekr-e-Emrooz. [in Persian]
- Solomon, Robert K. (1994, August and September) "Husserl va vāpas tāftan be falsafeh-ye estelā'ī (Husserl and Return to Transcendental Philosophy)," trans. Mohammad Saeed Hanaei Kashani. *Kayhān Andisheh (Kayhan Andisheh)* 55: 93-99. Available at: <https://ensani.ir/fa/article/103006> (Accessed 23 February 2022). [in Persian]
- . (2000) *Falsafeh-ye oropiā'i: az nimeh-ye dovom-e gharn-e hejdahom tā vāpasin daheh-ye gharn-e bistom, toloe' va ofol-e khod (European Philosophy: From the Second Half of the Eighteenth Century to the Last Decade of the Twentieth Century, its Rise and Fall)*, trans. Mohammad Saeed Hanaei Kashani. Tehran: Qasideh. [in Persian]
- Stuart, Dan. (2004, Summer) "Sākhtār'garāi va pasā'sākhtār'garāi (Structuralism and Poststructuralism)," trans. Abolfazl Sajedi. *Ravesh'shenāsi-ye oloom-e ensāni (Methodology of Humanities)* 39: 154-185. Available at: <http://ensani.ir/fa/article/47779> (Accessed 23 February 2022). [in Persian]



This article is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC-BY) license.



Research Paper

## Max Weber and the Organizational-Economic Foundations of the Rise of the “Vocational Politician”

Hojjat Kazemi<sup>1\*</sup>, Sajjad Ahmadian<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Corresponding Author: Assistant Professor, Faculty of Law & Political Science, University of Tehran, Iran. Email: [hkazemi@ut.ac.ir](mailto:hkazemi@ut.ac.ir)

<sup>2</sup> A PhD Candidate in Political Science, Faculty of Law & Political Science, University of Tehran, Iran. Email: [Ahmadian.sajjad@ut.ac.ir](mailto:Ahmadian.sajjad@ut.ac.ir)

### Abstract

Legitimate rule is widely regarded as Max Weber’s main contribution to political sociology. The predominant interpretation of Weber’s account of the legitimate rule puts a one-sided emphasis on belief systems. Using a descriptive-explanatory approach, the authors try to establish the limitations of this predominant interpretation. An argument put forward is that for the purpose of understanding the variations in the forms of legitimate rule which had emerged across time and space one needs to understand the values and beliefs of the people in question. The legitimate rule in this interpretation is (or is expected to be) a direct reflection of people’s values. In this study, the authors tried to investigate the limits of the predominant interpretation, and did not intend to find an alternative for the one-sided emphasis of the cultural interpretation, or for an equally one-sided emphasis on organizational and financial factors. Basically, the main objective had been to shed light on the proper place of the belief system explanation of the legitimate rule.

The primary research question is as follows: In Weber's understanding of legitimate rule, what is the relationship between the type of legitimacy claims, that is presented to achieve or maintain dominance, and the external apparatus of the rule? In the hypothesis, it is postulated that the form of the claimed legitimacy is not imposed by the external factors, but the probability of success of the claim of legitimacy is contingent on the external factors. The way of organizing the external mechanisms of domination (especially

**\*How to Cite:** Kazemi, Hojjat; and Sajjad Ahmadian. (2024, Winter) "Max Weber and the Organizational-Economic Foundations of the Rise of the ‘Vocational Politician’,” *Fasl’ nāmeḥ-ye siyāsāt (Politics Quarterly)* 53, 4: 737-760, <DOI: 10.22059/JPQ.2021.315774.1007721>.

Manuscript received: 26 December 2020; final revision received: 18 February 2024; accepted: 11 March 2024; published online: 12 March 2024





the administrative apparatus) is contingent on the chance of success of the claim of legitimacy, which is itself determined by the economic factors (especially the method of financing the expenses of the domination apparatus). Of the external constraints, the organizational and financial factors are more important to Weber. The former concerns the organizational structure of the external apparatus of rule, especially the administrative organization, and the latter focuses on the ways by which the financial costs of the administrative staff are met. These two factors determine the likelihood of the success of legitimacy claims by influencing the balance of power between the rulers, the administrative staff and the society. To test the research hypothesis, the method of qualitative textual analysis is used. First, Weber's account of the legitimate rule in *Economy and Society* is carefully examined to demonstrate how each of three forms of legitimacy are explained in close association with the organizational-financial factors. Then, the significance of the organizational-financial factors as manifested in Weber's account of the rise of vocational leaders is described. The analysis of Weber's *Politics as a Vocation* demonstrate that the rise of vocational politicians depends on an exceptional bureaucratic order, which is professional enough to dispossess the local contenders of power, but is not too professional to strip the political leaders of the actual power in favor of the top bureaucrats.

**Key Words:** Legitimate Rule, Organizational Structure, Professional Politician, Vocational Politician, Weber

#### **Declaration of conflicting interests**

The authors declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article. They confirm being the contributors of this work and have approved it for publication.

#### **Funding**

The authors received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

#### **References**

- Alexander, Jeffery C. (1987) *Classical Attempt at Theoretical Synthesis: Max Weber*. London: Routledge.
- Almond, Gabriel. A. (1965) "A Developmental Approach to Political Systems," *World Politics* 17, 2: 83-214, <DOI: 10.2307/2009347>.
- . (1963) *The Civic Culture: Political Attitudes and Democracy in Five Nations*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Almond, Gabriel; and G. Bingham Powell. (2002) *Siyāsāt-e tatbighi (Comparative Politics: A Developmental Approach)*, trans. Alireza Taieb. Tehran: Markaz-e amoozesh-e modiriāt-e dolati-ye riāsāt jomhoori. [in Persian]
- Beetham, David. (1991) *The Legitimation of Power*. Basingstoke, UK: MacMillan.
- Bendix, Reinhard. (2003) *Simā-ye fekri-ye māx weber (Max Weber: An Intellectual Portrait)*, trans. Mahmood Rambod. Tehran: Hermes. [in Persian]

- Collins, Randal. (1986) *Weberian Sociological Theory*. New York & Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Easton, David. (1965) *A Systems Analysis of Political Life*. New York: Wiley.
- Giddens, Anthony. (2004) *Siyāsāt, jāme‘eh‘shenāsi dar andisheh-ye māx weber (Politics and Sociology in the Thought of Max Weber)*, trans. Majid Mohammadi. Tehran: Qatreh. [in Persian]
- . (2002) *Siyāsāt, jāme‘eh‘shenāsi, nazariyeh-e ejtemā‘i (Politics, Sociology, and Social Theory: Encounters with Classical and Contemporary Social Thought)*, trans. Manoocher Saboori. Tehran: Ney. [in Persian]
- Habermas, Jürgen. (2001) *Bohrān-e mashroe‘yat (Legitimation Crisis)*, trans. Jahangir Meini Alamdari. Tehran: Gam-e no. [in Persian]
- Kalberg, Stephen. (1994) *Max Weber’s Comparative-Historical Sociology*. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press.
- Lipset, Seymour Martin. (1963) *The Social Bases of Politics*. Baltimore, MA: Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Parkin, Frank. (2016) *Max Weber*, trans. Shahnaz Mosamaparast. Tehran: Qoqnoss. [in Persian]
- Parsons, Talcot. (1942) “Max Weber and the Contemporary Political Crisis: The Sociological Analysis of Power and Authority Structures,” *The Review of Politics* 4, 1: 61-76. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/1404277> (Accessed 2 June 2022).
- . (1947) “Introduction” in Max Weber. *The Theory of Social and Economic Organization*. trans. A. M. Henderson and Talcott Parsons. Glencoe, Illinois: Free Press.
- . (1949) *The Structure of Social Action*. Glencoe, Illinois: Free Press.
- Schluchter, Wolfgang. (1984) *The Rise of Western Rationalism: Max Weber’s Developmental History*. Berkely, CA: University of California Press.
- Weber, Max. (1946) *From Max Weber: Essays in Sociology*, ed. Hans H. Gerth and C. Wright Mills. New York & Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- . (1978) *Economy and Society: An Outline of Interpretive Sociology*, ed. Guenther Roth and Claus Wittich. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.
- . (1994) *Political Writings*, trans. Ronald Speirs. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- . (2008) *Max Weber’s Complete Writings on Academic and Political Vocations*, trans. Gordon C. Wells. New York: Algora.
- . Weber, Max. (2019) *Economy and Society: A New Translation*, ed., trans. Keith Tribe. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press.



This article is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC-BY) license.





Research Paper

## The People-Centered Public Security and Good Security Governance: Lesson Learning for Policy Recommendations

Saideh Lotfian<sup>1\*</sup>, Mohammad Baratian<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Corresponding Author: Professor, Department of Political Science, Faculty of Law & Political Science, University of Tehran, Iran. Email: [slotfian@ut.ac.ir](mailto:slotfian@ut.ac.ir)

<sup>2</sup> A PhD Candidate in Public Policy, Department of Political Science, Faculty of Law & Political Science, University of Tehran, Iran. Email: [mbaratian@ut.ac.ir](mailto:mbaratian@ut.ac.ir)

### Abstract

Public policy-makers and public sector managers are often faced with high-stakes situations while they must ensure the well-being of their people, but they essentially base their decisions on national security from the perspective of regime's stability, as well as on their own self-interested considerations. Policymaking to defend against traditional military threats has remained a top policy priority of most (if not) all governments which are giving priorities to huge budget allocation for military spending. While we know a lot about national security consequences of military threats, we know much less about the implications of the current and future non-military threats to human security. The twin purposes of this paper are, a) to identify and examine the factors that influence security policy-making aimed at combating traditional and emerging public security challenges and threats; and b) to examine the merits of different models of governance with an emphasis on security sector governance as an effective means of decision-making and implementing policies to address equitable redistribution of income and wealth, just social security policies, power sharing, and peaceful conflict resolution techniques. Thus, this study is designed to gain insight into the determining factors influencing public security in the changing world from the perspective of people-centric policy-making. Urgent issues of outmost importance for public security include public healthcare, mental health, emergency preparedness for natural disasters, environmental

**\*How to Cite:** Lotfian, Saideh; and Mohammad Baratian. (2024, Winter) "The People-Centered Public Security and Good Security Governance: Lesson Learning for Policy Recommendations," *Fas'lnāmeḥ-ye siyāsāt (Politics Quarterly)* 53, 4: 761-790, <DOI:10.22059/JPQ.2024.370801.1008154>.

Manuscript received: 15 June 2023; final revision received: 7 March 2024; accepted: 9 March 2024; published online: 11 March 2024.





dimensions of human security, the consequences of militarization of law enforcement, cyber-crime prevention, public safety implications of technological advancement. The emergence of new technologies might be detrimental to public security in two ways: First, the new communication and surveillance technologies might facilitate the actions of the governments that plan to restrict personal liberties and political freedoms of their citizens. Second, criminal and terrorist groups may exploit new technologies (e.g., artificial intelligence) to expand their activities which generate threats to public security.

The primary and secondary research questions are as follows: 1. How can the advancement of public security and human security be achieved within the theoretical framework of good security governance and the people-centered approach to sustainable development? 2. Why should the security-development-democracy nexus be considered in people-centered public security policymaking? 3. What lessons can be learned from different governance models to confront security challenges and threats in the unstable global security environment? In the research hypothesis, it is postulated that good security sector governance leads to greater success in the people-centered public security policymaking. In order to reduce the level of military and non-military threats to the security of its citizens, a forward-looking government will adopt good governance model of decision-making. With a qualitative and explanatory approach, the authors seek to answer these questions, test the hypothesis, and outline the findings by means of an in-depth analysis of the arguments and evidence presented by the scholars in the existing political science and governance studies, which could foster lesson-learning from past experience of the success and failure of security policymaking. The results suggest that the potential consequences of the poor quality of governance for people-centered public security are highly dependent on the economic and political attributes of development. On the one hand, socioeconomic vulnerability contributes to mistrust in government leaders, public institutions and their civil servants. On the other hand, most people value transparency, good performance management, and opportunities for public participation in politics and policymaking. Thus, the quality of governance influence people's views of the legitimacy of political leaders, and might adversely affect their trust in government. Finally, the paper concludes with a summary of key policy recommendations for proactive people-centric policy-making and good security governance for confronting public security challenges.

**Keywords:** Good Security Sector Governance, Human Security, Models of Governance, New Security Challenges

**Declaration of conflicting interests**

The authors declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article. They confirm being the contributors of this work and have approved it for publication.

## Funding

The authors received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

## References

- Aitalieva, Nurgul R.; and Andrew L. Morelock. (2019) "Citizens' Perceptions of Government Policy Success: A Cross-National Study," *Journal of Public and Nonprofit Affairs* 5, 2: 198-216, <DOI: 10.20899/jpna.5.2.198%E2%80%93216>.
- Ariely, Gal. (2013) "Public Administration and Citizen Satisfaction with Democracy: Cross-National Evidence," *International Review of Administrative Sciences* 79, 4: 747-766, <DOI:10.1177/0020852313501432>.
- Asiimwe, Solomon Muchwa. (2023, May) "Rethinking the Security-Development Nexus in the Context of Human Security," *Social Science and Humanities Journal* 7, 5: 3070-3087. Available at: <http://www.sshjournal.com/index.php/sshj/article/view/856> (Accessed 30 May 2023).
- "Brazil to Get New Public Security Ministry," *Deutsche Welle (dw.com)*. (2018, February 18) Available at: <https://www.dw.com/en/brazil-to-create-new-ministry-for-public-security/a-42634164> (Accessed 30 April 2023).
- Capano, Giliberto, et al. (2015) "Bringing Governments Back in: Governance and Governing in Comparative Policy Analysis," *Journal of Comparative Policy Analysis: Research and Practice* 17, 4: 311-321, <DOI:10.1080/13876988.2015.1031977>.
- de Carvalho, Vinicius Mariano; and Raphael C. Lima. (2023) "Shaping the Security-Development Nexus in Brazil: The Military as a Modernizing and Nation-Building Actor?" *Conflict, Security & Development* 23, 2: 105-133, <DOI:10.1080/14678802.2023.2203094>.
- Cavalcanti, Pessoa Roxana; and Jeff Garmany. (2020) "The Politics of Crime and Militarized Policing in Brazil," *International Journal for Crime, Justice and Social Democracy* 9, 2: 102-118, <DOI:10.5204/ijcjsd.v9i2.1157>.
- Chappuis, Fairlie. (2023, July 10) "Hybrid Security: Challenges and Opportunities for Security Sector Reform, Insights from Burkina Faso, Colombia & DRC," Geneva: DCAF-Geneva Center for Security Sector Governance ([www.dcaf.ch](http://www.dcaf.ch)). Available at: <https://www.dcaf.ch/hybrid-security-challenges-and-opportunities-security-sector-reform> (Accessed 18 August 2023).
- Choi, SeoYoun. (2018) "Bureaucratic Characteristics and Citizen Trust in Civil Service in OECD Member Nations," *International Area Studies Review* 21, 2: 114-133, <DOI:10.1177/2233865917753899>.
- Commission On Human Security. (2003) *Human Security Now*. New York: United Nations. Available at: <https://digitallibrary.un.org/record/503749/files/Humansecuritynow.pdf> (Accessed 9 October 2023).

- Compton, Mallory E.; and Paul 't Hart, eds. (2019, October 24) *Great Policy Successes*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, Online ed, <DOI:10.1093/oso/9780198843719.001.0001>.
- Daly, Michael; and Lucia Macchia. (2023, April 4) "Global Trends in Emotional Distress," *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 120, 14: e2216207120, <DOI:10.1073/pnas.2216207120>.
- Danish Ministry of Defense. (2022, November 11) "Danish Defense, Home Guard and Emergency Management," ([www.fmn.dk](http://www.fmn.dk)). Available at: <https://www.fmn.dk/en/topics/national-tasks/forsvaret-hjemmevarnet-og-beredskabet> (Accessed 3 May 2023).
- Flores-Macías, Gustavo A.; and Jessica Zarkin. (2021) "The Militarization of Law Enforcement: Evidence from Latin America," *Perspectives on Politics* 19, 2: 519-538, <DOI:10.1017/S1537592719003906>.
- . (2023) "The Consequences of Militarized Policing for Human Rights: Evidence from Mexico," *Comparative Political Studies* 0, 0: 1-32, <DOI: 10.1177/00104140231168362>.
- Foster, Chase; and Jeffrey Frieden. (2017) "Crisis of Trust: Socio-Economic Determinants of Europeans' Confidence in Government," *European Union Politics* 18, 4: 511-535, <DOI:10.1177/1465116517723499>.
- Gallup. (2019) "Gallup's Top World Findings for 2019," ([gallup.com](http://gallup.com)). Available at: <https://news.gallup.com/opinion/gallup/273089/gallup-top-world-findings-2019.aspx> (Accessed 9 October 2023).
- . (2023) "Global Law and Order, 2023," ([gallup.com](http://gallup.com)). Available at: <https://www.gallup.com/analytics/356963/gallup-global-law-and-order-report.aspx> (Accessed 9 October 2023).
- Gardine, Gwendolyn. (2023) "The Economic Well-Being of Nations is Associated with Positive Daily Situational Experiences," *Current Research in Ecological and Social Psychology* 4, <DOI:10.1016/j.cresp.2023.100088>.
- Geneva Center for the Democratic Control of Armed Forces (DCAF). (2015) "Security Sector Governance- SSR Backgrounder," Geneva: DCAF ([dcaf.ch](http://dcaf.ch)). Available at: [https://www.dcaf.ch/sites/default/files/publications/documents/DCAF\\_BG\\_1\\_Security\\_Sector\\_Governance\\_EN.pdf](https://www.dcaf.ch/sites/default/files/publications/documents/DCAF_BG_1_Security_Sector_Governance_EN.pdf) (Accessed 30 April 2023).
- Government of China. (2024, January 20) "The General Office of the State Council issued the Notice of the 'National Natural Disaster Relief Emergency Plan', State Council Letter [2024] No. 11," ([gov.cn](http://gov.cn)). Available at: [https://www.gov.cn/zhengce/content/202402/content\\_6930038.htm](https://www.gov.cn/zhengce/content/202402/content_6930038.htm) (Accessed 9 October 2023). [in Chinese]
- Government of Iceland. (2024) "Public Safety and Security," ([government.is](http://government.is)) Available at: <https://www.government.is/topics/public-safety-and-security> (Accessed 5 May 2023).
- Icelandic Met Office (IMO). (2018, May) "Climate Report, the Third Report on Impacts of Climate Change in Iceland," ([en.vedur.is](http://en.vedur.is)). Available at: <https://en.vedur.is/climatology/iceland/climate-report> (Accessed 5 May 2023).
- INTERPOL (International Criminal Police Organization). (2024a) "How Interpol Supports Brazil to Tackle International Crime,"

- ([www.interpol.int](http://www.interpol.int)). Available at: <https://www.interpol.int/en/Who-we-are/Member-countries/Americas/BRAZIL> (Accessed 5 May 2023).
- . (2024b) “How Interpol Supports China to Tackle International Crime,” ([www.interpol.int](http://www.interpol.int)). Available at: <https://www.interpol.int/en/Who-we-are/Member-countries/Asia-South-Pacific/CHINA> (Accessed 5 May 2023).
- . (2024c) “How Interpol Supports Denmark to Tackle International Crime,” ([www.interpol.int](http://www.interpol.int)). Available at: <https://www.interpol.int/en/Who-we-are/Member-countries/Europe/DENMARK> (Accessed 5 May 2023).
- Katzenstein, Peter J. (1996) “Conclusion: National Security in a Changing World,” in Peter J. Katzenstein, ed. *The Culture of National Security: Norms and Identity in World Politics*. New York: Columbia University Press, 498-537.
- Kaufmann, Daniel; and Aart Kraay. (2023) “Worldwide Governance Indicators, 2023 Update,” ([govindicators.org](http://govindicators.org)). Available at: <https://www.worldbank.org/en/publication/worldwide-governance-indicators> (Accessed 7 October 2023).
- Lloyd’s Register Foundation and IEP. (2023) *Safety Perceptions Index 2023: Foundation Understanding the Impact of Risk Around the World*. Available at: <https://www.visionofhumanity.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/02/SPI-2023-2.pdf> (Accessed 5 September 2023).
- Luetjens, Joannah, et al. (2019) “On Studying Policy Successes in Australia and New Zealand,” in Joannah Luetjens, et al., eds. *Successful Public Policy: Lessons from Australia and New Zealand*. Acton: Australian National University Press, <DOI:10.22459/SPP.2019>.
- Mitchell, David. (2018) “Strategic Implementation: An Illustration of Theory/Practice Disconnect in Public Administration,” *Public Administration Quarterly* 42, 1: 59-89, <DOI:10.1177/073491491804200103>.
- Morelock, Andrew L. (2021) “In Bureaucrats we Trust? Good Governance and Trust in Civil Servants,” *Public Administration Quarterly* 45, 3: 315-337, <DOI:10.37808/paq.45.3.6>.
- Nolte, Isabella M.; and Jörg Lindenmeier. (2023, April 19) “Creeping Crises and Public Administration: A Time for Adaptive Governance Strategies and Cross-Sectoral Collaboration?” *Public Management Review*, <DOI:10.1080/14719037.2023.2200459>.
- Nsoesie, Elaine Okanyene, et al. (2020) “Mapping Disparities in Homicide Trends Across Brazil: 2000–2014,” *Injury Epidemiology* 7, 47, <DOI:10.1186/s40621-020-00273-y>.
- Oñate, Sergio Padilla; and Carlos A. Pérez Ricart. (2023) “The Militarization of Public Security in Mexico: A Subnational Analysis from a State (Local) Police Perspective,” *Alternatives* 0, 0, <DOI:10.1177/03043754231177349>.
- People’s Republic of China, The State Council. (2014, September 9) “The Ministry of Public Security,” ([gov.cn](http://gov.cn)). Available at: [https://english.www.gov.cn/state\\_council/2014/09/09/content\\_281474986284154.htm](https://english.www.gov.cn/state_council/2014/09/09/content_281474986284154.htm) (Accessed 3 May 2023).

- Ray, Julie. (2019, April 25) “Americans’ Stress, Worry and Anger Intensified in 2018,” (*news.gallup.com*). Available at: <https://news.gallup.com/poll/249098/americans-stress-worry-anger-intensified-2018.aspx> (Accessed 9 March 2023).
- Sedra, Mark. (2022) *A People-Centered Approach to Security: Seeking Conceptual Clarity to Guide Policy Development*. New York: UNDP. Available at: <https://www.undp.org/publications/people-centered-approach-security> (Accessed 5 May 2023).
- U.S. Department of Homeland Security, Office of Intelligence and Analysis. (2024) *Homeland Threat Assessment 2024*. Washington, DC: DHS. Available at: [https://www.dhs.gov/sites/default/files/2023-09/23\\_0913\\_ia\\_23-333-ia\\_u\\_homeland-threat-assessment-2024\\_508C\\_V6\\_13Sep23.pdf](https://www.dhs.gov/sites/default/files/2023-09/23_0913_ia_23-333-ia_u_homeland-threat-assessment-2024_508C_V6_13Sep23.pdf) (Accessed 26 September 2023).



This article is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC-BY) license.



Research Paper

## Religion, Law and Development: Studying the Performance of Forty Years of Iran's Legislative System, 1980-2020

Farshad Momeni<sup>1\*</sup>, Seyed Mohsen Alavimanesh<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Corresponding Author: Professor, Faculty of Economics, Allameh Tabataba'i University, Tehran, Iran. Email: [F.Momeni@atu.ac.ir](mailto:F.Momeni@atu.ac.ir)

<sup>2</sup> A PhD Candidate in Economics, Department of Economics, Allameh Tabataba'i University, Tehran, Iran.

### Abstract

A country's level of gross domestic product (GDP) per capita over time had frequently been used as an indicator of economic development. Iran's per capita income in 1977 (shortly before the 1979 revolution) has been higher than its average income earned per person recorded for all the years of the post-revolutionary era thus far. Therefore, a question is raised whether the country's lower level of economic development (as measured by its per capita income) has been a result of the religious nature of the key governing bodies of the Islamic Republic of Iran established on the basis of Article Four of the Constitution. It is crucial to investigate the accuracy of the assertion that these institutions might have indeed contributed to the vicious cycles of underdevelopment of the country in order to find alternative solutions to the slow-down in Iran's economic development process.

The authors attempt to answer the following two research questions: 1. In accordance with Douglas North's chain of belief-institution-transformation, how has Iran's level of national development been influenced by the religious nature of its key political institutions established after the revolution based on Article Four of the Constitution? 2. To what extent have the Guardian Council (*Shorā-ye negahbān*) and the Expediency Discernment Council (*Majma' tashkhis-e maslehat-e nezām*) influenced Iran's economic development in the 1980-2020 period? A careful investigation of this issue is important in order to facilitate the policymakers' better understanding of the underlying causes of the persistent vicious cycles of the country's underdevelopment in the hope of averting a worsening of the

**\*How to Cite:** Momeni, Farshad; and Seyed Mohsen Alavimanesh. (2024, Winter) "Religion, Law and Development: Studying the Performance of Forty Years of Iran's Legislative System, 1980-2020," *Fasl'nāmeḥ-ye siyāsāt (Politics Quarterly)* 53, 4: 791-817, <DOI: 10.22059/JPQ.2024.362924.1008090>.

Manuscript received: 18 August 2023; final revision received: 7 February 2024; accepted: 4 February 2024; published online: 11 March 2024.





situation. Based on the theoretical framework of Douglas North's notion of the belief-institution-economic performance, the authors hypothesize that religious beliefs have had an impact on the enactment of laws and ultimately on economic development in Iran in the 40-year period from 1980 to 2020. Thematic analysis is used to collect and interpret qualitative data pattern on themes in the data set provided by the Guardian Council (GC) Research Institute related to the GC's decisions and opinions on the laws introduced and forwarded by the Islamic Consultative Assembly (*Majles-e shorā-ye eslāmi* or Iran's parliament) since 1980 (i.e., the starting year of the GC's function). The main focus of this paper is on the role of the Guardian Council which is an influential institution—because its members perform the task of screening each legislation concerning its constitutionality—and thus has veto power over legislations introduced by the unicameral parliament (*Majles*). The Expediency Discernment Council (EDC) also has a significant impact on the legislation process by settling disagreements between the Majlis and the GC over laws and deciding which of the two political institutions is right.

The findings revealed that a total of 3339 legislations were screened by the GC during the 40-year period, only 175 legislations (5.24 percent) were disapproved, 12 legislations (0.36 percent) remained ambiguous, and 3152 legislations (94.40%) were finally approved. 171 cases (14.73 percent) had also been referred to the EDC at the request of the Majlis. 175 legislations had been rejected by both the GC and the EDC because they were deemed as non-congruent with Islamic law as emphasized in Article four of the Constitution. Among all the rejected legislations, no important piece of legislation with economic implication was observed, with the exception of the case related to the Financial Action Task Group (FATF). However, the impasse on the FATF legislation as well as the other undecided legislations—particularly on the most challenging foreign policy issues—can be seen as the weaknesses in the political institutions' decision-making processes. Only the accrued cost of the month-long delays caused by the drawn-out process of screening the legislations might be considered a monetary factor with adverse impact on economic performance of the country, but there might be less evident factors which have indirect development implications. Considering the impact of these issues on the country's national interest, it is the duty of the experts to further examine the economic and political implications of these delayed legislations and persuade the policymakers to work towards conflict resolution and reach a consensus.

**Keywords:** Expediency Council, Guardian Council, Iran, the Impact of Religious Beliefs on Economic Development, Law Making

#### **Declaration of conflicting interests**

The authors declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article. They confirm being the contributors of this work and have approved it for publication.

### Funding

The authors received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

### References

- Azimi, Hossein. (1995) *Madār 'hā-ye tose '-nayāftegi dar eghtesād-e Īrān (Circles of Underdevelopment in Iran's Economy)*. Tehran: Ney. [in Persian]
- “Bayānāt-e rahbari dar nokhostin neshast-e andishe'hā-ye rāhbordi (The Leader's Statements at the First Meeting of Strategic Ideas (1 December 2010).” *Office for Preservation and Publishing of the Works of Ayatollah Khamenei (farsi.khamenei.ir)*. Available at: <https://farsi.khamenei.ir/speech-content?id=10664> (Accessed 17 November 2023). [in Persian]
- Becker, Sascha O., et al. (2020) “Religion in Economic History: A Survey,” *ESI Working Paper* 20-22. Available at: [https://digitalcommons.chapman.edu/esi\\_working\\_papers/317](https://digitalcommons.chapman.edu/esi_working_papers/317) (Accessed 20 December 2023).
- Fairahi, Davoud. (2020) *Mafhom-e ghānoon dar Īrān-e mo'āser, tahavolāt-e pishā'mashroteh (The Concept of Law in the Contemporary Iran (The Pre-Constitutional Developments)*. Tehran: Ney. [in Persian]
- Faundez, Julio. (2016, July) "Douglass North's Theory of Institutions: Lessons for Law and Development," *Hague Journal on the Rule of Law* 8: 373-419, <DOI:10.1007/s40803-016-0028-8>.
- Ghasemi, Yarmohammad; and Ali Hashemi. (2020, April) “Anjām-e pajohesh be ravesh-e tahlil-e temātic (Conducting Research by Thematic Analysis: A Practical, Step-by-Step Guide for Learning and Teaching, A Case Study of Music Usage of M.A. Students at Ilam University),” *Farhang-e Ilam (Journal of Ilam Culture)* 20: 64-65: 7-33. Available at: [https://www.farhangeilam.ir/article\\_106790.html?lang=en](https://www.farhangeilam.ir/article_106790.html?lang=en) (Accessed 17 November 2023). [in Persian]
- Gohardani, Farhad; and Zahra Tizro. (2019) *The Political Economy of Iran: Development, Revolution and Political Violence*. London, UK: Palgrave MacMillan.
- Hadi Zenouz, Behroz. (2019) *Tahlil-e tahrīm'hā-ye bein'ol mellali-ye Īrān dar chār'chob-e eghtesād-e siyāsī (An Analysis of International Sanctions of Iran within the Framework of Political Economy, in the Period 1979-2018)*. Tehran: Nashr-e eghtesād-e fardā. [in Persian]
- Hallaq, Wael Bin. (2007) *Tārikh-e teorihā'ye hoghoghi-ye eslāmi (History of Islamic Legal Theories)*, trans. Mohammad Rasekh. Tehran: Ney. [in Persian]
- Imam Jomezadeh, Seyed Javad; and Seyed Qasem Monfared. (2004) “Risheh'hā-ye tārikhi-ye tose '-nayāftegi-ye siyāsī Īrān (tā ghab az enghelāb-e eslāmi) az manzar-e andisheh'garān-e liberal va eslāmi (The Historical Roots of Iran's Political Underdevelopment (Before the Islamic Revolution) from the Perspective of Liberal and Islamic Thinkers),” *Majaleh'i dāneshkadeh'i hoghogh va olom-e siyāsī (The Journal of the Faculty of Law and Political Science)* 65: 35-58. Available at: [https://jflps.ut.ac.ir/article\\_11240.html](https://jflps.ut.ac.ir/article_11240.html) (Accessed 20 December 2023). [in Persian]
- Katouzian, Homayon. (2013) *Īrāniān, dorān-e bāstān tā doreh-ye mo'āser (Iranians, Ancient to the Contemporary Era)*, trans. Hossein Shahidi. Tehran: Markaz. [in Persian]
- Knippenberg, Erwin, et al. (2023) *Iran Poverty Diagnostic- Poverty and Shared Prosperity*. New York: World Development Group. Available at: <https://policycommons.net/artifacts/8189144/iran-poverty-diagnostic/9099561> (Accessed 24 June 2023).

- Kohistaninejad, Masood. (2002) *Chālesh-e mazhab va modernism, sayre andisheh-ye siyāsi-ye mazhabi dar Īrān (The Challenge of Religion and Modernism: The Course of Religious Political Thought in Iran, The Half of the 20th Century)*. Tehran: Ney. [in Persian]
- Kuran, Timur. (2018) *Shekāf-e amigh dar khāvare'miyāneh (The Long Divergence: How Islamic Law Held Back the Middle East)*, trans. Seyed Mehdi Mir Hosseini. Tehran: Mehri. [in Persian]
- Mahdavi, Asghar Agha. (2010) *The Fundamentals of the Role of Time and Space in Inferences of the Religious Precepts from the Perspective of Imam Khomeini (RA) and Martyr Sadr (RA): A Comparative Review*. Tehran: Imam Sadiq (AS) University. [in Persian]
- Momeni, Farshad. (1995) *Elm-e eghtesād va bohrān dar eghtesād-e Īrān (Economics and Crisis in Iranian Economy)*. Tehran: Tarbiat Modares University. [in Persian]
- Naini, Mirza Mohammad Hossein. (2001) *Resāleh-i dar mardom'sālāri-ye dīni va estebdād-e dīni (Alarming the Nation and Purifying the Religion, A Thesis on Religious Democracy and Religious Tyranny)*. Tehran: Amirkabir. [in Arabic]
- Narimani, Meysam; et al. (2012, July) "Estekhrāj-e delālat'hā-ye siyāsati-ye roykard-e tatavori dar hozeh-ye elm va fan'āvāri (Extracting the Political Implications of an Evolutionary Approach in the Field of Science and Technology: A Thematic Analysis)," (*Journal of Science and Technology Policy*) 5, 2: 1-17. Available at [https://jstp.nrisp.ac.ir/article\\_12868.html?lang=en](https://jstp.nrisp.ac.ir/article_12868.html?lang=en) (Accessed 20 December 2023). [in Persian]
- North, Douglas. (1998) *Nahād'hā, taghirāt-e nahādi va amalkard-e eghtesādi (Institutions, Institutional Change and Economic Performance)*, trans. Mohammad Reza Moeini. Tehran: Sāzemān-e barnāmeḥ va bodjeh. [in Persian]
- . (2017) *Fahm-e farāyand-e tahavol-e eghtesādi (Understanding the Process of Economic Change)*, trans Mir Saeed Mohajerani and Zahra Farzizadeh. Tehran: Nahād'garā. [in Persian]
- Payen, Marion; and Patrick Ronde. (2020, April 20) "Culture, Institution and Economic Growth," *Bureau d'Économie Théorique et Appliquée (BETA)*, Université de Strasbourg, France. Available at: <https://beta.u-strasbg.fr/WP/2020/2020-18.pdf> (Accessed 17 November 2023).
- Porter, Michael. (2020) *Farhang va tose' (Culture and Development: The Intertwining of Subjective and Objective Aspects of Collective Life)*, trans. Farshad Momeni and Fariba Momeni. Tehran: nahād'garā. [in Persian]
- Qhochani, Mohammad. (2022) *Trājedi-ye protestānism-e eslāmi (Tragedy of Islamic Protestantism)*. Tehran: Sarāei. [in Persian]
- "Sāmāneh-ye jāme'nazarāt-e shorā-ye negahbān (The Comprehensive Website of Guardian Council's Opinions)," (2023) *The Constitutional Council (nazarat.shora-rc.ir)*. Available at: <http://nazarat.shora-rc.ir> (Accessed 24 June 2023). [in Persian]
- Shojaei Divkalai, Seyed Hasan. (2018) *Tose'-nayāftegi va sanati'sāzi dar Īrān-e ahd-e Qājār va Pahlavi-ye avval (Underdevelopment and Industrialization in Iran in the Qajar and the First Pahlavi Era)*. Tehran: Tisa. [in Persian]
- Tabrizi, Mirza Yousuf Khan (Moshir'oldoleh). (2021) *Yek kalameh (A Word)*. Tehran: Andisheh-ye Idā. [in Persian]
- Tayebi Abolhasani, Seyyed Amir Hossein. (2019, September) "Dar'amadi bar ravesh-e tahghigh (Introduction to Research Method: Standard Procedures for Qualitative Data Analysis)," *Science and Technology Policy Letters* 9, 2: 67-96. Available at: [https://stpl.ristip.sharif.ir/article\\_21535.html?lang=en](https://stpl.ristip.sharif.ir/article_21535.html?lang=en) (Accessed 24 June 2023). [in Persian]

- United Nations Development Program (UNDP). (2022) *Human Development Report 2021/2022*. New York: United Nations Development Program. Available at: [https://hdr.undp.org/system/files/documents/global-report-document/hdr2021-22pdf\\_1.pdf](https://hdr.undp.org/system/files/documents/global-report-document/hdr2021-22pdf_1.pdf) (Accessed 24 June 2023).
- Weber, Max. (2017) *Akhlāgh-e protestāni var roh-e sarmāyeh 'dāri (The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism)*, trans. Parisa Manochehri and Abdol Karim Rashidian. Tehran: Elmi va farhangi. [in Persian]
- World Bank. (2023) *World Bank Data*. Available at: <https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/NY.GNP.PCAP.KN?locations=IR&view=chart> (Accessed 24 June 2023).
- . (2017) *World Development Report 2017: Governance and The Law*. Washington, DC: World Bank. Available at: <https://www.worldbank.org/en/publication/wdr2017> (Accessed 20 December 2023).
- Zouache, Abdallah. (2016, October 26) "Islam, Institutions, Development, and the Mistakes of Orientalist Economics," *Centre de Recherches Sociologiques et Politiques de Paris (CRESPPA) Research Paper*, 61-68. Available at: [https://economix.fr/uploads/source/doc/seminaires/musulman/PapZou\\_Nanterre.pdf](https://economix.fr/uploads/source/doc/seminaires/musulman/PapZou_Nanterre.pdf) (Accessed 24 June 2023).



This article is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC-BY) license.



Research Paper

## The Concept of Legitimacy and Its Place in the Debate between Schmitt, Löwith and Blumenberg on Modernity

Ali Ashraf Nazari<sup>1\*</sup>, Seyed Masoud Azarfam<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Corresponding Author: Associate Professor, Faculty of Law & Political Science, University of Tehran, Tehran, Iran. Email: [aashraf@ut.ac.ir](mailto:aashraf@ut.ac.ir)

<sup>2</sup> PhD in Political Science, Faculty of Law & Political Science, University of Tehran, Iran. Email: [m.azarfam@ut.ac.ir](mailto:m.azarfam@ut.ac.ir)

### Abstract

The concept of crisis is rooted in German intellectual tradition, and has a long history that can be traced back to the reactions of Romantic thinkers to the philosophical ideas of Immanuel Kant. This enduring concept—as a byproduct of Kantian philosophy and Romanticism—persisted throughout the 19th century and reached its zenith in the early 20th century, and coincided with the burgeoning modernity and modernism. Carl Schmitt and Karl Löwith were the two prominent advocates of the idea of crisis during the 20th century, and presented a criticism of the fundamental principles of modernity and questioned its legitimacy by using the secularization thesis as their primary interpretive tool. The main objective of this essay is to reconstruct the debate between Carl Schmitt, Karl Löwith, and Hans Blumenberg on the legitimacy of the modern age and present an argument in its defense as Blumenberg might have done.

The Romantic scholars' reaction to Kant, which underlies much of the concept of crisis, was shaped by their dissatisfaction with what they perceived as Kant's overly rationalistic philosophy. Romantics championed a worldview that emphasized emotion, nature, and the sublime, which they saw as neglected by Kant's emphasis on reason. This led to a period of intellectual crisis that lingered and evolved as the result of subsequent philosophical developments and social changes. Schmitt and Löwith in their unique ways viewed the advent of modernity as a crisis. Schmitt as a political theorist and jurist saw the crisis in the transition from the traditional

---

**\*How to Cite:** Nazari, Ali Ashraf; and Seyed Masoud Azarfam. (2024, Winter) "The Concept of Legitimacy and Its Place in the Debate between Schmitt, Löwith and Blumenberg on Modernity," *Fasl' nāmeḥ-ye siyāsāt (Politics Quarterly)* 53, 4: 819-838, <DOI: 10.22059/JPQ.2024.289279.1007497>.

Manuscript received: 19 September 2019; final revision received: 3 February 2024; accepted: 11 March 2024; published online: 12 March 2024.



forms of governance and social organization to the modern liberal democratic rule. For Schmitt, the essence of this crisis lay in the perceived loss of political unity and authority, which he saw as being undermined by the pluralism and individualism of modern democratic societies.

This essay will follow the intellectual journey of these three thinkers, shedding light on their debates about the legitimacy of the modern period, and will present a defense of Blumenberg's interpretation, arguing that the secularization thesis and the associated concept of crisis rely on a form of historical substantialism. This substantialism, which views historical periods as homogenous entities with essential characteristics is problematic. It oversimplifies the complex historical processes involved in the transition to modernity and neglects the heterogeneity and dynamism within each historical period. In conclusion, the authors will argue that the defense of the modern age, as Blumenberg elaborates, is not only possible but necessary. It will challenge the foundational assumptions of Schmitt and Löwith's critiques, arguing for a more nuanced understanding of modernity that acknowledges its complexity and dynamism and recognizes its unique legitimacy. This defense will proceed on the thesis that Schmitt and Löwith's discussion, which explains modernity according to the secularization thesis, involves a kind of historical substantialism which is apparently unjustifiable.

**Keywords:** Crisis, Eschatology, Legitimacy, Modernity, Political Theology, Secularization

#### **Declaration of conflicting interests**

The authors declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article. They confirm being the contributors of this work and have approved it for publication.

#### **Funding**

The authors received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

#### **References**

- Ankersmit, Frank. (1994) *History and Tropology: The Rise and Fall of Metaphor*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.
- Aristotle, (2014), *Metaphysics*, trans. Sharaf-E-din Khorasani, Tehran: Hekmat. [in Persian]
- Beiser, Frederick. (2011) *The German Historicist Tradition*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.
- Blumenberg, Hans. (1985) *The Legitimacy of the Modern Age*. Cambridge, MA: the MIT Press.
- . (1987) *The Genesis of the Copernican World*. Cambridge, MA: the MIT Press.
- . (2017) *Writings on Literature 1945-1958 (Schriften zur Literatur 1945-1958)*, eds. Alexander Schmitz and Bernd Stiegler. Berlin: Suhrkamp Verlag AG. [in German]

- Braspenning, Sven; and Fernand Tanghe. (2009) *Rethinking Secularization: Philosophy and the Prophecy of a Secular Age*. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
- Brient, Elizabeth. (2002) *The Immanence of the Infinite: Hans Blumenberg and the Threshold to Modernity*. Washington, DC: The Catholic University of America Press.
- Flusch, Kurt. (2017) *Hans Blumenberg: Philosoph in Deutschland: Die Jahre 1945 Bis 1966*. Frankfurt: Verlag Vittorio Klostermann.
- Gadamer, Hans George. (1975) *Wahrheit und Methode*. Tübingen: Mohr Verlag.
- Habermas, Jürgen. (1987) *The Philosophical Discourse of Modernity*. Oxford: Polity Press.
- Löwith, Karl. (1949) *Meaning in History*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.
- . (2007) *Mein Leben in Deutschland vor und nach 1933: Ein Bericht*. Stuttgart: J.B. Metzler. [in German]
- Meier, Heinrich. (1998) *The Lesson of Carl Schmitt*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.
- Plantinga, Alvin. (1993) *God, Freedom, and Evil*. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans. Available at: <https://static1.squarespace.com/static/58f36d7c1e5b6cb8c0d88151/t/5b819b372b6a282494d6a96e> (Accessed 24 July 2023).
- Schmitt, Carl. (1985) *Political Theology*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.
- . (1996) *The Concept of The Political*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.
- . (2008) *Politische Theologie II*. Berlin: Duncker & Humblot.
- Tabatabaie, J. (2013), *Ibn Khaldun and Social Sciences*, Tehran: Sales. [in Persian]
- Taylor, Charles. (2007) *A Secular Age*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.



This article is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC-BY) license.